DESIGN GUIDELINES FOR MULTICULTURAL URBAN PLANNING AND COMMUNITY BUILDING

A Toolkit for Successful Community Building in a City with Diverse Ethnic Culture

Master Thesis

Master of Science M.Sc.

Presented by

JuYoung Kim

Supervisors

Prof. Dr. Caroline Günther

Prof. Dr.-Ing. Michael Peterek

Frankfurt University of Applied Sciences

Faculty 1: Architecture • Civil Engineering • Geomatics

Master Programme "Urban Agglomerations"

Frankfurt am Main

Submitted on 31.08.2023

DESIGN GUIDELINES FOR MULTICULTURAL URBAN PLANNING AND COMMUNITY BUILDING

A Toolkit for Successful Community Building in a City with Diverse Ethnic Culture

A thesis presented to the

Frankfurt University of Applied Sciences

in fulfillment of the thesis requirement for the degree of

MSc. Urban Agglomerations

Frankfurt, Germany August 31, 2023

By **JuYoung Kim**

ABSTRACT

Problem, research strategy, and findings: This thesis delves into the impacts of multiculturalism and cultural diversity on urban planning. As global urbanization surges, cities are evolving into hubs of diverse cultures, ethnicities, and traditions. This phenomenon presents both benefits and challenges. This study seeks to answer the question: "What are the planning principles and design aspects that promote social cohesion and enhance culturally expanding and diverse cities to be inclusive?" Key principles for multicultural planning are determined: emphasizing inclusive governance, integration through services and programs, active public participation, intercultural spaces, and ethnic economy and workplace diversity. The case study cities Toronto, London, and Singapore are analyzed considering their demographic compositions, political structures, and urban layouts. While challenges persist, successful programs like language assistance, integration through arts and sports, and housing policies have emerged. The economic landscape reveals challenges such as pay gaps among ethnic groups and positive trends that are observed in cities like London, where younger generations of migrants are entering higher-paying professions, suggesting upward mobility.

Takeaway for practice: The thesis culminates in a comprehensive design guideline derived from study insights. This guideline offers practical tools for planners, policymakers, and officials to design cities that accommodate and celebrate cultural diversity. However, challenges exist, including understanding the intricate interplay of sociology and urban planning, data accuracy, and capturing the full impact of community-based projects. Ultimately, successful multicultural urban planning requires inclusive governance, integration initiatives, active public participation, intercultural spaces, and attention to workplace diversity. Political support and leadership are vital, as is ensuring equitable representation in government departments. The findings of this research underscore the significance of understanding the dynamics of multicultural urban planning in creating inclusive and harmonious cities.

Keywords: *multiculturalism, interculturalism, urban planning, cultural diversity, ethnicity, social cohesion*

TABLE OF CONTENTS

TABLE OF FIGURES

CHAPTER 1.   INTRODUCTION

1.1. BACKGROUND

In the contemporary global landscape, urbanization has witnessed a substantial surge with metropolises expanding in both size and population. The World Urbanization Prospect report projects that urban areas will accommodate 68 % of the world's population by 2050, a significant increase from 30 % in 1950 (United Nations, 2019, p. 1). This urbanization trend is intrinsically intertwined with the forces of globalization, where cities are growing due to natural increase, migration, and reclassification (United Nations, 2019). This urban growth, particularly pronounced in metropolitan and major cities, creates microcosms of global diversity within these urban centers. This phenomenon is not limited to a single cultural identity; rather, it encapsulates a spectrum of cultures, ethnicities, and traditions. For instance, London is a prime example of this multicultural mosaic, with over 300 languages spoken and a population where merely 59.8 % identify as white British (Wood et al., 2006, p.1). The amalgamation of multiple cultures and histories in such urban hubs results in the evolution of a multicultural society, fostering an environment where diverse communities coexist, learn from each other, and contribute distinct attributes.

While the narrative of multiculturalism brings both advantages and challenges, its implementation is intricate. Instances like the Black Lives Matter movement underscore the tensions that can arise from cultural diversity, leading to riots and social unrest. In the UK, the proportion of black and minority ethnic (BME) workers in insecure work increased by around 5% in a single year (from 12.2% to 17.8%) between 2021 and 2022 (Middleton, 2023, para. 2). This type of insecure work includes low-paid, unstable, and variable hours, such as seasonal and contract-based work. This increase is significantly higher than the marginal increase of 0.3% observed among their white working counterparts (from 10.5% to 10.8%) (Middleton, 2023, para. 2). Challenges stem from issues like immigrant integration and the potential for cultural conflicts.

Nonetheless, multiculturalism offers notable advantages, including a diverse workforce that enhances efficiency and innovation through a range of perspectives. Vertovec (2016) introduced the term "super-diversity" for cities with multiple generations of migrants. He emphasized that multiculturalism extends beyond a binary view of one culture versus another, acknowledging the uniqueness of individuals within each cultural group. Super-diversity encompasses the intersections of factors such as nationality, ethnicity, language, religion, age, gender, legal status, class, and human capital. Cities adapt to combine cultural practices and share social identities and spaces, fostering a cohesive environment. This results in a society of multiculturalism that encourages learning from different cultures and intermingling, avoiding the assimilation of minority cultures into a dominant one. Concerns about losing the original identity and history of a city through excessive immersion are present, but in highly diverse cities, this diversity becomes a distinctive and defining characteristic.

Planning approaches for addressing multiculturalism vary across periods and countries. In the 1970s, developed countries noticed the influx of immigrants and diversity in their cities. The reasons for immigrants varied, from additional workforce recruitment to colonial settlers, refugees, or asylum seekers. This called for action from countries and cities to develop government policies for diverse races and ethnicities in the country: Canada's Multiculturalism Act of 1971, Australia's Racial Discrimination Act of 1975, the United Kingdom's Race Relations Act of 1976, and Amsterdam's Minorities Policy of 1979 (Fincher et al., 2014).

The diversity of planning methods reflects the uniqueness of each urban context (Commission on Race and Ethnic Disparities, 2021). Rutten (2020, para. 4) reaffirmed the importance of addressing ethnic diversity by noting that a "colour-blind approach to planning policy and practice institutionalizes indirect discrimination in planning". The responsibility of city planners and leaders is to design cities that facilitate natural interactions and integration among diverse cultures. Initiatives like community gardens shared public spaces, and language-sharing sessions play a pivotal role in fostering cross-cultural interactions.

Despite the embrace of interculturalism, a notable limitation is the absence of a comprehensive political or empirical framework for implementing effective policies (Zapata-Barrero, 2015a). Issues such as segregation, lack of community, racism, and discrimination often emerge due to cultural diversity's complexities. In response, city planners are tasked with designing urban spaces that facilitate the organic blending of cultures, eliminating barriers that impede integration. Initiatives like communal sports centers, language classes, and community markets have demonstrated their effectiveness in this regard (Feinberg et al., 2021).

1.2. PROBLEM

Globalization fosters the merging of diverse cultures and religions within the same geographical areas. The increasing complexity of today's multicultural society poses challenges to urban planning, particularly when cities are reactive rather than proactive in adapting to these changes (Zhuang, 2013). As the global demand for multicultural cities continues to rise, the development of comprehensive guidelines for integrated urban infrastructure and services becomes imperative.

An often overlooked aspect in the realm of diversity policies is the concept of interculturalism, which emphasizes meaningful interactions between individuals from various backgrounds, including both immigrants and established citizens (Zapata-Barrero, 2015a). Achieving this requires a critical examination of modern urban planning practices, especially concerning the complex issues that arise from cultural diversity such as segregation, the absence of community bonds, racism, and discrimination.

In today's society, the challenges facing multicultural urban planning are multifaceted. One fundamental challenge revolves around the intricate nature of multiculturalism itself. The amalgamation of cultures, languages, and traditions within the urban fabric creates a dynamic environment that is inherently complex and often defies one-size-fits-all solutions (Zhuang, 2013). Additionally, the absence of empirical data further complicates the effective implementation of best practices (Fincher et al., 2014; Kurtz, 2014; Zhuang, 2013). This gap in data often leaves cities relying on practitioners' subjective assessments on a case-by-case basis, which can lead to inconsistent and suboptimal outcomes.

Urban planning, a multidimensional field that shapes both the physical and socio-economic landscapes of cities, becomes even more intricate when viewed through the lens of multiculturalism. The process involves not only considering the traditional pillars of sustainability—economic, social, and environmental aspects—but also integrating elements of sociology, political dynamics, economic disparities, and societal norms. The complexity of multicultural urban planning is underscored by the historical lack of data that comprehensively assesses the impact of immigrants and the potential for cultural segregation and gaps among different ethnic groups. As highlighted by Zapata-Barrero (2015), there is a lack of political theories on multiculturalism that can guide effective policy-making. This gap in understanding led to limited ethnic diversity awareness and actionable urban planning strategies.

Many decision-makers, city officials and urban planners are often left to their intuitive manners when there is a lack of a comprehensive theoretical framework to guide policy implementation on multiculturalism. This can lead to a circular tail chase when the decision makers are homogenous and the urban planning practices are based on the traditional methods of prioritizing land use over people who are occupying the space (Zapata-Barrero, 2015a; Zhuang, 2013).

While some cases might be accommodated on a case-by-case basis, this subjective approach can lead to inconsistency and inequity in urban development. On a local level, community-driven initiatives play a pivotal role in promoting cultural inclusion and community development. Examples include the establishment of parks or sports centers, market halls for flea markets or fresh food markets, and community centers to facilitate language and skill-sharing (Feinberg et al., 2021). However, the challenge of fostering integration becomes more pronounced on a larger scale, where high-density ethnic communities can inadvertently lead to ethnic enclaves and economies.

As cities strive to prepare their infrastructure and services for seamless integration, the current reactive approach needs to shift toward proactive planning. The development and implementation of guidelines can help cities anticipate and address the demands of multiculturalism. In essence, the goal is to create urban environments that not only tolerate but embrace cultural diversity, fostering interactions that yield synergy from differences.

In summary, an increase in urban living accompanied by multiculturalism presents both opportunities and challenges. Understanding the dynamics and sensitivities of multicultural urban planning is crucial to creating inclusive and harmonious cities. The journey to effective multicultural urban planning necessitates comprehending the nuances of various policies, urban processes, and their intersections with ethnic understandings. Through interdisciplinary research and case studies, this paper seeks to establish guidelines for shaping vibrant and cohesive multicultural urban environments.

1.3. RESEARCH QUESTION

In the realm of urban planning, addressing the challenges of multiculturalism has become an imperative in today's diverse societies. As urban areas experience an influx of cultures and backgrounds, the complexity of fostering integration while celebrating diversity has become increasingly apparent. The question is asked as planners to respond to the changing society. This thesis will be guided by the following research question:

"What are the planning principles and design aspects that promote social cohesion and enhance culturally expanding and diverse cities to be inclusive?"

This question encapsulates the core concern of this thesis, aiming to uncover practical insights that can guide urban planners, policymakers, and stakeholders. To answer the main question, the following sub-questions will be explored to answer the main research question:

- Should ethnic culture and diversity be considered for urban planning?
- What are the design principles and characteristics to enhance neighbourhood cohesion and improve the quality of living that could also enhance the integration of people from various backgrounds?
- Are there any guidelines and standards that address cultural inclusions for city and community planning?

- What are the multicultural characteristics and generational sensitivities associated with daily lives that need to be understood and designed/planned by city planners?
- How can the government structure and governance style help implement multiculturalism?
- Which cities have implemented multicultural planning and what are the examples?
- Who are the projects that cater to multiculturalism completed by? Who are the key players in decision-making?

1.4. METHODOLOGY

The initial step is to review existing planning practices for multicultural cities, identify commonalities and disparities, and determine the recurring elements. These elements are the building blocks of the theoretical framework. The goal of this research is to uncover the guiding principles and design elements that effectively respond to the needs of diverse ethnic groups within urban settings. By delving into the societal and political factors surrounding these cases and understanding the government's responses, valuable insights are gained. This process will also highlight the differences between these successful cases, offering a nuanced understanding of which types of interventions are likely to work best in specific situations. By analyzing both the positive and negative aspects of these cases, urban planners can extract valuable lessons that inform the creation of more holistic and effective strategies.

The review is focused on English literature from developed nations, specifically examining cities with high immigration rates and recognized multiculturalism. It is understood that the impact and the experiences of immigrants in large urban cities versus small remote villages vary largely. As mentioned with the super-diversity, multiculturalism is a complex topic, more so for metropolis cities. This review of best practices is the foundational base to discuss the future planning outcomes to pursue in the context of multiculturalism within cities. The identified elements and themes will be the analytical framework to analyze three study cases, Toronto, London, and Singapore. The ultimate goal is to develop comprehensive guidelines for effective multicultural urban planning. The methodology involves a comprehensive literature review spanning disciplines like urban planning, geography, sociology, and political economy.

The chosen case study cities are Toronto, Canada; London, United Kingdom; and Singapore. Major global cities with ethnically and racially diverse populations have been selected as case studies to understand multiculturalism's contextual nuances and the planning approaches adopted. The diverse historical trajectories of different nations contribute to their unique views on multiculturalism, thereby influencing planning strategies. The selections are based on their substantial immigrant percentages and urban scale as the population in these cities exceeded 5 million as of 2020 and hold pivotal roles in economic, political, and cultural spheres. The total immigrant index, a measure encompassing factors like foreign-born residents, stands at 1.92 for Toronto and 1.28 for London, ranking them 2nd and 5th, respectively (Benton-Short, Price, & Friedman, 2004, p. 25). This index, developed by Benton-Short et al. (2005) considers key immigration-related metrics. One city was chosen from each of the three continents, North America, Europe, and Asia, to facilitate a comparative exploration of policy frameworks. Despite the distinct historical differences and external and internal political influences, these cities share sufficient similarities to establish a meaningful baseline for comparison.

The type of literature review will include scholarly texts and books focusing on multiculturalism in urban settings. The literature may be focused on racism and socio-economic segregation to understand the potential problems that come with multiculturalism. The sociology factor is important for this theme as

it understands the dynamics and patterns of human behaviour and social norms. Also included are the impact of social factors such as inequality, culture, and social change. This outlines the impact on the city and more information can be collected from news articles, documentaries and videos with direct interviews and conversations with the residents. The statistics and government press releases are valuable sources of quantifiable data and act as indications of the political direction. Government documents should be reviewed with caution as they may be partisan.

1.5.   STRUCTURE OF THE THESIS

This thesis is organized into several sections to systematically explore and analyze the complexities of multicultural urban planning and its implications. The following outline provides an overview of the structure of this thesis:

Chapter 1 is the Introduction that begins with the topic background outlining its significance in building the contextual framework for this thesis. The research question is introduced and the methodology to answer the question is included in Chapter 1.

Chapter 2 Literature Review & Current Practices is the literature review and an examination is conducted on the role of multicultural planning indices in evaluating the urban preparedness in diverse cities. The first section, ESTABLISHING is to set the foundation of an urban planning principle that is focused on, which is on human scale designing. Then, the BUILDING section is a review of indices for multicultural planning to identify recurring elements in the literature that are used as guiding principles for an in-depth review of effective practices. Lastly, the DETAILING section strengthens the key framework through additional literature and examples. A thorough exploration of multicultural planning strategies is undertaken, focusing on developed countries' experiences.

Chapter 3 Case Studies delves into the selected case study cities: Toronto, Canada; London, United Kingdom; and Singapore. Using the framework created in Chapter 2, the details of the three cities are analyzed. The commonalities and differences in their historical background, political approaches, geographical landscape and economic development regarding diversity are interpreted and discussed.

Chapter 4, the Design Guidelines for Multicultural Planning is proposed based on the insights gathered. These guidelines are intended to provide a practical framework for effective multicultural urban planning, taking into account the complexities and nuances identified in the research.

Chapter 5 is the concluding chapter, re-capitulating the main findings and lessons learned from the research. Reflections on the broader implications of the research for both theoretical understanding and practical applications are discussed. Furthermore, potential avenues for future research within the realm of multicultural urban planning are identified, aiming to further advance the field's understanding and practice.

Each chapter within the thesis contributes to the holistic exploration of multicultural urban planning, from its theoretical foundations to practical implications, and offers a comprehensive framework for understanding the complexities of planning in diverse urban contexts.

CHAPTER 2. LITERATURE REVIEW & CURRENT PRACTICES

This chapter is an extensive analysis of the role of multicultural planning indices in evaluating urban readiness within diverse cities. The chapter begins by laying the groundwork through the fundamental urban planning principle centred around human-scale design. Followed by evaluating indices for multicultural planning and identifying common elements in the literature that serve as guiding principles. Furthermore, the core framework is strengthened using additional literature insights and examples. Within this chapter, a comprehensive overview of multicultural planning strategies unfolds, highlighting the experiences of developed countries. This literature review not only provides an understanding of current practices but also sets the stage for the subsequent chapters' in-depth analysis.

2.1. ESTABLISHING: URBAN PLANNING PRINCIPLES ON A HUMAN-SCALE

The foundation of people-centric design rather than buildings and land is established through a review of literature from three authors. Both Jan Gehl's (2013) "Cities for People" and Jane Jacobs' (1961) "The Death and Life of Great American Cities" advocate for people-centred design. David Sim's (2019) "Soft Cities" explores the concept of "softness" in urban design and its potential to create more livable, resilient, and inclusive cities. On a local scale and neighbourhood level, the key characteristics include human-scaled infrastructure, mixed usage, and places for human interaction. A well-thought-out city includes efficient public transportation and available public space for people to live and move around. Interaction between people fosters a sense of community which brings life to the city. It is part of urban planners' jobs to create space to bring people together such as parks or utilize the space in between buildings. Gehl and Jacobs also emphasize the importance of pedestrian life. On the human-scale level, sidewalks, attractive public spaces and storefronts become active ground for interactions. Additionally, this addresses the hierarchies of urban planning and focuses on humans first then cars last, setting the foundation for safety.

An exemplary public space that aligns with the values aforementioned and is designed while putting people in the centre is the Asia Culture Centre (ACC) in Gwangju, South Korea (셜록현준 (Sherlock Hyun Joon), 2023). The ACC will be used as an example to walk through the key characteristics described by Gehl, Jacobs and Sim. With a historical significance, the design of the space is focused on the people's experience and their connection to the place. The place is bustling with people going to and from subway stations, leading to the sunken plaza with essential facilities and open space for people to sit and visit. The place is also connected to several public facilities like the children's museum, Asian Artplex, and an open green space as shown in Figure 1.

FIGURE 1: OVERVIEW OF THE GWANGJU ASIAN CULTURE CENTRE (CREDIT: SCREENSHOT FROM 셜록현준 (SHERLOCK HYUN JOON), 2023)

Mixed-used neighbourhoods and development create a lively area where multiple types of actions are occurring so that people live, work and play in the same area. It also encourages less car use by locating daily essential uses within walking or biking distances. Mixed-used comes with complexity and embracing the complexity and diversity of cities is to recognize that urban environments are multifaceted and dynamic. Sim encourages designers and planners to work with existing conditions and adapt to the unique qualities and needs of each place.

It is important to keep in mind to encourage revitalizing and reusing the space already built instead of building a new platform and space. Small steps to preserve the space available enable the existing residents to appreciate and make the space their own. Revitalization of the space also highlights the importance of adaptability. A city is always changing based on the demographics of those within and their needs. Over time, how the city is used and where people are working are changing with a primary example of the COVID-19 outbreak and the change in lifestyle patterns. Therefore, the adaptability and flexibility of a city are important to stay relevant and abandonment should not be an option.

Reflecting these characteristics on the ACC example, various aspects of the ACC area show that the architect adapted the design to the surrounding space. Certain buildings in the plaza are built below the ground level, and light boxes are incorporated so that lower floors can receive natural lighting as shown in Figure 2. The open space is organized with flexibility so that the space can be attractive for both indoor and outdoor events and programs. Additionally, its proximity to the main street is close however with the curvatures and buildings, quietness is also available in the public spaces.

a) Light boxes above the building

c) view of the light box from inside of the building

b) Light boex as light installation at night

FIGURE 2: FOCUS OF THE LIGHT FOREST IN THE ACC CENTRE (CREDIT: SCREENSHOT FROM 셜록현준 (SHERLOCK HYUN JOON), 2023)

Sim (2019) highlights that a city is created with social connections. He signifies social connectivity and the creation of spaces that facilitate social interaction, collaboration, and a sense of belonging. Sim encourages the design of public spaces and infrastructure that bring people together and strengthen social ties. With more interactions and resident contribution, each neighbourhood or area is created with its own identity. Sim emphasizes the importance of creating unique, memorable places that foster a sense of identity and attachment for residents. He advocates for placemaking efforts that celebrate local culture, history, and community values. Creating a safe space to voice your opinions and create connections, community engagement and the involvement of local residents shapes the future of their neighbourhoods. The local knowledge and the active participation of communities help in decision-making processes.

In Sim's perspective (2019), a city's essence lies in its social fabric. He underscores the significance of social connectivity and the design of spaces that facilitate social interactions, collaboration, and a shared sense of belonging. Sim advocates for public spaces and infrastructure that unite people, reinforcing social bonds and yielding unique neighbourhood identities. Central to his view is the creation of distinct, memorable places that nurture a sense of identity and affinity among residents. He champions placemaking endeavours that exalt local culture, history, and community ethos. By establishing secure havens for expressing opinions and forging connections, community engagement, and local resident involvement steer the trajectory of neighbourhoods. This active community participation and local wisdom significantly influence decision-making processes.

The essence of public space is that it should be for anyone who chooses to visit. With the wide variety of spaces and environments, ACC has appropriate space for everyone. Also, every time that they visit, each space has its unique characteristics and spatial features that suit the need and the purpose. The space

has numerous pathways to reach different parts of ACC and this provides a different experience every visit. The experience one faces are different every time and those memories are what keeps bringing people back to those spaces. The revisit rate is higher than the space, building, and purposes align in unison. The designer understood that a well-designed space is where there is a high revisitation rate.

With the common goal of creating people-friendly cities, urban design principles prioritize the needs, experiences, and well-being of people within the urban environment. The key factors gathered from the three authors summarized are human-scale design, pedestrianization, the importance of public spaces, mixed-use neighbourhoods, sidewalk life, community engagement, adaptability, placemaking, and social connectivity. These factors are applied the same for multicultural planning, if not amplified to increase interaction.

2.2.   BUILDING: MULTICULTURAL URBAN PLANNING PRINCIPLES

Within this chapter, key terminologies essential to this paper are explained in detail and their contextual usage is established. It lays the groundwork by examining the indexes and indicators employed to evaluate the extent of multiculturalism in urban planning, drawing crucial insights that will shape the subsequent framework delineating the elements integral to multicultural planning practices.

2.2.1.   KEY TERMINOLOGIES

CULTURE AND DIVERSITY

The definition of culture in the context of diversity and multicultural planning refers to ethnic groups. Qadeer and Agrawal (2011, p. 139) defined the term culture as "made up of a web of norms, values, beliefs, behaviours, symbols, customs, and attitudes that serve as a map for the ways of life of a group. In further detail, the culture that is reviewed is in the "subculture such as ethnic communities and religious … embedded in the mosaic making up a national or societal culture (Qadeer & Agrawal, 2011, p.139). Here, religion is a large part of a culture and influences one's culture however, religion is not the focus point within the context of this paper. On a smaller scale, culture can also be defined by families. In some cases, culture can refer to groups of immigrants. The term immigrant is "to capture a diverse group of foreign-born people, including naturalized citizens, permanent residents, refugees, asylees, twilight status (Harwood, 2022, p.413)." Immigrants, foreigners, and expats are all considered people who are living in a different country in which they were not born or raised.

Culture can be defined for the group however the individual preferences come from cultural differences and racial identities. Historically, social differences stemmed from class, race, and ethnicity however, recently larger variation of diversity exists, creating social cross-sectional identities (Qadeer & Agrawal, 2011).

Diversity in terms of urban planning includes aspects of social, biological, economic and organizational factors. For this study, diversity refers to cultural and ethnic diversity. Cultural diversity includes cultural, racial or ethnical differences of groups of variants of class, race, ethnicity, language, religion, and traditions. (Qadeer & Agrawal, 2011). Cultural diversity particularly in urban planning acknowledges the importance of understanding and valuing the unique perspectives, needs, and aspirations of different cultural groups. The recognition of diversity is to build "public policies, programs and services and equal access to the planning decision-making processes (Qadeer & Agrawal, 2011, p.135)."

MULTICULTURALISM VS INTERCULTURALISM

A term that is used interchangeably with cultural diversity is multiculturalism. With the rise or interest in multiculturalism and diversity, a recent use of interculturalism has started. While the two terms, multiculturalism and interculturalism, integrate cultural diversity in a society, the Council of Europe and Isar distinguishes between the two terms with varying emphasis on cultural differences and methods for integration (Council of Europe, 2020a; Isar, 2006).

It is important to note that in some of the literature, interculturalism is defined and distinguished, which tend to be European documents, whereas some literature use the term multiculturalism as an overarching term to describe diverse race, ethnic and religions, and to integrate all differences into one community without losing the importance and uniqueness of each culture.

According to ICC (Bathily, 2021), multiculturalism highlights cultural differences and for each culture to be equal and to live side by side. The notion of multiculturalism has allowed assimilation to be avoided regardless of the size and dominance of the culture, for each culture to maintain its culture. Interculturalism emphasizes the uniqueness of each culture and heritage and facilitates the similarities on how they intersect and can enhance one another. The idea of interculturalism promotes positive interactions between different groups based on their commonalities to lead to cohesion and to break the barrier between them. As a result, it leads to a more cohesive community as the success of interculturalism is driven by interactions and strengthening the relationships between people with different backgrounds (Bathily, 2021). In another case, according to Sandercock (2009), the primary goal of her case study on neighbourhood housing in the City of Vancouver was to create a community rather than focusing on the particular cultures within. This would be considered intercultural as each culture is not emphasized. An intercultural approach is when there is no particular subculture affiliation or accommodation.

How these two terms are used is different depending on the specific context and social goals. Certain cities or countries may view the two terminologies the same and adapt features from both ideologies for varying aspects. Such as that both multiculturalism and interculturalism are to manage and integrate diverse cultures and promote social harmony.

2.2.2. KEY CHALLENGES AND OBSTACLES TO IMPLEMENTATION

Before delving into the principles of multicultural planning, it's important to address the challenges that arise when integrating interculturalism and cultural diversity. Despite the acknowledged benefits, these challenges stem from social factors and barriers. Notable among these challenges are social segregation, discrimination, class disparities among immigrants, and ambiguities surrounding the roles of urban planners and policymakers. Understanding these challenges is crucial as they will inform the elements to be updated in the planning process.

Historically, in homogenous communities, social segregation may arise, hindering the integration of cultural diversity in urban planning. Concentrations of certain ethnic or cultural groups in specific neighbourhoods perpetuate isolation and limit intercultural interactions. When safe spaces for people to interact and learn from each other are absent, individuals tend to stick to what they know, fearing expansion. "Most larger cities are passively tolerant of outsiders. People live side by side. They are not actively promoting engagement with the 'other' and crossing boundaries (Wood et al., 2006b, p.62)." Physical segregation can also occur due to gentrification during urban development, displacing lower-income and minority communities, and posing a challenge for intercultural urban planning.

Racism and discrimination pose significant challenges when introducing new cultures without education. Deep-rooted prejudices and discriminatory attitudes towards certain cultural or ethnic groups hinder their participation in urban planning processes. Addressing biases is essential for inclusive and equitable planning. Cultural differences can lead to conflicts and misunderstandings, necessitating urban planning to navigate these complexities for cohesive neighbourhoods. Building a common ground that reflects diverse groups' interests while sustaining cultural differences privately is a challenge in multiculturalism.

Classism among different immigrant groups can contribute to challenges within the city. Immigration purposes and places of origin influence interactions among residents. For instance, certain communities will be more welcomed and find it easier to integrate with the majority culture compared to other groups. A study completed in Ireland by its local Family Resource Centre (FRC) showed that some residents did not see the Polish community as unwelcoming but made negative comments relating to African residents (Ó Hadhmaill & Dorrity, 2012).

Urban planners and policymakers may lack intercultural competence, hindering effective responses to diverse community needs. Their underdefined roles can lead to challenges in policymaking, inclusive public space and infrastructure design, and supporting fair representation in decision-making positions. Proper planning guidelines addressing diversity are often lacking. Zhuang (2013, p.95) stated that multicultural planning is "a strategy that recognizes pluralistic interests as well as advances general planning goals for the society at large. However, concrete examples of "reasonable strategy" were not offered". The commitment of political leaders and policymakers to prioritize interculturalism and diversity is crucial for the successful implementation of integration and inclusivity efforts in urban planning.

Overcoming these social challenges requires a comprehensive and collaborative approach involving community engagement, anti-discrimination measures, education, and policies that prioritize cultural integration and social cohesion. It also necessitates a deep understanding of the complexities of cultural diversity and the willingness to address systemic issues that hinder inclusive urban planning.

2.2.3. INDEX AND POLICIES FOR MULTICULTURAL URBAN PLANNING

The traditional method of urban planning at a macro level involves using overall demographic data, land use, and movements within the city (M. A. Qadeer, 2016). In Kurtz's (2014) interview with Canadian urban planners and practitioners, the findings showed that urban planners focus on planning buildings and structures, but not necessarily for different types of people – the users. The focus of city planning was centred on general residents' movement and quality of living, rather than the cultural demographic needs of the residents.

While many cities may not consider ethnic diversity as part of the urban planning context, there have been some indexes or masterplans developed to assess and measure each city's readiness for multiculturalism. This section will review these policies and programs from Europe, North America, and the United Kingdom to identify elements for multicultural planning.

MULTICULTURAL POLICIES FOR EUROPEAN CITIES: INTERCULTURAL CITIES PROGRAMME

The Council of Europe partnered with over 130 European cities and other non-European cities to develop an intercultural approach to cultural diversity, migration, and economic development called the Intercultural Cities Programme (ICC) (Bathily, 2021). Through the 'Intercultural Integration Policy Model', ICC reviews policies and best practices related to interculturalism integration and develops tools and

templates for cities to use and follow. The best practices submitted to ICC and are deemed as good practices are available in the database of good practices and are categorized so that a user can easily access them.

Each year, ICC cities are ranked based on the elements developed through the Intercultural Integration Policy Model and these rankings are called the ICC Index. These elements are also used to develop the framework for assessing the example case studies. The ICC index is a measure of the city's intercultural achievements and standings in comparison to the rest of the ICC cities. These categories show where a city might be lacking and need more improvements. ICC index also guides countries to make contact with other successful countries or cities to discuss their plans and lessons learned to aid their own plans.

The 16 elements are leadership and political commitment, communication, anti-discrimination and equality, anti-rumour strategies & campaigns, education, public space, public services, business/employment and diversity, cultural and social life, leisure and heritage, intercultural mediation and conflict resolution, language, international outlook, intercultural intelligence, welcoming newcomers, public and political participation, and interaction (Bathily, 2021). From the listed, several elements are found to be relevant to multicultural planning in this paper's context such as anti-discrimination, education public space, public services, welcoming newcomers, and public and political participation. These elements are categorized in Chapter 2.3 and discussed further in detail.

MULTICULTURAL POLICIES FOR NORTH AMERICAN CITIES: INDEX OF MULTICULTURAL POLICIES

The article by Mohammad Abdul Qadeer and Sandeep Kumar Agrawal (2011) provides an in-depth example of how the Index of Multicultural Policies that was developed by Qadeer can be used. By assessing immigrant-rich metropolitan cities in North America, the understanding of planning practices and policies in relation to cultural diversity is shown. The basis of the analysis is based on the Index of Multicultural Policies which was developed by Qadeer to assist cities in their reasonable accommodation and to develop common grounds for their communities and cities (M. A. Qadeer, 2009).

The policy index is categorized into three clusters: Planning Process (Index #1-5); Land use and development (Index #6-11, 14), and Community services (Index #12, 13, 15, 16-19). Planning processes include the use of minority language(s), representation and inclusion of ethnic groups in decision-making, and routine use of ethnic variables in analysis (M. A. Qadeer & Agrawal, 2011). The 19 indices are listed below.

1. Providing minority language facilities, translations and interpretation, in public consultations.
2. Including minority representatives in planning committees and task forces as well as diversifying planning staff.
3. Including ethnic/minority community organizations in the planning decision-making processes.
4. Recognition of ethnic diversity as a planning goal in Official/Comprehensive Plans.
5. City-wide policies for culture-specific institutions in plans, e.g., places of worship, ethnic seniors' homes, cultural institutions, funeral homes, fairs and parades, etc.
6. Routinely analyzing ethnic and racial variables in planning analysis.
7. Studies of ethnic enclaves and neighbourhoods in transition.
8. Policies/design guidelines for sustaining ethnic neighbourhoods.
9. Policies/strategies for ethnic commercial areas, malls and business improvement areas.

10.   Incorporating culture/religion as an acceptable reason for site-specific accommodations/minor-variances.
11.   Accommodation of ethnic signage, street names and symbols.
12.   Policies for ethnic-specific service needs.
13.   Policies for immigrants' special service needs.
14.   Policies/projects for ethnic heritage preservation.
15.   Guidelines for housing to suit diverse groups.
16.   Development strategies taking account of intercultural needs.
17.   Promoting and systematizing ethnic entrepreneurship for economic development.
18.   Policies/strategies for promoting ethnic art and cultural services.
19.   Accommodating ethnic sports in playfield design and programming.

Qadeer and Agrawal conducted an evaluation against these indices by utilizing surveys and questionnaires administered to municipal planning departments. The comprehensive survey encompassed responses from 42 cities, comprising 23 US cities and 19 Canadian cities. Analyzing the survey data, the article explores the correlation between the size of the cities, policy categories, and the city's immigrant population in terms of the number of policies implemented (M. A. Qadeer & Agrawal, 2011).

The study highlights a significant disparity in policy implementation among sampled cities. Notably, land use and development policies ranked lowest in implementation across all sampled cities, while planning process policies emerged as the most adopted. Intriguingly, the percentage of immigrants did not significantly impact policy adaptation, particularly in medium and large US and Canadian cities. In essence, the number of policies implemented showed that practice is not consistent with the theory of inconsideration of ethnic awareness in the planning process.

The survey results reveal a clear disparity between practice and theory, highlighting that practice is outpacing theory. It becomes evident that planning practice is responsive to the current ethnic composition of the population, yet it lacks the necessary policies and systematic structures to proactively address future demographic trends. This approach often involves planners and practitioners dealing with projects and policies on a case-by-case basis, particularly in medium and large Canadian cities. Academic research and findings are lagging due to the volume of research conducted, contributing to the establishment of robust systems and policies (M. A. Qadeer & Agrawal, 2011).

The surge in pluralism within urban planning gained momentum with the advent of feminist theories and the influx of Hispanic, Asian, and Eastern European immigrants in 1965. This era marked a pivotal transition away from a predominantly Anglo-European-focused urban planning approach. The emergence of highly multicultural cities necessitated a departure from cultural considerations as secondary in the urban planning discourse. Amid this shift towards pluralism, planners faced the challenge of accommodating diverse cultural needs both within specific cultural groups and among the broader community. Qadeer introduced the concept of "accommodating cultural differences," delineating the dual dimensions of private, individual culture and public culture encompassing economics, education, and law (M. A. Qadeer, 2009). This difference underscores the importance of ensuring a collective vision for a sustainable, equitable, and economically viable society while simultaneously addressing the unique needs of minority groups. The responsibility lies with planners to balance these often competing demands, a task further underscored by Qadeer's notion of "reasonable accommodation." This concept underscores the imperative for urban planning practices to respond to

cultural diversity while upholding principles of common good and equity (M. A. Qadeer, 2009, p. 141). Decision-makers, particularly city planners and government bodies, assume the crucial role of crafting adaptable urban environments that mirror the dynamic evolution of societies and their inhabitants. A city is constantly being updated and shifted based on the people who occupy the space such as the use and the makeup of clustered areas like commercial districts, office towers, university campuses, and open spaces (Fong & Berry, 2017; M. A. Qadeer, 2016).

Qadeer and Agrawal delved deeper into the interpretation of the results, yielding three key findings: the role of representation in the planning process, the quest for equitable cities and reasonable accommodation, and the restructuring of community services to establish common ground (M. A. Qadeer & Agrawal, 2011). The elements distilled from these three overarching themes is incorporated into the foundation for the subsequent analytical framework. Ensuring representation within the planning process emerges as a fundamental aspect, with language playing a pivotal role in facilitating effective communication and thereby enhancing participation. Inclusive consultation during the planning phase, particularly focused on minority and underrepresented populations, is paramount. However, the concept of representation extends beyond consultation as it necessitates a tangible presence within the power hierarchy. The decision-making authority and internal discourse must reflect a proportional representation mirroring the diversity ratios inherent to the city's demographics.

A discrepancy was found between macro-level multicultural planning, which lacks systemic support, and micro-level initiatives like reasonable accommodation. City planners have demonstrated responsiveness to ethnic diversity within established policies, although on a smaller scale. However, a comprehensive framework is absent, one that integrates ad-hoc implementations in ethnic communities, commercial enterprises, and cultural pursuits into the broader framework of urban sustainability encompassing housing, economics, healthcare, and transportation objectives (M. A. Qadeer & Agrawal, 2011). Furthermore, planners bear the responsibility of persuading the public that accommodating minority needs, ensuring equitable services, and diversifying recreational offerings contribute to a shared long-term objective.

CULTURAL DIVERSITY IN BRITAIN: INDICATORS FOR OPENNESS

The project by the British researchers aimed to determine the connection between cultural diversity, innovation, and urban prosperity in Britain, developing strategies and policies to harness the potential of diverse communities and serve as role models for other cities (Wood et al., 2006). Through the research, it was found that there is a lack of parameters and data available to measure diversity which hindered the ability to determine the level of ethnic diversity and intercultural mixing in the city. The responses to the 'How ethnically diverse is a city?' question would be subjective based on one's experience and background. As the outcome of the research, a new toolkit that is measurable, and tangible was proposed. The toolkit, the indicator of openness, was developed based on interviews and case studies in seven UK cities and compared with other cases across the world (Wood & Landry, 2008).

The creation of the toolkit stemmed from four fundamental findings of the study. Firstly, diversity was perceived as a challenge rather than an asset in the UK, unlike in countries like the USA and Canada where multiculturalism is integral to their identity. Secondly, individuals who could bridge ethnic, cultural, and interest-based boundaries, termed intercultural innovators, were identified as crucial for connecting with people from diverse backgrounds. Thirdly, while demographic data about each of the communities is accessible, information about interactions between these groups is lacking. Lastly, the

authors underscore the principle of interaction as vital when examining a city from an intercultural lens. These insights are further developed and form the basis for the indicators designed to evaluate interculturalism.

According to Wood et al. (2006) a crucial perspective for urban planning is interculturalism, which acknowledges diverse cross-sectional interests and needs within a community, as opposed to multiculturalism, which often results in distinct and parallel cultural communities. Interculturalism emphasizes community connectors and innovation leaders for effective engagement.

Public spaces play a pivotal role, providing a foundation for ethnic communities to connect comfortably and expressively with neighbours. The intersection of shared space, representation, and confidence is exemplified by the theatre play, Aladdin's evolving success. Aladdin was marketed with an 'exotic' tagline to attract audiences and now is a worldly-recognized play. Similarly, carnivals and festivals that celebrate intercultural bring in creativity. A hybrid mix of British touch to the Jamaican, Brazilian carnivals and Latin American music has gained attraction over the years. Artists have taken advantage of film and music to combine creativity and interculturalism to reflect the current society.

It was found that "sport and multiculturalism is the most comprehensive research on the role of sport in fostering cultural exchange (Wood et al., 2006, p.38)." Sports have been used to experience diversity, drawing people into social networks. Sports serve various purposes in intercultural engagement: experiencing diversity, promoting shared experiences, assimilating ethnic groups, and fostering togetherness. Once asylum seekers and refugees were able to settle with essential needs such as security, housing and jobs, the demand for access to sports has increased. Certain sports were however seen as middle-class sports and felt that there were barriers to getting access to them. On the other hand, football (soccer) has actively combated racism such as the European network Football Against Racism, becoming a platform for intercultural sports exchange.

One of the cases for starting this project was that Britain viewed ethnic diversity as a problem to be solved rather than an opportunity to be solved. With this mindset, the authors realized that they needed to view multiculturalism in a different light. An approach would highlight innovation as the key ingredient for Britain to move forward and create a city as it solves their problems. Creativity and new ways of thinking for solving housing, transport, governance, and economic issues where they cross with technology, processes, and communication would be the next steps in solving urban issues. Therefore, there are innovators who are key players in this process as they are believed to be ones who could view their own culture and others in a different light. The authors outlined the findings from interviewing the intercultural actors that "crossed boundaries between minority ethnic and mainstream cultural, social, economic and civic/political networks (Wood et al., 2006, p.46)." The selection was not completed based on their backgrounds but on what they did, in which the actors were categorized broadly into entrepreneurs, artists, and community leaders. The lessons learned from the innovators can translate into issues and then into next steps solutions.

The three issues mentioned by the innovators stood out: racism, institutional structure, and funding. Many of those interviewed have experienced racism and believed that having youth and community workers, race equality trainers, communicators and mediators in planning and community disputes would help in education and reduction of racism in the community. Additionally, the current system is still stuck in the traditional method where those who need help need to seek help, rather those who can

provide the service should be going to those in need. Lastly, the funding structure is sporadic and project-based and lacks continuity.

However, the question remains whether urban planners truly understand the cultural sensitivities of public life in building intercultural cities. The indicators not only guide city assessment but also set principles for future steps, including anti-discrimination legislation, intercultural literacy training, diversity education, and mixed housing policies. The indicators for openness and interculturalism are organized into four categories: institutional framework, business environment, civil society and services, and public spaces.

2.2.4.   LESSONS LEARNED

Amidst the ongoing influx of diverse ethnic and cultural communities into urban areas, the task of integrating and accommodating multiculturalism within urban planning becomes increasingly paramount. Historically, conventional planning approaches have often disregarded the distinct cultural requirements of these diverse populations, instead focusing of primarily on broader citywide development. The three selected policies provide various multicultural planning approaches and frameworks for fostering intercultural integration, community building, and economic development. Notably demonstrated through initiatives like the Intercultural Cities Programme (ICC), Index of Multicultural Policies, and Indicators for Openness, five crucial themes emerge as guiding principles for cities engaged in multicultural planning endeavours.

These encompass the imperative to prioritize representation and inclusivity of diverse groups within decision-making processes, the implementation of multicultural policies acknowledging ethnic diversity as a planning objective, the balancing act between accommodation and equity through reasonable measures, the adoption of intercultural frameworks to inform planning, and the elevation of community spaces that actively facilitate intercultural interaction and socialization. By incorporating these elements into planning practices, cities can create more inclusive and vibrant urban environments that celebrate diversity and enhance the quality of life for all residents.

1. **Inclusive Governance Emphasizing Representation**: Planners should prioritize ethnic inclusion in decision-making, integrating language and culture, and involving minority communities in the process.
2. **Services and Programs for Integration**: Multicultural planning necessitates tailored immigrant services such as the welcoming newcomers' program, promoting ethnic art, and anti-discrimination efforts. The methods and forms of interaction can range widely from public schools, cultural and religious festivals, and sports, to cuisine. Equitable access to public services is crucial for fostering a sense of belonging and social cohesion.
3. **Active Public Participation and Outreach**: Participation has been a reoccurring element to be critical, especially for underrepresented people. The language barrier, access to information, and cultural differences make it hard to reach newcomers and immigrants. Due to this, active outreach to hear from immigrants and their needs is critical, and the methods of outreach, places of interaction, and the types of information collected should be diverse to receive a clear understanding.
4. **Intercultural Space and Mundane Space of Interaction**: Public spaces serve as vital gathering spots, fostering natural interaction without financial constraints. They also encourage habitual engagement, seen in places like libraries, community centers, and markets. Achieving the

delicate equilibrium between integrating specific cultures and ensuring overall inclusivity remains an ongoing consideration for planners and architects.

5. **Ethnic Economy Development and Diversity at Workplace**: A specialization of particular economic activities by ethnic and immigrant entrepreneurs, leading to the formation of distinct ethnic economic clusters. These clusters, exemplified by Asian retail malls and Italian presence in construction, may offer opportunities for ethnic entrepreneurship, but they may not necessarily eliminate inequalities within or between ethnic communities. Additionally, encouraging diversity in workplaces, including equal opportunities for underrepresented individuals and diversity structures in larger companies, is crucial for fair representation and specialization, particularly for recent immigrants facing labour market challenges.

2.3.   DETAILING: MULTICULTURAL URBAN PLANNING PRACTICES

In the realm of urban planning, embracing cultural diversity becomes a paramount goal, as it involves actively breaking down barriers and addressing spatial disparities that may exist between cultural communities. This requires fostering spaces and initiatives that promote intercultural dialogue, cooperation, and understanding among residents. The dynamic interplay of urban cultures, influenced by the impact of ethnic diversity, can be witnessed through new activities, communities, and aesthetics that shape the spatial structure of a city. By integrating cultural diversity into urban planning practices, cities can flourish as dynamic hubs where different cultures coexist, interact, and contribute to the collective everyday experience.

From the lessons learned in Chapter 2.2, a set of principles is outlined to evaluate and achieve well-integrated diversity in a city. These elements serve as valuable guidance for urban planners and practitioners. To create an inclusive society that embraces differences and uniqueness, multi-dimensional approaches are essential, both within the government and the community.

At the governmental level, planning practices should include updating legislative frameworks and increasing the representation of underrepresented groups in decision-making processes. Additionally, offering immigrant and culture-specific services and programs can foster equity and enhance cultural exposure between communities. Public participation emerges as a critical aspect of urban planning, requiring a varied and attentive approach to effectively reach and engage community members.

Furthermore, the design of physical spaces and the structure of economic development play significant roles in shaping how communities interact within a city. By carefully considering and integrating these elements, urban planners can construct environments that truly celebrate diversity and foster a harmonious coexistence of cultures.

2.3.1.   INCLUSIVE GOVERNANCE EMPHASIZING REPRESENTATION

The city's cultural composition profoundly impacts its development across various dimensions: the inclusivity of planning frameworks in multicultural cities, planning practitioners' perspectives and approaches towards demographic shifts, and the interaction between planners and residents within the planning process. Pisco (2018) suggests that multiculturalism challenges existing planning frameworks prompts adjustments to change regulations due to shifting demographics, and triggers debates over design and implementation. Multiculturalism injects fresh ideas and perspectives, demanding practitioners to align planning strategies accordingly. The following section delves into various key aspects of the government's role in multicultural planning, spanning from federal to city levels,

educational initiatives, land use regulations, representation in public services, and their collective impact on fostering inclusivity and integration.

KEY ROLES OF THE GOVERNMENT

Understanding the governmental framework and relationships spanning public sectors, residents, private entities, and organizations is essential for comprehending their influence on urban planning. Qadeer (2016) delineates service modes into "soft" and "hard," where the government and its structures offer hard services, while soft services are provided by the community itself. Goods and services can be disseminated via the hard market, aided by public provision, or organized by the community. In each of these approaches, the government bears a degree of responsibility, though the extent of involvement may vary. The balance of efforts and emphasis is subject to change depending on the government structure and the prevailing majority in power. The government's role in multicultural planning encompasses several key aspects. At the national or federal level and the municipal or city level, distinct responsibilities emerge. Informing and educating city employees becomes crucial, along with fostering interdepartmental collaboration. Additionally, government funding plays a pivotal role in supporting multicultural initiatives.

Federal governments generally establish broad frameworks, but city-level authorities are more attuned to local issues (Leonie Sandercock, 2009). Federal responsibilities set the foundation, yet they can seem distant from local realities. The benefit of a vertical structure is that it clarifies authority, however, complexity arises in sharing accountability. Achieving a balance between upward accountability and outward responsiveness is crucial (Federal Family, 2009).

City-level engagement offers clearer insights into local concerns and better pathways to connect with residents. Effective place-based strategies require a delicate equilibrium between accountability and flexibility. Community identities related to local neighbourhoods profoundly shape urban dynamics. Authenticity demands well-organized public consultation aimed at addressing root issues (Federal Family, 2009). City officials can influence federal decisions, devise tailored solutions for local challenges, and foster citizen engagement. This approach thrives on authenticity from all stakeholders: a receptive government and understanding residents. The government must adopt a flexible and open-minded approach, and residents need to grasp varying and potentially conflicting opinions. Achieving this entails officials educating themselves about diverse community interests and expanding interdepartmental collaboration.

Education is crucial not only for youth but also for professionals and decision-makers. Implementing a training program for planners and officials to grasp the reality of immigration can inform their choices. Intercultural competence involves understanding and empathizing with diverse backgrounds (Wood et al., 2006). Diversity and equity training, encompassing history, religion, cultural differences, and bias awareness, is increasingly included in programs (Poitras, 2009). Structured training should foster open discussions to break down biases, as unchecked perceptions may lead to oversimplified conclusions. Informal learning about each culture can come from a natural learning environment from colleagues of various backgrounds. Addressing biases allows nuanced solutions and improved practices within public institutions.

Interculturalism is a multi-disciplinary area where there are social factors involved to consider as well as political approaches with the overall urban planning understanding. With this, a cross-department approach is critical to community cohesion (Wood et al., 2006; Zhuang, 2013). Collaboration efforts

through the master planning stage to the monitoring of projects between the planning department, cultural department, and financial department should be strengthened.

The government can directly intervene by enacting new regulations or indirectly exert influence through funding and grants. Multiculturalism grants and programs are instituted to endorse initiatives that foster intercultural understanding, safeguard cultural heritage, and cultivate a unified and harmonious society. Multiple levels of government can extend financial aid. It's crucial to develop resilient programming that can endure beyond the duration of funding and government intervention.

ETHNIC SPECIFIC REGULATIONS

The federal government bears the responsibility of establishing a framework for provinces and local communities to adhere to. This framework, often broad in nature, includes regulations and legislations that set a tone of acceptance and welcome for newcomers and multiculturalism. A robust commitment to interculturalism at the national level is vital, as it motivates agencies and lower levels of government to earnestly pursue further steps in integration (George, 2023; M. A. Qadeer, 2016; Wood et al., 2006; Zapata-Barrero, 2015a).

An exemplary country that implemented multiculturalism on a federal level is Canada. Canada embraced a multicultural national identity and demonstrated this through a range of regulations. The Multiculturalism Policy of 1971 was the initial step, affirming the government's commitment to diversity (George, 2023; Pisco, 2018). The Charter of Rights and Freedoms in 1982 further solidified equality for all citizens regardless of cultural or ethnic background. The Multiculturalism Act of 1988 continued this approach, emphasizing diverse cultural practices, languages, and traditions. The 1986 Employment Equity Act aimed at inclusivity and combating workplace discrimination. These policies have greatly impacted education, employment, government services, and the arts. Provinces and territories tailored their frameworks based on federal guidance.

At the city level, zoning regulations and by-laws can often be vague and generalized and these traditional methods often fail to account for cultural nuances and diversity (Kurtz, 2014; Zapata-Barrero, 2015). For example, religious institutions and places of worship are often categorized into larger land use and specific zoning requirements are not met. Religious places are considered as part of the multi-cultural characteristics in daily life. Sandercock (2000) mentions that many of the places of worship are often located far from their worshippers, on the periphery of the city making it inaccessible by public transit, or in incompatible land uses such as industrial zones, retail outlets, and landfill sites. Places of worship often serve not only as religious grounds but as community centres and places of gathering for families and children to share information and interactions. Therefore, it is ideal to be located within the community of the users and safely accessible for children and elders.

Sandercock (2000) provided an example in the suburban community in Melbourne that illustrated poor use of the land use zoning regulations. There was a large influx of immigrants from Vietnam, Cambodia, and China which required a new site for a Buddhist temple. However, the site provided was in the industrial area on the outskirts of the town, making it inaccessible to communities. Accessible via public transportation is important as most of the attendees did not have access to private cars. As a solution, monks built a makeshift temple in residential housing and converted it into a small temple. This was praised by the groups of people who attended their temple however there were backlashes by the local residents due to the high number of visitors and the smell of incense. The converted temple is

unfortunately closed down in the case of non-conformity. This example showcases the inequitable circumstances and potential xenophobia and racism.

Embracing cultural diversity as part of land use planning or zoning requires more flexibility built into the legislation. Even with the inclusion of ethnic religious places of worship, without the adaptability of the planning regulation, these zoning requirements can be used as an excuse to discriminate. For example, the rejection of a new mosque due to 26 parking spaces short of its requirements of 130 while other churches have been made exemption on their parking requirements (Isin & Siemiatycki, 2002). Each occasion and place have its uniqueness depending on the culture and the surrounding environment and adaptation by authorities fosters inclusive urban planning practices.

REPRESENTATION IN PUBLIC SERVICES

Minority representation in public services, especially in decision-making positions holds immense significance in governance to shift towards inclusivity. Incorporating people of all backgrounds and needs can be done in two methods. The first is to encourage, invite, and aid in the articulation of the interests and concerns during policymaking and implementation. The second form involves empowering minority community members by involving them as staff, managers, and elected/appointed public representatives (M. A. Qadeer, 2016). To reshape the legal framework and let the diversity and the interests of immigrants be heard, there needs to be a change to diversifying representation within planning commissions (Harwood, 2022). It is crucial to equip civic employees, particularly those engaging with migrants and minority populations, with intercultural awareness training. This training extends to politicians and decision-makers as well, enhancing the efficiency of administration and services while ensuring equitable access to social rights (Bathily, 2021). This becomes even more pivotal in occupations such as the police, public health departments, and public safety departments, which significantly impact vulnerable individuals. Immigrant engagement in decision-making processes, advocacy, and skill-building activities not only strengthens their organizational abilities but also fosters greater mobilization and empowerment (Fong & Berry, 2017). Encouraging immigrants and minorities to actively participate in public services is a crucial aspect of building a more inclusive society, as highlighted in the Public Participation section. Ultimately, a diverse representation in public services helps to address the specific needs of marginalized communities, bridge gaps, and create a more just and responsive system.

2.3.2.   SERVICES AND PROGRAMS FOR INTEGRATION

It is shown that a city that embraces immigrant's social and cultural influences, and openness to other customs attract further immigration. This section includes descriptions of public services and programs provided by government bodies, and integration efforts through entertainment, food, and creative means.

INCREASING INTERACTION THROUGH ART, SPORTS, FOOD

It is shown that a city that embrace immigrant's social and cultural influences, and openness to other customs attract further immigration (Fong & Berry, 2017; Local Government Association, 2004; Yeoh, 2005). The realm of culture in terms of recreation and education can be limited to orchestras, art galleries and museums. However, sports and music are also a large part of the culture in many countries. It is also a way for people to share interests and bond. The display and education of historical artifacts to tell the story of the country may be important, however for people to learn other cultures, a larger quantity of exposure, easily accessible, and experiencing ethnic culture is an effective method.

Cultural festivals featuring food, dance, and opportunities for organizations to advertise are some of the most well-received events. The City of Toronto closed its streets for international events, parades and fairs over 310 streets in 2002 (Qadeer, 2016, p.81). These street festivals include the Caribbean Festival, the West Indian Parade, St. Patrick's Day, and the Santa Claus Parade. Similarly, New York City lists events within the city on the city's website including Cuban Day, Turkish American celebrations, Haitian Flag Day, Norwegian American 17th of May, and the Salute to Israel. There are multiple events occurring throughout the city, especially during summer, in their ethnic communities (City of Toronto, 2023b). These festivals are occurring in public spaces, on the streets, which promote civic culture by establishing norms, values, and ethics of behaviour in such places (Qadeer, 2016, p.81). Ethnic-orientated parades and festivals not only draw attention to their own cultures such as dance, food, and accessories but also are opportunities for local associations and groups to showcase themselves and engage the residents. For example, shown in Figure 3, Salsa on St. Clair in Toronto is an opportunity for people to learn about Latin culture but also to learn how to dance through its free dance lessons during the festival.

FIGURE 3: SALSA FESTIVAL IN TORONTO, CANADA (PHOTO CREDIT: AUTHOR, 2012)

Sports provide a positive avenue for community building and fostering new friendships. Soccer is a particularly popular and accessible sport (Qadeer, 2016, p.162). During notable events like the World Cup, people of various ethnicities unite to support their countries or league teams, fostering a sense of camaraderie. Soccer is also a fairly easy sport to enter and join, creating plenty of soccer leagues to join to play. Beyond soccer, activities such as cricket, table tennis, and yoga also serve as communal activities that bridge cultural backgrounds. While cricket's popularity among immigrants from British Commonwealth countries led to its recognition and establishment of fields in cities like Toronto, New York, and Los Angeles, soccer and baseball fields remain more prevalent (Qadeer, 2016, p.201). The shift towards systematic planning and the design of flexible recreational centers and sports fields exemplifies a broader effort to promote culture readiness and inclusivity.

While popular ethnic cuisines like Japanese, Italian, Chinese, and Turkish have become integral parts of Western food culture, the rising immigration rates are introducing a wider variety of ethnic foods to the culinary scene. The City of Toronto, for instance, has responded to this trend by revising its licensing

policies to permit the sale of diverse ethnic foods from street carts, expanding beyond the traditional hot dog (Qadeer, 2016, p.201). Night Markets, a common sight in many Asian countries, have gained popularity in the city and are drawing crowds eager to experience Asian cuisine and cultural ambiance, creating a sense of familiarity and belonging for minorities. For example, the Korean street food cart located in North York is shown in Figure 4. This adjustment not only caters to residents' preferences but also fosters cultural integration and ethno-racial group inclusion.

FIGURE 4: KOREAN STREET FOOD IN TORONTO, CANADA (PHOTO CREDIT: AUTHOR, 2023)

To sustain and enhance this dynamic, it is imperative to establish a dedicated individual or committee within the city to collaborate closely with local cultural associations. This collaboration is pivotal for curating diverse and vibrant festivals and traditions. Furthermore, fostering interactions among different communities in public spaces can be significantly enriched through cooperation between essential stakeholders like grassroots organizations, non-profits, and city authorities.

International film festivals showcase movies and stories about diverse cultural backgrounds and provide a platform for ethnic filmmakers to tell their stories. Film festivals act as dynamic platforms for cross-cultural exchange, promoting diversity, and fostering global understanding. There are the big five international film festivals in Venice, Cannes, Berlin, Toronto, and Sundance, and now there are over 500 international festivals that have brought together filmmakers, artists, and audiences from diverse backgrounds, showcasing films that reflect various cultures, languages, and perspectives (Follows, 2013; Santa Fe International Film Festival, 2023). By screening movies from around the world, these festivals expose audiences to different ways of life, beliefs, and values, thereby breaking down stereotypes and fostering empathy. They provide a space for dialogue and appreciation of cultural differences, contributing to the enrichment of the urban cultural fabric. These festivals, among many others, serve as powerful tools for promoting cultural diversity, fostering mutual respect, and building bridges between people from various corners of the world.

LANGUAGE ASSISTANCE PROGRAMS

The establishment of a robust language assistance, learning, and interpretation program holds paramount importance for fostering cultural responsiveness. Language assistance programs serve as the foundational step in dismantling linguistic barriers for effective communication and access to essential information. It upholds the fundamental right to information for every resident, ensuring equitable participation and engagement. Access to public services is enhanced by providing translated documents, forms, and essential information, and offering interpretation facilities. A city's commitment to such a program reflects its dedication to inclusivity, where the dissemination of public information, news, and journals in minority languages or the provision of translation services at public service locations, norms such as public health, the works departments, ambulance, fire, and police services, parks, recreation, social services, and housing. This proactive approach guarantees that crucial information reaches all residents, fostering a cohesive and well-informed multicultural community.

Many of the major cities like the City of Barcelona, Ansan, Leeds, Toronto, New York and Los Angeles have a language centre that provides language learning classes and interpretation services (Council of Europe, 2020, 2017.; Qadeer, 2016). All official documents do not need to be translated, however, the information critical for immigrants such as newcomers' guides or information at the Ministry of Foreign Affairs should take priority in getting translated. For example, Sherbrooke's Canadian newcomer support service (SANC) is available in more than 30 languages in addition to English and French. SANC includes reception and welcoming services, job searching, the road to citizenship, and networking services (Council of Europe, n.d.). For essential services, the Portuguese Ministry of Health partnered with the local NGOs to provide translation of healthcare information. Health booklets and manuals are provided in several languages for topics such as pregnancy, birth and STD control including images for improved understanding (Council of Europe, n.d.). Erlangen in Germany showcased a mobile app to provide asylum information in six languages (German, English, French, Farsi, Arab and Russian) to overcome the administrative systems.

Off-site translation services and language courses are often found in ethnic communities. Site selection within the community is more attractive within the cluster of immigrants and minorities. In this case, the services are easily accessible, and information is more transferrable amongst people. Minority languages are often seen on street signs, commercial flyers and store names in ethnic enclaves. For a more intercultural approach, language awareness for the other spoken language other than the official language makes the city more open. The example of a multilingualism program at a primary school in Vienna offers language ateliers in more than 10 languages for children to practice their own language and learn different languages. The program is scheduled for a student to experience 18 languages in three years (Council of Europe, 2020a).

Depending on local politics and available community organizations, the assistance program may differ. There were some opposing opinions regarding providing official information in foreign languages. A former Mayor of the City of Mississauga advocated for immigrants to learn English and only provided documents in English. In such a case, local associations and ethnic groups can assist interpreters and enhance the number and quality of English language courses (M. A. Qadeer, 2016).

WELCOMING NEWCOMER PROGRAMS

The circumstance for newcomers to a city or a country varies and their needs follow suit. The first impression and experience in a new city impact their integration and sense of belonging leading to their prolonged stay. Establishing a Welcoming Newcomers Program plays a pivotal role as the first contact place to offer essential information to a foreigner. The program can include mentorship, services for administrative processes, information on community events, and cultural orientation sessions. General information about the city such as maps and other services offered by volunteers and NGOs in multiple languages can act as starting points. The institute where they offer the welcoming programs can also act as a place to collect information about newcomers and how they can contribute to the community through their skills and experiences. This helps them to better integrate into the urban fabric and contribute to the economic and social development of the community.

The government and the administrative system are responsible for developing programs to welcome and intake newcomers, including setting the tone for how receiving the city is. The city officials have the power to draw an image and send a message regarding incoming residents. A systematic support structure for incoming immigrants has a significant impact on newcomers' experience as well as how

receiving the existing population is. In addition, the integration process itself occurs at the neighbourhood level (Poitras, 2009).

Copenhagen's Department for Integration and Language initiated a Host Program to connect newly arrived migrants with local volunteers to promote understanding, and integration (Council of Europe, 2017; Mørkøre-Yde, n.d.). The activities offered were focused on providing information on the Danish education system and the job market. Volunteers were from the Danish Refugee Council and Foreningen Nydansker and the newcomers with different permits including refugees, family reunifications, EU citizens, green card holders and students had a choice to choose between the two organizations. Coordinator Kari Mørkøre-Yde emphasizes its role in preventing discrimination and fostering inclusion and this program was supported further by having the legal framework of the Danish Integration Act established. The program's success lies in municipal-civil society cooperation, a broad target group, and personal connections.

New Zealand has a welcoming program in each of the communities to connect newcomers, recent migrants, former refugees and international students with the locals and to leverage their skills and resources. Immigration New Zealand was a 2-year pilot project with the approved funding which is now a permanent program focusing on supporting migrants and addressing gaps(Immigration New Zealand, 2023). With this funding, The Welcoming Communities Standard was developed, which is used as a guideline for the Councils to establish and assess their communities. Welcoming Communities in New Zealand is part of an international 'welcoming' movement initiated by Welcoming International which is a coalition of initiatives advancing inclusion in localities worldwide and has a network (Welcoming International, 2020). The network includes Australia (Welcoming Cities), Canada (Cities of Migration), Europe (United Kingdom, Germany) (Intercultural Cities) and the United States of America (Welcoming America).

Canada Connect is an initiative to match newcomers to Canadian volunteers. The online platform searches organizations in the area to help seek a mentor. The services available include settlement services, language exchange/learning institutes, and cultural learning programs such as attending hockey games and organizing potlucks.

ANTI-DISCRIMINATION PROGRAMS
Discrimination is any act that puts people at a disadvantage based on their age, disability, ethnicity, origin, political belief, race, religion, sex, gender identity, sexual orientation, language, culture and many other grounds (Bathily, 2021). To combat injustice, cities need to come together with government officials, education and cultural institutions and police and security officers. This partnership can educate the general public, prevent future incidents, and provide reparation to victims. Furthermore, collecting data on discrimination can improve the value and quality of discrimination programs.

2.3.3. ACTIVE PUBLIC PARTICIPATION AND OUTREACH
A continuous and iterative engagement with diverse communities through various forms of participation is ideal for public engagement. However, there are challenges in understanding every cultural group's intricacy in diverse urban settings (Wood et al., 2006). Intercultural dialogue can bridge the gap to emphasize and foster cross-cultural understanding. While participation can take various forms, the focus is on common goals and expected outcomes, and the residents and the participants should feel empowered and heard. It is important to gain trust from the citizens and once that is accomplished, they will feel more comfortable sharing their values and opinions.

A city should have a participatory process to include migrants and minorities as it represents the makeup of the city, monitor their involvement throughout the decision-making processes, and see if the implementations reflect the outcome of the consultation. Initiatives like the Montreal Public Consultation Office (OCPM) use online platforms and dedicated consultations for minorities, encouraging exclusion-free participation. Rethinking engagement involves shifting from traditional neighbourhood associations to informal networks, non-profits, and community-based organizations.

The concept of 'intercultural spaces' highlights the potential for greater cross-cultural connection through community engagement on common issues. In this context, public spaces and informal networks such as streets, bars, health centers, schools, libraries, swimming pools, and parks become arenas for inclusive consultation (Harwood, 2022, p. 423; Wood et al., 2006). Findings from the London Borough of Tower Hamlets, such engagement, rooted in comfort and convenience, has shown to be successful. This targeted marketing aims to foster interaction and trust among diverse residents and stakeholders as participation. An iterative process ensures the translation of ideas into actionable implementations, creating a more inclusive and empathetic urban environment (Wood et al., 2006).

Interculturalism comes from both through relationships and structures. As urban planners, building and formulating the space to make it attractive for people to gather and interact can be easier than facilitating and fostering relationships between the host communities and newcomers (Hickman et al., 2008). The host or majority population often does not seek opportunities to interact with the minority population nor make an effort to understand their stories. City officials and planners have the responsibility to reach the majority population in locations of their daily activities such as playgrounds, sports facilities and transportation stations to raise awareness of minorities' stories and backgrounds. Two examples are shown in Figure 5 for the city's outreach events.

FIGURE 5: OUTREACH AT A PARK AND A PUBLIC INFORMATION SESSION AT A COMMUNITY CENTRE (PHOTO CREDIT: AUTHOR, 2019)

One prominent factor contributing to these challenges is due to a lack of diversity and the methodology in data collection (Fong & Berry, 2017; Kurtz, 2014). This includes alternative methods of data collection, as suggested by Burayidi (2000, quoted in Kurtz, 2014, p.139), such as "ethnographic studies, narration and description stories, talking circles, and role acting." Here, the active involvement of city authorities, planners, and architects in fostering open dialogues and maintaining consistent communication becomes paramount. These efforts aid in gathering additional insights from ethnic communities, thus fostering a deeper understanding of their distinct needs and aspirations.

While there has been remarkable progress in embedding citizen participatory processes within urban planning, practical experiences underscore a disconcerting reality. Often, these processes turn into mere procedural checkboxes, raising concerns, particularly in the context of indigenous community consultations. Regulatory guidelines mandate announcements, contact, and outreach, often fulfilled through letters, emails, and calls, even if genuine responses are lacking. Notably, there exists no mandate to actively listen and engage with the responses received. Further complicating matters are constraints such as the availability of consultation specialists, limited time, and financial resources, all of which hinder broader community engagement.

2.3.4. INTERCULTURAL SPACE AND MUNDANE SPACE OF INTERACTION

Cultural diversity goes beyond mere demographics and includes the recognition of cultural heritage, customs, and traditions that shape the identity of various communities. Planners must consider how different cultural groups use and interact with public spaces, transportation, housing, and urban amenities to create an inclusive and equitable neighbourhood (Isar, 2016).

PUBLIC SPACE THAT ENABLES INTERACTION

A well-designed city has numerous options in public spaces that turn mundane and ordinary places with daily activities into interactive places with diverse cultures and people. An interesting urban place attracts people and provides excitement and pleasure with diverse activities (Fainstein, 2005). These everyday places include shopping centres, libraries, schools, colleges, youth centres, sports clubs, specific cinemas, hair salons, the hospital, markets and community centres (Wood et al., 2006, p. 63). Wood et al. (2006) depict popular intercultural spaces in Lewisham and Bristol to be spaces of interdependence and habitual engagement where micro publics come together. Regular meetings with similar purposes draw in interest and familiarity. For increased borderless interactions, the role of place-making and urban design needs to minimize avoidance and rivalry and rid of infrastructure barriers such as railway tracks, large and continuous walls, and road patterns that can cause physical segregation (Bathily, 2021; Wood et al., 2006).

Vinnytsia Multicultural Space (MCSVi) in Ukraine was created to provide a central hub as a physical space for interactions as the number of immigrants increased in the city (Council of Europe, 2020a). The objective of MCSVi is to create and improve interactions between different cultures and facilitate artistic economy. The site was an abandoned cinema building which was revitalized as a cultural space. This was suiting as the interaction in MCSVi was focused on arts and culture. From MCSVi the partner relations between local centers of different international cultural organizations, and new jobs were created in the field of culture.

Libraries have been a public place many immigrants turn to for resources, for both children and adults. It holds books, access to computers and experts. Intercultural Cities Program took the idea for "Living library: borrow a life" where books are people and reading is conversation (Council of Europe, 2020b; Little et al., 2011). This initiative originated in Denmark and has been implemented in more than 80 countries like Peru, the USA, and the Netherlands (Human Library Organization, 2022; Ledsom, 2022). In Montreal at an open-air event called "Les Jardins Gamelin", they utilized Living Library to provide higher exposure and educate citizens of the indigenous culture. The Indigenous people or migrants shared their life stories to provide opportunities for exchanging knowledge and naturally learning and building relationships. With the culture of Indigenous people, caring for their sacred land, there are tours available with Indigenous people's perspective.

CULTURAL MIXING IN THE NEIGHBOURHOOD

A neighbourhood design promoting cohesion is pivotal for integration and can benefit from community projects that nurture trust, learning, and mutual recognition. Fong and Berry present a number of theories that illustrate integration levels between majority and minority groups (Fong & Berry, 2017) Immigrant residential patterns result from a complex interplay of factors; in each neighbourhood, the pattern varies based on the city's ethnic composition and immigration history. Neighbourhood initiatives aimed at fostering a sense of community and trust can harmonize with diverse cultural clusters. In Zurich, housing policies for cultural blending are outlined within the Integration Policy, featuring housing and social cultural programs to encourage interaction among residents from diverse backgrounds. Government-supported initiatives such as integration projects (Integrationskredit) and exchange and cohabitation projects (Kredit Austausch und Zusammenleben). Additionally, community centers are established as educational and mediation hubs (Council of Europe, 2019)

ETHNIC COMMUNITIES

In contrast to the challenges posed by diversity within neighbourhoods, there are also notable advantages in cultivating ethnic communities. The human inclination toward similarity often draws people together, resulting in concentrated resources like religious congregations, ethnic businesses, and language assistance within institutions. Such ethno-centric focal points are conducive to sharing resources effectively, making them a natural hub for community activities. Notably, public spaces play a pivotal role in shaping civic culture by setting norms, values, and ethical behaviours within these areas.

However, failure to acknowledge these dynamics can inadvertently lead to the formation of homogenous groups, fueling inadvertent segregation (Wood et al., 2006). Overlooking input from residents may amplify feelings of marginalization and exclusion. In cities marked by racial divisions, communication gaps between the government and residents can exacerbate this issue. Ultimately, the interplay between cultural diversity, planning strategies, and community engagement deeply influences the trajectory of multicultural urban areas. The concentration of residents of the same ethnic background facilitates the retention of cultural identity and the functioning of vital institutions, such as religious, educational, and welfare facilities, which enhance community cohesion (Hou & Garnett, 2004). However, an overconcentration of minority groups in certain areas could result in social isolation and hinder their integration into the host country.

Conversely, the clustering of apartment housing, visible minorities, and heightened racial diversity can contribute to the patterning of low-income neighbourhoods. This outcome is partly due to rising income inequality within and among different minority groups. This phenomenon increases the likelihood of impoverished members of these groups being confined to economically disadvantaged neighbourhoods, including inner suburbs and social housing. In contrast, wealthier individuals can opt for higher status "ethnic communities," highlighting the intricate dynamics of segregation and neighbourhood formation (Walks & Bourne, 2006).

Enclaves offer significant social benefits such as tailored services and economic viability for religious, linguistic, and culturally sensitive offerings. However, potential downsides include the risk of school segregation and limited exposure to other groups. To mitigate this, strategic planning of school boundaries and curricula can ensure cross-cultural interactions among children (M. Qadeer et al., 2010). Enclaves are often interconnected by ethnic establishments, businesses, and shared identities, strengthening residents' local affiliations.

2.3.5. ETHNIC ECONOMY DEVELOPMENT AND DIVERSITY AT WORKPLACES

Equity in ethnic economic development can be addressed in two different situations. Ethnic distinctions are found in two distinct patterns: vertical divisions within economic sectors and horizontal concentration within specific activities and occupations. The former is regarding equal opportunity at workplaces regardless of the employee's background. In today's society in highly diverse cities, the policies for social inclusion have become a standard practice. To that effect, ethnic diversity at workplaces, especially in the corporate setting has been crucial. Encouragingly, efforts range from fostering small and medium-sized enterprises to designing robust frameworks for equal representation in larger firms. This shift acknowledges the unique contributions of these businesses and aligns with broader multicultural aspirations. Ethnic representation, where both employers and employees share cultural backgrounds, amplifies the impact. Fair employment is an ongoing campaign that is heavily spearheaded in the private sector with internal policies. The public sector can recommend policies however need to be taken up by the private sector for it to flourish into a common practice.

The second pattern of concentration of specific occupations, commercial and retail activities is delved deeper here. The emergence of ethnic and racial sub-economies is characterized by the specialization of particular economic activities by ethnic and immigrant entrepreneurs, leading to the formation of distinct ethnic economic clusters. Two examples are shown in Figure 6, Chinatown and the Arab street in Singapore. The ethnic clusters leverage their human, financial, and socio-cultural resources to excel in these businesses and sometimes take over existing industries. This results in the formation of ethnic economic clusters and niches, as seen in Toronto's South Asian-dominated airport taxi-limousine service, New York's Chinese-led ethnic malls and computer hardware industry, and Italian concentration in construction (M. A. Qadeer, 2016). Commercial activities are at times determined by their belief system as well such as kosher, or vegetarian dietary choices. Based on Qadeer and Agrawal's research, there were only six cities in North America indicating that commercial policies existed to designate ethnic business enclaves or malls as special districts (Chicago in the U.S. and Toronto, Montreal, Edmonton, Saskatoon, and Richmond in Canada). Meanwhile the rest of the respondent cities acted within their existing policies on a case-by-case basis (M. A. Qadeer & Agrawal, 2011).

FIGURE 6: CHINATOWN AND ARAB STREET IN SINGAPORE (PHOTO CREDIT: AUTHOR, 2023)

These economic endeavours, linked through cross-border ethnic networks, extend beyond local markets to become vital components of global trade networks. However, while ethnic economies offer employment opportunities, they do not necessarily eliminate inequalities within or among ethnic groups. Nonetheless, ethnic economies contribute to the diverse tapestry of urban institutions, providing a unique form of cultural infusion. Moreover, support for small and medium-sized enterprises, equitable opportunities for underrepresented individuals, and the establishment of workplace diversity systems collectively contribute to the development of thriving ethnic economies in cities.

Ethnic economies offer both opportunities and challenges for minority groups, particularly recent immigrants entering the job market. These enclaves provide a supportive environment for newcomers to establish themselves, with concentrated clusters of similar businesses reinforcing this dynamic. Encouraging small and medium enterprises, ensuring equal opportunities, and promoting workplace diversity are crucial strategies for enhancing ethnic economies and integrating minority communities.

2.3.6. SUMMARY OF THE ANALYTIC FRAMEWORK

In this section, the main principles of multicultural urban planning have been summarized. These principles will serve as the foundation for the analytical framework used to evaluate case studies in the upcoming section. Furthermore, a compelling exemplar that aligns with these principles is provided to illustrate a successful implementation of this framework.

- **Inclusive governance emphasizing representation:** The government's role in multicultural planning involves developing a legal framework, educating city employees, promoting collaboration among different departments, and providing necessary funding for multicultural initiatives at both national and municipal levels. The influence of ethnic-specific regulations has been profound across societies, affecting education, employment, government services, and the arts. There is a call for flexibility in land use and bylaws to accommodate ethnic buildings that have not been considered before due to a reliance on traditional methods. Diverse representation in public services is essential for addressing the needs of marginalized communities and creating a fairer and more responsive system.

- **Services and programs for integration**: Entertainment, art, culture and food are sources of increasing interaction and a vital strategy for promoting integration and a sense of belonging among immigrants. Initiatives such as diverse street food policies and Night Markets in Toronto contribute to inclusivity by celebrating cultural diversity. Collaborations with cultural associations further enhance interactions in public spaces, fostering connections between different communities. Public services are provided to help with integration. Language assistance programs are crucial to overcoming language barriers faced by immigrants, facilitating better communication and relationship-building among residents. Welcoming newcomer programs play a significant role, especially for refugees and asylum seekers, offering essential support such as housing, food, and employment guidance. These programs often direct migrants and newcomers to city websites or community centers as primary sources of information. Additionally, anti-discrimination programs are essential to address and combat biases and prejudices in multicultural urban environments.

- **Active public participation and outreach**: Effective public engagement in diverse urban settings requires continuous, inclusive participation and intercultural dialogue to bridge gaps. Trust-building and empowerment are crucial for residents' meaningful contributions. Rethinking engagement involves online platforms, dedicated consultations for minorities, and shifting from

traditional associations to informal networks. Urban planners should create attractive spaces for interaction while also fostering relationships between host communities and newcomers. Challenges arise from data collection limitations and procedural engagement, necessitating active involvement and open dialogues from city authorities.

- **Intercultural space and mundane space of interaction**: In urban planning, the effective design of public spaces holds a central role in creating vibrant and culturally diverse environments. Through thoughtful design, ordinary public spaces can be transformed into interactive hubs that facilitate meaningful interactions among people from diverse backgrounds. These spaces, ranging from shopping centers to libraries and community centers, become focal points for intercultural engagement, where diverse micro-communities converge. On the other hand, the cultivation of ethnic communities can also yield benefits. These communities often concentrate resources such as religious congregations, ethnic businesses, and language assistance services, acting as natural hubs for community activities. However, the failure to recognize these dynamics can inadvertently lead to the formation of homogenous groups, inadvertently contributing to segregation. Factors like the clustering of apartment housing, visible minorities, and heightened racial diversity can influence the patterning of low-income neighbourhoods.
- **Ethnic economy development and diversity at workplaces**: Equity in ethnic economic development involves addressing vertical divisions within economic sectors and horizontal concentration within specific activities and occupations. This pertains to equal workplace opportunities regardless of one's background. Commercial activities often reflect cultural beliefs, seen in choices like kosher or vegetarian offerings, which enrich economic diversity with cultural dimensions. Ethnic economies, particularly in enclaves, provide opportunities for minority groups, acting as safe spaces for newcomers to establish themselves. These economies not only offer tailored goods and services but also aid integration and settlement, supporting cultural cohesion. Nurturing small to medium enterprises, ensuring equal opportunities for underrepresented groups, and fostering diversity within larger corporations are all vital for balanced economic growth.

CITY OF SURREY: TACKLING DIVERSITY IN ALL DIRECTIONS

The City of Surrey in Canada serves as an exemplary city that aligns with all aspects of this analytical framework. White et al. (2009) tell the story of a city that was awarded the Cultural Capital of Canada in 2008, a recognition of its dedication to inclusivity, collaboration, and cultural festivities (White et al., 2009).

In the City of Surrey, more than 1000 new residents were settling, more than 35% of the population were visible minorities and the household language is not English. Surrey established the Surrey Multicultural Advisory Committee (MAC) in 2007 after recognizing the need to build cross-cultural community partnerships. This committee played a key role in fostering cultural integration and inclusivity in the city. The key role of the government was well understood by providing funding at various levels and strong political support. With this support, the City of Surrey embarked on several cultural projects and initiatives to promote arts, culture, and intercultural understanding and provided many opportunities for cross-cultural interactions. The projects highlighted specific cultures like stories of the Indigenous Peoples but also had festivals where multicultural events were held which promoted local community organizations as well. The city also engaged youth and senior citizens through programs like Youth Fest and Children's Fest while addressing the isolation of immigrant seniors by bridging language and resource gaps.

The keywords that describe Surrey's initiatives are building partnerships, collaboration, relationships, strategic plan, funding and consistency. The City of Surrey developed a committee that can host and oversee the activities and initiatives that are run by individual and specific associations and groups for their own interests. MAC is a place and funding resource for cultural organizations to turn to. Building partnerships was one of the essential methods of expanding and integrating better with each of the cultural groups. The other factor to success was funding and political support. Political leadership and support from the Mayor and Council which in turn provided sufficient funding, and approval for Surrey Social Plan was in line with the City's vision and mandate of building a stronger community with diversity and inclusivity.

CHAPTER 3.   CASE STUDIES

3.1.   TORONTO, CANADA: MULTICULTURALISM AS ITS IDENTITY

Canada's intricate tapestry of multiculturalism weaves an enduring narrative that proudly stands as a cornerstone of the nation's identity. Canada's history of multiculturalism is one that recognizes, celebrates, and promotes cultural diversity as a defining characteristic of the nation. Toronto is Canada's largest city in population and the most diverse city with 2.7 million residents. The Toronto Census Metropolitan Area (CMA) is made up of 15 surrounding subdivisions including Toronto, Mississauga, Markham, and Richmond Hill. Toronto CMA has nearly 6 million residents and more than 50% of them are visible minorities (Statistics Canada, 2017).

This chapter delves into the profound impact of multiculturalism on the nation's trajectory, casting a spotlight on its role in sculpting the realms of immigration, integration, and social harmony. Multiculturalism in Canada is based on the principle that all citizens are equal, regardless of their cultural or ethnic background. It acknowledges and encourages the preservation and promotion of diverse cultural practices, languages, and traditions.

Canada's approach to urban planning is tied to its commitment to equity and ethnic diversity, creating a multi-tiered framework involving federal, provincial/territorial, and municipal levels of governance. This section delves into the development of government policies and acts addressing equity and diversity, particularly at the federal and municipal levels. It explores the evolution of Canada's multiculturalism policy and immigration acts, and it examines Toronto's proactive measures in integrating newcomers, fostering inclusive spaces, and enhancing economic development through cultural hubs and ethnic neighbourhoods.

3.1.1.   PLANNING PRACTICE: PIONEER IN MULTICULTURALISM POLICY

In Canada, the urban planning framework structure is a multi-tiered governmental structure that involves federal, provincial/territorial, and municipal levels of authority. While urban planning is primarily a provincial and municipal responsibility, some federal influences and guidelines shape the overall framework. Here, in this section, the development of government policies and acts related to equity and diversity are reviewed and discussed.

FEDERAL LEVEL

On a national level, Canada's commitment to multiculturalism and diversity was officially solidified with the adoption of the multiculturalism policy in 1971, followed by the Charter of Rights and Freedoms in 1982, and the Multiculturalism Act in 1988 (Pisco, 2018). Each province also implemented its own equity

and cultural rights provisions, tailoring them to suit the unique needs of their communities. These progressive policies not only shaped the nation's identity but also had a profound impact on urban planning practices, emphasizing the crucial role of the federal government in incorporating ethnic and cultural diversity into city planning. The significance of these policies and their influence on urban planning with a focus on the Multiculturalism Policy of Canada is to be discussed further.

Since Confederation, the immigration policies in Canada have aimed to increase population and establish a financial and labour market for economic development. Prior to the Multiculturalism Policy in 1971, there was the Immigration Act of 1976. This Act fundamentally transformed Canada's immigration rules by implementing a point system for determining entry eligibility. The point system was radically different compared to the previous system which relied much more heavily on place of origin as a decision factor (Anisef & Lanphier, 2003; Pisco, 2018). This change marked a significant shift in immigration policy, fostering a more diverse and inclusive approach to immigration selection.

In 1971, Canada was the very first country to discuss the Multiculturalism Policy under the Liberal Party of Pierre Trudeau. The concepts of equity and justice have been contextualized within the multicultural planning policy and practice (George, 2023). The Multiculturalism Policy aimed to influence various aspects of Canadian society, including education, employment, government services, and the arts. It is to ensure that all individuals, regardless of their background, have equal opportunities and rights while contributing to the overall social, economic, and political fabric of Canada. It has led to the establishment of multiculturalism grants and programs to support initiatives that promote intercultural understanding, preserve cultural heritage, and combat discrimination.

The charter of Rights and Freedoms of 1982 does not explicitly mention multiculturalism however it created a legal framework for individual rights and freedom. The pathway to an inclusive society towards respecting and valuing various cultures and identities has been built. It is exemplified by the rights of Indigenous people and protection over their land, status, and fishing and hunting rights. The Charter is also for the rights of language as Canada is officially a bilingual country. Notable addition to the Charter of Rights was Section 27 which cited "shall be interpreted in a manner consistent with the preservation and enhancement of the multicultural heritage of Canadians. (Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms, 1982)" The section itself did not have specific directives for government action however a growing number of Canadians associated multiculturalism with fundamental Charter rights, such as freedom of expression and religion (Jedwab, 2020).

The concepts of equity and diversity have been contextualized under the policy. However, no concrete actions or notable contributions have been made (George, 2023). There were criticisms of the lack of pluralistic planning despite the early adoption of the Multicultural Policy. There was a lack of structure and support to be able to address the various facets of diversity socially and systematically (Pisco, 2018). As a response, the Employment Equity Act of 1986, and the Multiculturalism Act of 1988 were established. The former Act was aimed to ensure equal opportunities and combat racism in the workplace and played a crucial role in fostering inclusivity and fairness in employment practices. Passing the Multiculturalism Act (Bill C-93) made Canada the first country to pass a national multiculturalism law. The Multiculturalism Act put the Multicultural Policy into law, establishing it as a fundamental characteristic of Canadian heritage and "promote the full and equitable participation of individuals and communities of all origins in the continuing evolution and shaping of all aspects of Canadian society and assist them in the elimination of any barrier to that participation" (Canadian Multiculturalism Act, 1985, s 3 I).   This officially put the Canadian government into action, annual reporting, data collecting, and

further actions taken to ensure all levels of the government are acting towards inclusivity. Furthermore, the Department of Multiculturalism and Citizenship was created to ensure equal opportunity and integration are being implemented (Jedwab, 2020).

Under the roof of the Canadian federal government in Ottawa, the capital of Canada, the multi-disciplinary Federal Family on Community Collaboration gathered more than 40 government employees to examine issues related to place-based initiatives (Federal Family, 2009). This was initiated due to a decline in federal influence and presence and to entertain the idea of open federalism in the local context. The aim of the exercise was to understand and generate discussion on federal roles and responsibilities on local issues. Through these discussions, the governmental structure (horizontal or vertical) and the relationship between public sectors, citizens, private, and organizations impact the outcome.

CITY LEVEL

Given its diversity, Toronto has been responsive in adapting services and government structures to its immigrant and minority population. In comparison with cities within Ontario, Toronto was rated to be responsive to its incoming immigrants and changing demography compared to Mississauga and Markham (GOOD, 2009). Good also highlights that local politics and municipal authorities have an impact on the inclusivity and accessibility of information and services to immigrants as these cities are in the same province. On a city level the City of Toronto, there are Employment Equity Policy (2000), and Toronto's Newcomer Strategy (2022-2026) that fosters diversity and inclusivity and supports immigrants, refugees and underrepresented people.

Toronto's Employment Equity Policy, established in 2000, is a commitment by the City to promote diversity, equity, and inclusivity in its workforce. The policy addresses historical disadvantages faced by certain groups and ensures equal employment opportunities and representation within the city's workforce. The Policy includes guidelines for training and development programs at the workplace to raise awareness, establish a place to discuss, and create an inclusive work culture; implement inclusive recruitment and hiring practices; and actively review and address the diversity ratio (Employment Equity Policy, 2000). The Employment Equity Policy is a step towards creating a more equitable and diverse workforce that reflects the city's multicultural and inclusive values.

Toronto's Newcomer Strategy for 2022-2026, developed by the City of Toronto, serves as a comprehensive blueprint to enhance the settlement and integration journey of newcomers. The strategy's focus lies in providing support to immigrants and refugees as they adapt to life in the city and become active participants in the community (City of Toronto, 2021). This multifaceted approach revolves around five key priorities. The first centers on optimizing newcomers' access to services, conducted by frontline staff training and enhanced communication with community partners. The second priority is directed toward implementing the AccessTO policy, aimed at ensuring undocumented immigrants receive necessary services without apprehension. The third priority emphasizes the creation of a well-being access plan to address essential needs and security concerns. The fourth and fifth priorities are dedicated to addressing systemic barriers through collaborative sectoral efforts and continuous progress monitoring and reporting. The strategy acknowledges the need for data to comprehend service needs, outcomes, and impacts, thereby underlining the significance of ongoing reporting and monitoring. This strategy led to the establishment of Toronto's Newcomer Office (TNO), whose responsibilities and services are discussed in subsequent sections.

3.1.2. SERVICES AND PROGRAMS: DIVERSITY OUR STRENGTH

In Canada, several cities have made efforts to incorporate multiculturalism into their physical urban planning. While determining the city with the best policies, Toronto is consistently regarded as a leader in embracing multiculturalism in urban planning. With its motto of "Diversity Our Strength", Toronto highlights the multicultural essence of the city, encompassing the collaborative efforts of seven municipal governments now unified under the City of Toronto.

WELCOMING NEWCOMERS

Toronto's Newcomers Office (TNO)'s role is a federally funded city-wide Local Immigration Partnership (LIP). The main responsibility is to carry out the priorities and action items outlined in the Newcomers Strategy. TNO offers a range of vital services and programs to facilitate the smooth integration and success of newcomers in the city.

One notable initiative is the Newcomer Leadership Table (NLT), a collaborative committee comprising various organizations, government entities, and community-based sectors, including hospitals, school boards, ministries, and support groups. The 'LT's overarching goal is to address interconnected challenges faced by newcomers and enhance their integration. This includes initiatives like ensuring quality housing to maintain health, as well as facilitating access to childcare and transit, crucial for participation in training, job placements, and language classes. To further streamline newcomer support, the LIPs play a pivotal role. These partnerships, funded by Citizenship and Immigration Canada, foster coordination between non-profit agencies, government bodies, and the for-profit sector. By aligning efforts, they cater to newcomer needs, facilitating settlement processes and improving access to the labour market. There are five LIPs in the city, including a central hub at City Hall, and four quadrant-based branches located on the North, East, West, and South sides of Toronto.

Another significant initiative is the Refugee Settlement Program, which ensures robust support systems are in place for the seamless arrival and settlement of refugees. Additionally, the Communities of Inclusion initiative involves a group of City of Toronto employees serving as a resource for members and allies. This dynamic collective regularly convenes to network, share common identities, and build capacity. Key networks within this framework include the Ambe Maamowisdaa Employee Circle of Indigenous Peoples, Black Staff Network, Employee Disability Network, Pride Network, and Toronto Network of Women.

To champion equity and inclusion in the workforce, the Newcomer Office has also established the Workforce Equity and Inclusion Plan. This strategic initiative strives to achieve diverse representation across all levels of the organization, mirroring the city's population diversity. It also seeks to cultivate a more inclusive workplace culture through strategies such as data-informed decision-making, fostering engagement and inclusion, and integrating an equity lens throughout the employee life cycle.

TORONTO'S INTEGRATION PROGRAMS: EMPLOYMENT, COMMUNITY INITIATIVES, LANGUAGE, HOUSING

The City of Toronto has proactively established dedicated community centers tailored to specific cultural groups, offering a spectrum of resources including language classes, cultural engagements, and vital support services. The city's mentoring in partnership with the Toronto Region Immigrant Employment Council (TRIEC) was launched in 2004. By 2016, this initiative had successfully matched over 13,000 skilled immigrants with 8,000 Canadian mentors across the city, exemplifying the tangible impact of mentorship on immigrant integration (Omidvar, 2017). Additionally, the Mentoring Skilled Immigrants program is a Profession to Professional mentoring initiative within the workforce of the City of Toronto.

This four-month program is designed to establish a professional network by matching Toronto Public Service staff with skilled immigrants. The program's unique feature is its alignment with senior management support, facilitating volunteer participation during work hours. These opportunities are for the communities to congregate, safeguard their cultural heritage, and nurture meaningful social interactions.

Community organizations are the acting agencies on the ground that connect directly with the residents. They can carry out public programs such as neighbourhood improvement programs and recreational activities. Neighbourhood enhancement programs can be initiated by the public sector or by the residents themselves. Toronto spent $46 million on community social services in 2010 and this expenditure includes grants to community programs for underrepresented and minority groups (M. A. Qadeer, 2016). The City's community initiative includes several programs and resident-led projects that can help create active, welcoming and inclusive communities. Notable programs are as follows (City of Toronto, 2023a):

- Toronto for All is an education program to raise awareness against all forms of discrimination and racism. The public campaign supports civic resiliency that adapts the complexity of diversity and turns it into strength.
- Community Funding Program holds various grants to not-for-profit, grassroots and resident-led groups that encourage active participation and leadership. Largely, ethnocultural organizations utilize this fund for their activities and to support their users.
- Community Coordination Plan is in partnership with United Way Greater Toronto in order to communicate and coordinate with more than 400 community organizations. In addition to the 10 geographical clusters, there are Black Resilience Cluster and Newcomer Cluster. This program has been effective during the COVID-19 Pandemic for sharing information regarding vaccines and utilizing the Community Coordination Plan Grant.
- Policing Reform is the city's commitment to fighting racism as they recognize deeply rooted systemic discrimination towards Indigenous, Black and racialized communities. Part of this reform is establishing the Confronting Anti-Black Racism unit to carry out the Toronto Action Plan to Confront Anti-Black Racism. This plan has action items including education and events to push for the cultural shift.

In 1991, the Multilingual Access Program was introduced to enhance communication and accessibility within its public-serving agencies. This program included interpretation services across a range of essential services including public health, ambulance, fire and police services, social services, and housing. In 2002, the city established the central Multilingual Service Unit and introduced the Language Line Service to provide further interpretation and translation services for a more diverse population. In 2020, the program offered 52 languages for oral interpretations and 37 languages for written translations. Building upon this foundation, the city took further strides in 2002 by establishing (M. A. Qadeer, 2016).

The Canadian Radio-television and Telecommunications Commission (CRTC) granted Rogers Media the license to establish a national, multilingual, and multi-ethnic television service. The new service set to launch in 2020, aims to significantly enhance access for Canada's diverse third-language communities to news and relevant programming. The programming will be broadcast in six different third languages, and in English and French for Quebec. Rogers commits to broadcasting at least six hours in Vancouver,

Calgary, Edmonton, and Toronto and a minimum of two hours in Manitoba, Saskatchewan and Atlantic Canada. The focus on ethnic and third-language content, coupled with Canadian programming, seeks to benefit Canada's multicultural population (Canadian Radio-television and Telecommunications Commission (CRTC), 2019).

The government's help in providing services in finding housing can be limited, especially in the time of housing crisis where two out of three renter households were spending more than 30% of their income on rent in the Toronto area (K. H. Choi & Ramaj, 2023; E. Moore & Skaburskis, 2004; The City of Toronto, 2017). Immigrants and newcomers are left to seek housing on their own however, the discrimination towards certain groups of visible minorities puts them at a higher disadvantage. The discrimination occurs regardless of their financial abilities and with that, these certain groups are pushed to the outskirts of the city and in the inaccessible sectors of the city. In turn, this creates residential segregation amongst ethnic groups. One study found that Somali immigrants felt stronger discrimination in comparison to Jamaican or Polish immigrants in Toronto (Dion, 2001). Additionally, many immigrant households fall short of 'core need' based on the Canada Housing and Mortgage Corporation (CHMC) as most of the recent immigrants, and refugees are in this category. Unemployment rates and residence places of choice are also factors that hinder immigrants from finding affordable homes (K. H. Choi & Ramaj, 2023).

The City of Toronto has a number of policies and programs to combat the availability of affordable and accessible housing options that cater to its diverse population. Inclusive Zoning was included in the Official Plan Housing Policy for new developments to include affordable housing near transit stations/hubs. As part of the city's support system, subsidized housing (Rent-Geared-to-Income in Toronto), Housing Allowance, and housing support services. The subsidizing housing is a choice-based system where the renters can choose the location and types of housing based on their needs and rent is dependent on the eligible's income (30% of their income). However, there are two critical limiting factors to this program. The first factor is that the estimated wait time varies between eight to 15 years, depending on the size of the house (bachelor to 3-bedroom apartment) and the second factor is that this is only eligible for Canadian citizens, permanent residents or refugee status (City of Toronto, 2023c).

The CHMC is leading and managing the National Housing Strategy, a $82+ billion dollar (CAD) funding and financial initiative to address the housing challenges and meet diverse housing needs (Canada Mortgage and Housing Corporation (CMHC), 2018). The aim of Canada's first housing strategy is to provide more Canadians with affordable and suitable homes. One of the priority areas includes housing for vulnerable populations where racialized groups and recent immigrants, especially refugees, are considered vulnerable. As such Choi and Ramaj stated that for this strategy to be successful, an accurate assessment needs to be made of which groups and why they have the most barriers to affordable housing (K. Choi & Ramaj, 2022).

3.1.3. PHYSICAL SPACE: CULTURAL HUBS & ETHNIC NEIGHBOURHOODS

Toronto's embrace of multiculturalism is evident in its vibrant neighbourhoods and public spaces. Initiatives like the revitalization programs in Regent Park and Lawrence Heights prioritize housing and community infrastructure, tailored to immigrant populations. Distinct cultural hubs like Chinatown and Little Italy showcase the city's diverse identity. The evolution of neighbourhoods reflects immigration waves, from pre-war Italian, Jewish, and Chinese communities to post-1970 Asian influx. Toronto's public spaces, particularly Nathan Phillips Square, epitomize this diversity, hosting an array of cultural

events. However, challenges in spatial interaction and evolving immigrant dynamics continue to shape Toronto's urban fabric and communal life.

CULTURAL HUBS & NEIGHBOURHOODS

The city has designated certain areas as cultural hubs to promote diversity and community engagement. Examples include Chinatown, Little Italy, Little India, and Greektown, where cultural heritage is celebrated through festivals, markets, and public art installations.

The immigration trend in Toronto started with Italians, Jews, and Chinese pre-war times followed by the European immigrants, mostly Italians, Portuguese and Greeks, in the post-war period from 1945 to 1970. Then in the early 1970s, there were immigrants from Asia, the Caribbean and Africa (Murdie & Teixeira, 2003). The location and types of residential areas that they occupied differed largely due to immigration patterns and the housing types that they lived in.

The first wave of immigrants settled in the city centre area where they formed a community with services, businesses, and cultural institutions that were suitable for them. Over time, these groups moved outside of the city, into the suburbs, still forming a community. This became a segregated resettlement, which happened in many multicultural cities. For example, the Jews and Italians first formed their community in the city centre, near the city hall but moved towards Bathurst St in the north and to Woodbridge and Vaughan area, respectively. While these two groups dispersed in a wider residential area, the Chinese community stayed within their 'Chinatown' where they lived and held their businesses as they faced discrimination and racism. As more Chinese immigrants migrated in the post-war period, several more Chinese enclaves were created in the suburban areas. In today's age, the old Chinatown near Kensington Market and Queen Street is primarily a commercial district and has lost its primal function of being the main hub for the Chinese community(Hou & Garnett, 2004; Murdie & Teixeira, 2003).

During the post-war period, there were a significant number of South Europeans arriving in Canada. The most common immigration type was chain immigration and about 90 % of Italians were estimated to be sponsored by family members. The already established community had helped the incoming immigrants with their settlement and finding homes and jobs. As a result, this had helped with the positive upward in economic and status mobility. These south European immigrants also had an impact on the urban landscape as they had a large emphasis on home ownership(Hou & Garnett, 2004; Murdie & Teixeira, 2003). During this time, Italians and Portuguese people were employed in the construction industry, using their skills in homebuilding. In their ethnic enclaves, Little Italy and Little Portugal, the houses and streets are reflective of the architectural styles, colours and decorations.

The latter immigrant groups arriving post-1970, mostly from Asia located themselves in the outskirts of the city like Etobicoke, North York, and Scarborough, although these cities are now part of the City of Toronto. There were people from Vietnam, Sri Lanka, India, Hong Kong, mainland China, and Taiwan. Lo and Wang explained the convergence and divergence spatial pattern where cultural similarity draws them together (convergence) and economic status and exposure to Western society separated them (divergence) (Lo & Wang, 1997). Groups of immigrants from Africa, Latin America, and the Caribbean were pushed out to the outskirts of the city, as the price of the housing market started to rise, and they had no previous settlers to help integrate them into Canadian society.

Murdie and Teixeira (2003)examine further the housing market, population/immigration increase, financial stability and cultural mindset on homeownership and how they relate to the residential pattern of immigrants. The discussion also continues into the reason why certain immigrant groups are occupied in the city and whether the occupancy in affordable housing has influenced the forming of ethnic neighbourhoods. However, the social implications and social inequality in the city are beyond the scope of this paper.

TORONTO'S ICONIC NATHAN PHILLIPS SQUARE

Toronto has integrated multiculturalism into its public spaces. For instance, Nathan Phillips Square, in front of Toronto City Hall, often hosts cultural events and celebrations representing various communities. Additionally, the City of Toronto actively encourages the inclusion of diverse cultural elements in public art and design.

Nathan Phillips Square is located in front of the City Hall and is one of the most important landmarks and civic public spaces. Toronto's Nathan Philip Square was designed to hold large festivals and events and it hosts cultural events all year around, although heavily concentrated in the summer. There are over 20 festivals that are focused on multiculturalism or highlighting one specific ethnic group or culture (City of Toronto, 2023b). For example, Toronto's Newcomers Day, Taste of the Middle East Summer Fest – Celebrating Arabic Music, Art and Culture (shown in Figure 7), Toronto Caribbean Carnival, Mabuhay Philippines Festival, Mexican Independence Day Celebration, Diwali – Festival of Lights, International Children's Day – Multicultural Dance and Art Festival, and Toronto Diversity Festival. The Square also has the iconic Toronto Sign which had originally been installed for the Toronto 2015 Pan American Games. The Medicine Wheel symbol was added in 2018 to honour Indigenous Peoples and to raise awareness of National Indigenous Peoples Day. Additionally, the vinyl wrap on the sign was designed by a Toronto artist emphasizing the Indigenous culture. The Toronto Sign is heavily visited by Torontonians and tourists with high visibility, and this shows the city's support and recognition of the relationship with Indigenous Peoples.

FIGURE 7: NATHAN PHILLIPS SQUARE DURING THE TASTE OF THE MIDDLE EAST SUMMER FEST (PHOTO CREDIT: AUTHOR, 2023)

Daly examined Nathan Phillips Square and how the public space and its designs influence the city's pluralism and intercultural encounters (Daly, 2021). The revitalization of the square in 2006 focused on decluttering the available open space to make room for large and formal civic events. While this enabled the space to hold the diverse events mentioned above, some criticized the lack of opportunities for interaction on a daily basis. Another reason may be that there is a lack of public and physical amenities such as benches and shade for people to stay and mingle.

3.1.4. ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT: ETHNIC ECONOMY

A culturally diverse city like Toronto has a robust network to serve its varied ethnic audience and the economic performance is proven through financial, educational, and media channels similar to New York and Los Angeles (GOOD, 2009; M. A. Qadeer, 2016). This rich global foundation underpins Toronto's economic ability, with diversity being a cornerstone for city development.

The interaction between consumption preferences and ethnicity fuels the retail landscape. In the scene of food, ethnic cuisines like Italian, Japanese, Chinese, and Indian are seamlessly integrated into the mainstream. Notably, the culinary domain embodies a reciprocal adaptation and influence, as shown by the rise of ethnic restaurants that flourish in tandem with immigrant influx other than the long-term 'ethnic' foods. Asian cuisine like Thai, Vietnamese, and Korean restaurants can be found in all pockets of Toronto. Culinary experience is one of the reasons residents and tourists visit ethnic enclaves. In addition to the foodscape, an ethnic niche is naturally developed from their specific skills such as Chinese herbalists, Cuban cigar-makers, Anglo bankers, and Jewish doctors (M. A. Qadeer, 2016). These establishments are vital to immigrant employment and entrepreneurial opportunities. They are driven by the inherent expertise in their country of origin, fostering a symbiotic relationship across the industry's production, supply, distribution, and service domains.

On the other hand, this cultural knowledge and expertise act as constraints to newly immigrated workers into specific occupations. The available information, resources and nature of networking within the community and the same economic activities are shared amongst those with similar backgrounds. Such trends are evidenced in distinct occupational clusters, such as Filipino nurses, Chinese computer hardware experts, and South Asians, particularly Sikh taxi drivers. Immigrants have fewer opportunities in mainstream job sectors and or in professional industry. One of the factors that limit immigrants is the non-transferrable or hard to transfer skills and knowledge in practice disparities and language barriers, particularly in professional sectors like law, medicine, and engineering. The historical backdrop, marred by discriminatory practices barring non-Europeans from professional roles, perhaps might have set a precedent of a high percentage of immigrants in self-employment.

In the context of Toronto and its surrounding areas, the acknowledgment and planning of ethnic retail neighbourhoods have largely been case-specific rather than guided by an overarching policy directive (Zhuang, 2013). Ethnic economic development is closely related to the fabric of ethnic communities, fueled by cultural knowledge and lifestyle. Typically, the economic clusters are located within the ethnic enclaves with the cultural products and services that are used by that specific culture.

The spatial dynamics of ethnic economic development intertwine with the physical enclaves they form, like malls and plazas. These enclaves, while contributing to urban economies, immigrant integration, and neighbourhood rejuvenation, can also inadvertently cultivate cultural exclusivity and insularity, potentially straining relationships with surrounding communities (Zhuang, 2013). Instances like the Asian-themed malls in Markham, Market Village and Pacific Mall, have sparked debates over insularity

and traffic issues. The propensity for retail owners and shoppers within these locales to communicate predominantly in non-English languages raises questions about community interaction and integration. Such dynamics have, at times, ignited tensions, as exemplified by rifts between Chinese immigrants and existing residents in areas of high immigrant influx, prompting geographical shifts to suburban landscapes (Murdie & Teixeira, 2003; M. A. Qadeer, 2016)

3.1.5. CONCLUSION FOR TORONTO: ETHNIC MOSAIC OF THE WORLD

The urban planning framework in Canada stands as a testament to the nation's commitment to equity and ethnic diversity. This multi-tiered approach from federal to provincial, and municipal levels of authority contributed to the evolution of an inclusive cityscape. Canada's federal policies, rooted in multiculturalism and diversity, have significantly shaped urban planning practices. The Multiculturalism Policy of 1971, and the Multiculturalism Act of 1988 have laid the foundation for inclusive city development. These policies underline the vital role of the federal government in embedding ethnic and cultural diversity within urban planning. Established legislative frameworks at all levels provide a strong foundation that empowers organizations and businesses to actively embrace diversity as well.

While each city within the Greater Toronto Area (GTA) has distinctive policies, the majority of the cities are generally perceived as welcoming and accepting of diversity. Toronto is the most diverse and populous city in Canada, it is at the center and forefront of leading multiculturalism by example. Within the city itself, there are services and programs incorporated to welcome newcomers and integrate immigrants through the Refugee Settlement Program and Multilingual Access Program. One challenge is that the city primarily offers informational support, which may fall short of providing comprehensive assistance. Many immigrants often depend on established residents from their own community for practical and detailed help.

As the immigrant population changes over time and the way people interact in spaces becomes more complex, it's important to keep adapting and being flexible in our approach. Toronto's most iconic public square, Nathan Phillips Square exemplifies multiculturalism's integration into the urban fabric, hosting a wide array of diverse cultural events. Numerous ethnic neighbourhoods within Toronto vividly showcase the city's rich tapestry of ethnic groups and their unique characteristics. These neighbourhoods also narrate the historical movement of these groups across the city and their present settlement patterns. Torontonians and visitors alike are drawn to these ethnic enclaves, enticed by the ethnic cuisine and the distinctive landscape they contribute to the city. These ethnic neighbourhoods and cultural hubs, while fostering economic growth and community integration, also pose questions about exclusivity and inter-community relations.

The growth of ethnic enclaves has fostered the economic progress and diversification of businesses rooted in specific cultures. These contributions encompass specialized markets offering spices, food, and other goods unique to these cultures. While these culturally oriented enterprises have provided newcomers with income opportunities, they have also somewhat confined immigrants to a narrower range of income sources. Certain skills, such as Cuban cigar makers and Chinese herbalists, were distinct to their respective cultures. However, professionals requiring certifications faced challenges as their qualifications often didn't directly translate into Canadian practice. As a result, many immigrants resorted to launching their own businesses, which, although supportive of their livelihood, posed obstacles to seamless workplace integration within the broader society.

Canada's urban planning ethos, rooted in principles of equality and ethnic diversity, presents a valuable blueprint for crafting vibrant, inclusive, and inviting cities. Overall, in both Canada and Toronto, diversity is deeply ingrained as a positive and widely accepted aspect. Especially in Toronto, the welcoming attitude is owed to visible minorities being the majority and the attitude extends beyond Toronto's borders to neighbouring cities. As the Greater Toronto Area continues to experience urban expansion and embrace diverse populations each city influences one another's approaches. The lessons learned emphasize the implementation of policies on all levels, the translation of these policies into actionable measures, and the collection of data to measure enhancements. These combined efforts ensure the creation of spaces that not only celebrate diversity but also foster community engagement and integration, setting a strong example for the future.

3.2.   LONDON, THE UNITED KINGDOM: COMMONWEALTH NATION TO GLOBAL NATION

London as a whole has a long history of immigration, which has contributed to its multicultural fabric. As a major part of London, the City of London has benefited from this diversity, with individuals from different cultural, ethnic, and national backgrounds living and working in the area.

London is renowned for being one of the most culturally diverse cities in Europe, if not globally. This diversity is a product of two significant waves of immigration: the first occurred during the 1950s and 60s, primarily from Commonwealth countries, and the second in the 1990s, involving individuals from Europe, Africa, and the Middle East (Goodhart, 2004). Today, London's immigrant population is a blend of individuals from Commonwealth nations, refugees and migrants from the World Wars, labour migrants from southern Europe, and students and workers from EU countries. While the urban areas, particularly London, pride themselves in this vibrant diversity, rural regions strongly emphasize a distinctly British identity (Fincher et al., 2014). This influx of individuals from around the world, driven by diverse circumstances, has yielded economic, social, and political challenges for these populations.

The makeup of London's population highlights its diversity. As of 2021, London's population stood at 8.797 million (Greater London Authority, 2022). Britain's most concentrated city with the migrant population is London with approximately 37% of the population born outside of the UK, which compares with 14% for the UK as a whole (García & Duncan, 2022; Sturge, 2023, p.25). Based on Benton-Short's index of total immigration index, London is placed fifth globally which factors in measures of absolute and relative foreign-born immigrants and their relative immigration factors (Benton-Short, Price, & Friedman, 2004). The specific nationalities of the immigrants are an important factor for England. The ethnicity of the citizens was first included in the 1991 Population Census. The most populous ethnicities are from India, Poland, Pakistan, and Romania. There has been a recent surge from Romania which increased close to 600% from 2021 to 2022 (Sturge, 2023, p.25). England's immigrant age range is relatively young, with a median age of 35 and its impact on the economic sector is discussed in the later chapter (García & Duncan, 2022).

In terms of ethnicity, 46% are non-white, falling into the Asian, black, and mixed categories. Of those, Black Africans and Indians are the highest majority close to 7.9% and 7.5% of London's population, respectively (Office for National Statistics, 2022). Despite London's remarkable diversity, 'Britain-ness' is recognized to be strong in some parts of the city. This, in turn, caused Britain to view diversity as a problem to be solved rather than an opportunity to be seized. Commission for Racial Equality conducted a study in 2004 that found that 94% of the white population had few or no friends from different ethnic

groups and that 39% of the young population under 30 mostly have their friends within the same race (Wood et al., 2006).

In summary, London stands as an undeniable melting pot of cultures, evident through its demographic composition representing a rich tapestry of nationalities and ethnicities. However, a deeper examination of inter-ethnic relationships and population dynamics uncovers a more intricate reality beneath the façade of this bustling cosmopolitan center.

3.2.1. PLANNING PRACTICES: INTERCULTURALISM AS THE GUIDING STAR

At both the national and city levels in the United Kingdom, strategies and policies have been developed to foster cultural integration. Nationally, policies and Acts are set to provide a framework for local authorities to adhere to, focusing on prohibiting discrimination and recognizing diverse identities. In London, the Greater London Authority (GLA) plays a vital role in promoting diversity and inclusion through initiatives such as the Inclusive London strategy, ensuring policies cater to the diverse needs of the city's population and reflecting its multicultural character shaped by historical influences, demographics, and economic opportunities.

NATIONAL LEVEL

In the United Kingdom, the task of fostering cultural integration is primarily entrusted to local governments and communities. On a national scale, there are several significant equity policies in place, which boroughs can adopt and implement according to their own mandates. The national government introduced the Race Relations Act in 1976, followed by the Equality Act in 2010, providing the framework for local authorities to adhere to.

The Race Relations Acts of 1968 and 1976 were first introduced to establish a legal structure to prohibit discrimination and promote recognition of unique religious and cultural identities within public institutions. Throughout the 1990s, Britain held the belief that it had established a balancing society where both minority and majority ethnic groups of people were provided with equitable opportunities. Nevertheless, incidents targeting black individuals and communities began to emerge, shedding light on a systemic problem of "institutional racism" within the police force and the criminal justice system. This revelation prompted a significant re-evaluation of strategies in various public institutions, including educational services (Wood & Landry, 2008). Additionally, community groups and NGOs such as religious groups took on a larger role in providing services due to the government's approach and the changing focus on religion as a key factor in diversity in British society, potentially alongside or even more than ethnicity and race (Fincher et al., 2014).

During the early 2000s, the United Kingdom faced introspection about their national identity and the integration of immigrants into their society. Various strategies were considered and studied, including assimilation into a unified British culture or acknowledging and honouring distinct cultures (Wood & Landry, 2008). The Prime Minister at the time, Tony Blair who served from 1997 to 2007, declared that within 10 to 20 years no one in the United Kingdom would be disadvantaged by where they live (Bradford, 2009, p.15). The idea of interculturalism emerged when they opted to shift attention from the cultural differences dividing the nation to the shared common ground that united it. The UK aimed to evolve beyond its Commonwealth heritage and transform into a genuinely globalized society. Then came the Equality Act in 2010 to strengthen and acknowledge diversity. This comprehensive legislation consolidates and strengthens previous anti-discrimination laws. The Act provides a legal framework to protect individuals from discrimination and promote equality and diversity. It prohibits discrimination on

various grounds, including race, ethnicity, and nationality, in various areas such as employment, education, and provision of services.

Today, several organizations and units are dedicated to formulating strategies and policies pertaining to equality and diversity in the United Kingdom. The Government Equality Office (GEO) is a governmental department entrusted with promoting equality and combatting discrimination in various realms, including cultural diversity and ethnicity. It holds the responsibility for shaping equality strategies and policies across the UK. Furthermore, the Equality and Human Rights Commission (EHRC) was founded in 2007 as an independent body to uphold and enforce equality and human rights laws, encompassing nine safeguarded characteristics such as race and religion (gov.uk, n.d.). Additionally, the Commission on Race and Ethnic Disparities (CRED) is a UK Government body supported by the Cabinet Office's Race Disparity Unit (BBC, 2020; Commission on Race and Ethnic Disparities, 2021). It was established in 2020 in response to the Black Lives Matter protests after George Floyd's tragic death.

CITY LEVEL

The Greater London Area comprises 32 Boroughs and the City Corporation, each of which has assumed the task of formulating tailored policies and strategies to address the specific ethnic and racial composition within their regions. The Greater London Authority (GLA) acts as the connecting entity between these Boroughs and the central national government.

The Mayor of London and the Greater London Authority (GLA) have taken an active role in promoting diversity and multiculturalism within the city. The GLA has established strategies and initiatives to address issues of inequality, discrimination, and social inclusion. Through the GLA Staff Charter, Code of Ethics and Standards for Staff, they emphasize fairness and integrity, aiming to create a safe working environment free from discrimination. Their focus is on ensuring that policies, programs, and services cater to the diverse needs of London's population. The Diversity and Inclusion Management Board within the GLA supervises and implements the Mayor's Inclusive London strategy, Equality, Diversity and Inclusion (EDI) Strategy, and Equality Act 2010, with yearly updates provided through the Mayor's Equality Report. The Mayor's Equality, Diversity and Inclusion Strategy outlines the Greater London Authority's commitment to promoting equality, diversity, and inclusion across all its activities and services.

The multicultural character of London is shaped by a combination of factors, including historical influences, demographic changes, economic opportunities, and wider policies implemented at the city level.

3.2.2. SERVICES AND PROGRAMS: CHANGING TIDES FOR UNITY

The City of London is committed to providing a comprehensive array of services and amenities to meet the needs of both its residents and visitors. These services encompass healthcare facilities, educational institutions, and recreational venues, all designed to accommodate the diverse requirements of the multicultural population.

The Greater London Authority (GLA) has developed a user-friendly online mapping service known as the "Mayor of London's Map of Services for Migrants, Refugees, and Newly Arrived Communities." This digital tool streamlines the process of locating essential services. It covers a wide spectrum of service categories including employment opportunities, language support, healthcare, housing assistance, immigration guidance, religious institutions, social group events, welfare benefits, and mental health

support. Notable institutions featured on the map include the Refugee Community Kitchen, Waterloo Community Counselling, Hongkongers in Britain, Youth Legal, Southwest London Law Centres, and Islington Bangladeshi Association. Interestingly, while migrants may not always require or utilize the available public services in the same manner, the diversity in service needs does exert pressure on the government to introduce new provisions. This includes services like language assistance and social security programs, addressing the evolving requirements of the dynamic immigrant population.

While migrants do not require or utilize available public services, the types of public services are different and that puts pressure on the government to add new services such as language help and social security programs. Research indicates that ethnic groups with pre-existing community networks find it easier to integrate into society, as these networks facilitate the exchange of information. Conversely, those without a well-established community tend to rely on government-provided services and programs for support.

LANGUAGE

The Greater London Authority (GLA) provides information regarding language classes, specifically English for Speakers of Other Languages (ESOL). The institutions with these classes are shown on the online maps or listed based on individual preferences, aiming to cater to diverse needs. The primary objective of these language courses is to facilitate various aspects of daily life, from employment opportunities to interactions with medical professionals and neighbours.

However, the uptake of ESOL classes is often hindered by constraints such as time availability and financial limitations. Recognizing this challenge, London has taken proactive steps to address the issue by offering information about different funding options. The allocation of funds is typically contingent upon factors such as immigration status and income levels. However, specific details regarding funding availability, waiting periods, and the ease of accessing such funding are not provided.

In essence, the GLA presents a platform where individuals can explore ESOL classes based on their preferences, underlining their relevance in enhancing employability and promoting effective communication for everyday tasks. Nonetheless, the consideration of time and financial factors remains a crucial consideration, and London's effort to provide information on funding options demonstrates a commitment to overcoming these barriers.

DISCRIMINATION AND OUTSIDERS

Long-term residents of Britain, particularly in rural areas, often exhibit a stronger attachment to their sense of 'Britishness.' Interviews conducted by Wood et al. (2006), with community innovators revealed that instances of racism were more prevalent among individuals of mixed backgrounds or refugees. However, these individuals noted that their experiences of racism were more prominent during their earlier years and acknowledged positive shifts over time.

Despite the growing efforts to curb racism in public spaces, only a minority of these innovators are connected to mainstream institutions. This suggests that they still face a perception of being significant outsiders. This might be attributed to the limited opportunities for intercultural innovation within formal establishments, as well as the gradual progress of these institutions in achieving diversity in their staff composition.

FESTIVALS

The City of London hosts various cultural institutions, museums, art galleries, and theatres that contribute to its multicultural atmosphere. These institutions often showcase diverse artistic and cultural expressions, fostering cross-cultural understanding and appreciation.

Festivals have also been used to turn around a stigma and the public's outlook on newcomers. In Sighthill in Glasgow, the police department leads the Sighthill International Festival after an incident against an asylum seeker. (Hickman et al., 2008) Also in Leicester, an interview showed that the Caribbean festival has been a place to meet new people from all backgrounds. There has also been some criticism towards the effectiveness of the festivals. Fincher et al., (2014) criticized that funding for intercultural understanding and education, and cultural diversity is only shown through festivals rather than programs for equity.

London's iconic Trafalgar Square has a rich history of hosting significant celebrations and events. Situated in the heart of the city, it stands as London's most renowned square. Notably, 2023 marks a significant milestone as it hosts its first-ever festival celebrating black culture, known as "Black on the Square." This event will feature art, fashion, music, and food stalls, fostering and showcasing the talents of the black creative community (Greater London Authority, 2023c; Smyth, 2020).

Trafalgar Square has also been a venue for a diverse array of cultural events, including the Diwali Festival, Eid Festival of Light, Vaisakhi, St George's Day, Chanukah, and Pride. London's cultural fabric further weaves through events like Carnaval del Pueblo, Dragon Boat Festival, and the London Halal Food Festival, often held in distinct neighbourhoods across the city. For instance, the Lunar New Year celebration takes place in Soho's Chinatown, Naija in the Park, a Nigerian festival, is hosted in Finsbury Park, and Oktoberfest, a German festival, unfolds at Millwall on the Isle of Dogs.

FIGURE 8: NOTTING HILL CARNIVAL IN LONDON (LOVEMAX, 2012)

A notable event is the Notting Hill Carnival shown in Figure 8, one of the world's largest street festivals, dedicated to celebrating Black British and African Caribbean culture. This vibrant carnival attracts people of various backgrounds to revel in reggae and Afrobeat music while savouring Caribbean cuisine. The carnival exemplifies the pride of London's Black British community and underscores their profound presence in the city.

3.2.3. PHYSICAL SPACE: SENSE OF BELONGING THROUGH COMFORT AND KNOWLEDGE

Exploring the connection between physical spaces and multicultural planning, two study cases and one program are described. These three cases highlight the use of public spaces and people interacting within can heighten their sense of belonging.

Hickman et al. (2008) examined the relationship between place and belonging, highlighting the impact of social interventions, public spaces, and events on enhancing social cohesion. The study found that the local environment significantly influenced the interaction between long-time and new residents, with satisfaction related to convenience, safety, neighbourliness, and social mobility playing a crucial role. The study emphasized the importance of maintaining existing local establishments alongside welcoming new ones, as places, where people are familiar, can aid newcomers in integrating into the community. For instance, Kilburn in London exemplifies this multicultural integration through its ethnic restaurants and shops on Kilburn High Street (Hickman et al., 2008).

Visser's work examines the concept of belonging in relation to a place, particularly among young people in Tottenham, emphasizing both formal aspects such as citizenship and personal feelings of acceptance through daily interactions. Secure and welcoming public spaces are noted to enhance social interactions for immigrants. The study underscores that while formal belonging matters, feeling welcomed in daily activities holds equal importance, shaping identity and community placement (Colombo, 2010).

London Unseen is a collection of trails, heritage tours and events to showcase the history of the city, curated by the Commission for Diversity in the Public Realm. It includes over 20 community heritage practitioners who present projects discussions and educational events. An example of events includes Untold Stories which are guided walks around heritage sites such as "a 'walk of fame' celebrating the role of Irish and Pakistani workers in Cricklewood; a new mural in Croydon created by and for learning disabled artists; and new walking tours that offer a homeless perspective of London's streets (Greater London Authority, 2023b) ".

3.2.4. ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT: CLOSING IN THE GAPS

The City of London is a global financial center that attracts professionals from around the world. Its economic opportunities draw individuals from diverse cultural backgrounds, contributing to its multiculturalism. Diverse immigrants mean a diverse workforce available.

An impact study on the London economy (Gordon et al., 2007) highlights both quantitative and qualitative benefits brought by recent immigrants. It reveals a wage disparity between immigrants and Londoners, as migrants from less developed countries often find themselves in lower-paying or lower-status occupations. The influx of migrants willing to engage in lower-paid sectors has contributed to wage elasticity, particularly in less stable industries like construction and hotels. However, this initial trend tends to balance out over time, narrowing the gap between immigrants and Londoners with similar educational and experiential backgrounds. The stabilization over time shows that the migrants need stepping stones to reach their full potential. This dynamic, while beneficial for market competitiveness, can hinder upward economic mobility for employees.

The pay gap among different racial groups has yielded varied findings. A recent study (Commission on Race and Ethnic Disparities, 2021) indicated that employees from the White Irish, Indian, and Chinese ethnic groups exhibit higher average hourly earnings than the White British group, possibly indicating ethnic minorities' advancement in professional and occupational fields, aligning with the relatively

youthful migrant age group in the UK (García & Duncan, 2022; Office for National Statistics (ONS), 2022). However, disparities persist, with lower employment rates for Black individuals (69%), and Pakistani and Bangladeshi groups (56%) compared to White British (77%) and Indian (76%) groups (Commission on Race and Ethnic Disparities, 2021, p. 108). These findings collectively reflect a shifting landscape in London's economic sector, driven by younger, better-educated migrants who are progressively realizing their career potential.

3.2.5. CONCLUSION FOR LONDON: A NEW AGE OF INTERCULTURALISM

London has witnessed the implementation of both national and municipal regulations aimed at fostering racial equality and minimizing discrimination. Particularly noteworthy is the shift towards interculturalism in the city, a response to the significant migrant population residing within the city. London's immigrant community encompasses individuals from Commonwealth nations, refugees and migrants who arrived during the World Wars, labour migrants originating from southern Europe, and students and workers hailing from various EU countries. The government has taken proactive measures to address these challenges and is displaying a dedicated resolve to combat discrimination. While Britain's government has taken the intercultural approach when dealing with diversity, interviews show that Britain's are taking the approach of an assimilationist perspective intertwined with a strong emphasis on British identity. Thus, the government has pushed harder for the concept of interculturalism, reflecting a shift from tolerance to active interaction and understanding among diverse cultural groups. The age range of recent immigrants in London tends to be younger and among the younger generation, they demonstrate a more inclusive attitude.

The impact of migrants in London has primarily been on the economic front, which is understandable given London's historical status as Europe's financial hub. Notably, various immigrant groups have experienced distinct patterns of discrimination and disadvantage. In terms of the labour market, individuals from China and India tend to outperform their white counterparts, while Black individuals, as well as those from Pakistani and Bangladeshi backgrounds, face significant hurdles. This disparity is pervasive across deprived neighbourhoods, underscoring the government's imperative to address income inequalities based on ethnicity and residential areas. Interestingly, there appears to be a gradual economic equilibrium emerging over time, particularly in London.

Festivals play a crucial role in promoting openness to other cultures. These occasions provide opportunities for people to engage with and understand different cultural practices. Despite the challenges posed by ethnic enclaves, London's evolving demographic landscape and the active participation of the younger generation offer hope for greater integration and understanding in the future.

For long-time settlers, there are services and programs available, such as language courses and funding, however, people often remain within their ethnic bubbles and are not aware to utilize these resources. Similar to Toronto, the prevalence of culturally specific grocery stores, food offerings, and religious practices in specific areas is a reflection of demand but also contributes to reinforcing isolation.

Efforts are directed towards encouraging immigrants to integrate into British society, although the lack of a cohesive understanding of what that entails, coupled with geographical segregation, poses challenges.

3.3.   SINGAPORE, SINGAPORE: MULTIRACIAL, MULTICULTURAL, MULTILINGUAL

Singapore is a small city-state, located at the southern tip of the Malay Peninsula in Southeast Asia. It is known for its remarkable economic success, cultural diversity, and modern urban landscape. Singapore's urban planning is completed as a unitary government.

The country's demographic composition has led to it being characterized as multiracial. Singaporean's ethnical racial group is mostly comprised of Chinese backgrounds. The population is composed of approximately 75% Chinese, 15% Malay, 7% Indian, and 3% from other minority groups (Department of Statistics, 2021, p.7; Fincher et al., 2014, p.13).

The makeup of the ethnic groups relates to the historical background. During British colonial rule, ethnic groups were segregated, impeding interaction and mutual understanding. In 1822, segregation was divided into four districts: Europeans and merchants in the European Town, Chinese into the Chinese Kampong, Malays in Kampong Glam and Geylang Serai, and Indians in Serangoon and Sembawang (Bella, 2017; Global-Is-Asian, 2019; Goh, 2017). The district at the time is shown in Figure 9. The typical occupations varied by race: Malays as fishermen and policemen in the rural economy, Chinese in trade and entrepreneurship, and Indians as physical labourers in plantation and infrastructure labourers (Bella, 2017).

FIGURE 9: SEPARATED DISTRICTS OF CHINESE, INDIANS, EUROPEANS AND MALAYS IN SINGAPORE (SCREENSHOT FROM THE CNA VIDEO (CHANNEL NEWS ASIA (CNA), 2021A)

Physical and social segregation continued after the colonial era. In 1964 and 1969, Singapore witnessed racial riots, between Malay and Chinese, that informed the significance of addressing potential fault lines related to race and religion. Singaporean leaders recognized the need and the value of meritocracy and equality. Following its separation from Malaysia, the country incorporated equality of all citizens regardless of race, language, or religion in its policies and regulations.

3.3.1. PLANNING PRACTICES: USING THE RACE SYSTEM FOR INTEGRATION

Singapore took a strict approach to maintaining social order and harmony. To systematically integrate diverse people within Singapore, a race system from the British colonial period continued (Ang & Stratton, 1995). Each citizen fell into the race category of Chinese, Malay, Indian or Others. Although born in Singapore, the following generations also had to be registered based on their father's race (Fincher et al., 2014). A social construct has been in place since the inception of the race system. This unspoken hierarchical system was carried on from colonial times based on their occupations, where the Chinese were at the top of the food chain, Indians then Malay (Ang & Stratton, 1995; R. Q. Moore, 2000). The impacts of the race system are to be discussed further as it is embedded in the housing and income status of the residents.

Since its independence, Singapore focused on growing as a new united country, particularly in economic development, education, and nation-building. In the beginning, the country faced a range of issues, including high unemployment rates, inadequate housing, and a lack of infrastructure. Singapore's first prime minister, Lee Kuan Yew (LKY) transformed and shaped the country through comprehensive policies. He prioritized industrialization to reduce unemployment, initiated public housing programs to address inadequate housing, and invested in building strong infrastructure, including roads and utilities, to drive economic growth and urban development. Recognizing Singapore being a port city, LKY fostered strong international diplomatic ties to build the country into a thriving global financial and commercial centre.

HDB ETHNIC INTEGRATION POLICY (EIP)

Housing and Development Board (HDB) is a government body that was developed in 1960 to provide affordable public housing during times of housing shortage. The objectives of the public housing program were not only to provide housing but also to create a vibrant community, bond within the community and increase homeownership (L. L. Sim et al., 2003). Currently, approximately 80% of the population lives in HDB housing (Channel News Asia (CNA), 2021b; Singapore Department of Statistics, 2022). In 1989, HDB introduced the Ethnic Integration Policy (EIP) to ensure a balanced mix of different ethnic groups within each HDB block and neighbourhood, preventing the formation of racial enclaves. A government body, HDB controls a large portion of the housing market and EIP aims to ensure that public housing blocks reflect the national ethnic distribution. The ethnic enclaves structured from the colonial past led to racial segregation. The EIP's goal was to break these segregated communities and foster racial harmony and integration. The policy mandates that each HDB block must have a quota for residents from different ethnic groups to implement racial mixing (Ang & Stratton, 1995; Fincher et al., 2014; SG101, 2023c; Traulevicz, 2013). This means that a specific percentage of residents in a block must be from various racial backgrounds. For instance, if a block reaches its quota for a particular ethnic group, the available unit is not able to be rented or sold to that group, preventing an over-concentration of any one ethnicity (Fincher et al., 2014; Global-Is-Asian, 2019).

This integration strategy is seen as a fundamental element in Singapore's multiracial success. It was able to dissolve ethnic ghettos and provide a place where children and residents could intermingle with other groups of ethnicities. The foundational idea was by promoting cohabitation among various racial groups, the policy dismantled ethnic enclaves and laid the groundwork for a socially integrated society (Benner, 2016; Global-Is-Asian, 2019). Naturally, students mixed at schools as well, and individuals from different ethnic backgrounds have the opportunity to interact, learn about various cultures, and contribute to Singapore's unique meritocratic system.

While the EIP has contributed to Singapore's racial harmony, it has faced some criticism. Three decades of implementation, mixed outcomes were shown (L. L. Sim et al., 2003). The concentration of races still prevailed although the EIP's ethnic ratio in housing was fulfilled. These clusters coincided with the previous ethnic enclaves. Global in Asia (2019) outlines these clusters: Bedok and Tampines with higher Malay populations, Bishan East and Marymount with the Chinese population, and Kampong Java with the Indian population. There is another correlation with these ethnic clusters, which is the housing prices. This phenomenon all results in the higher income people living within a similar neighbourhood and with that it is hard to say that the ethnic ghetto has fully disappeared. When the neighbourhood is deemed unpleasant to live in, the resale of the housing becomes harder. This becomes a burden to those looking to move out and sell their houses in certain areas since HDB does not buy back any flats that are not sold (Global-Is-Asian, 2019). Equality within the housing market is a prominent subject of concern for both residents and regulators. Interviews with people from minority ethnic groups have expressed reservations regarding the EIP policy, utilizing the policy's objectives as a justification for rejecting minority groups (Channel News Asia (CNA), 2021b; Explained with Dom, 2022; Vice Asia, 2021b). There are no feasible methods to prove this speculation as landlords' responses consist of 'not suitable', and the ultimate decision is made by the landlords and real estate agents.

A new flow of immigrants adds another layer of complexity to the housing crisis. The two streams of migrants are foreign talents and foreign workers (Channel News Asia (CNA), 2021b; Hudson, 2017). Foreign talents are highly educated and wealthy immigrants and foreign workers are transnational physical workers. The wealthy immigrants, typically from India, Taiwan, China, Australia, and Europe, are clustered in the private housing complexes, and physical labourers are often residing at the company's work residence close to their work sites. This not only separates them spatially but creates a class divide. With increasing migrants and expat communities, nearly 30% of the population in 2021 (Singapore Department of Statistics, 2022), HDB adapted new quotas on HDB blocks to reflect the demography.

The HDB's public housing initiative is one of the fundamental policies in Singapore's path to becoming a successful global nation. By strategically co-locating diverse racial groups, Singapore aimed to foster mutual understanding and cohesive communities. While the architectural design of these HDB flats plays a pivotal role, in today's society, evolving Singaporean's perspectives on race, coupled with increased immigration, have raised questions about the effectiveness of the Ethnic Integration Policy.

EDUCATION

Schools play a significant role in students' lives, serving as institutions to not only impart education but also preserve cultural practices and racial identities. While initially managed by religious and ethnic associations, the emergence of secular schools focused on promoting social mixing and equality among students as well (Khoo, 2017). These schools adopted English as the primary language and followed a standardized curriculum (Goh, 2017). Following the bilingual policy, students learned Mandarin, Tamil, or Malay depending on their ethnic background. The practice of attending schools within their residential areas was highly encouraged and further mirrored the diverse composition of EIP-influenced HDB flats, facilitating natural interaction and camaraderie among children of different races.

Racial Harmony Day is on July 21 every year. Singapore celebrates its multiracial nation at events organized by schools, religious groups and grassroots organizations (Ying & Han, 2004). It initially began due to the racial riots in 1964 and the day is to commemorate the history and to strengthen the ties between people. The celebration idea was initiated by the Ministry of Education to educate about race and concepts such as accepting diversity and building together a prosperous nation.

Secondary schools in Singapore typically offer three streams: Express Course, Normal Academic (NA), and Normal Technical (NT). Although students are initially placed based on a standardized test, the final allocation is determined among teachers, parents, and students. As depicted in the Pride Over Prejudice documentary (Manley, 2021), some degree of segregation among students was evident. Express students were predominantly Chinese, while NA and NT students were mostly of Indian and Malay descent (Fincher et al., 2014). Students perceived limited opportunities for interaction even within the same school, and there was a sense that Express students held a higher status. These observations were reinforced by parents' differing expectations for their children's education. Interviews with secondary students highlighted that Malay parents had lower academic expectations, whereas Chinese students faced higher pressure from their parents to excel academically.

Being a small city with limited resources, Singapore's rapid progress has fostered a highly competitive culture. Consequently, students undergo frequent testing and categorization. While this approach has contributed to academic advancement, the need for equity in the education system appears more crucial than mere equality.

3.3.2. SERVICES AND PROGRAM: COMMUNITY IS STRENGTH

The Singaporean approach to public services is to set the stage for neighbours to create their own communities. Communities are drawn up based on peoples' interests, religion and location so residence. While many countries have racism and ethnical discrimination embedded in their Human Rights Act, Singapore strictly enforces their Penal Code. This section shows the level of authority by policies and the relationship between its citizens.

ANTI DISCRIMINATION SYSTEM

Singapore emphasizes a meritocratic system that evaluates individuals based on their skills and accomplishments, rather than their cultural or racial backgrounds. This core principle is embedded in various facets of society, from education, and employment, to governance. The country upholds stringent measures against discrimination rooted in race and ethnicity, aligning with principles of equal treatment and individual rights. To ensure the effective implementation of these principles, Singapore's Penal Code s. 298 prohibits the intentional use of language to offend the religious or racial sentiments of any individual (Uttering Words, Etc., with Deliberate Intent to Wound the Racial Feelings of Any Person, 1871). This legal provision serves to prevent the dissemination of speech that could potentially fuel religious or racial tensions, emphasizing the nation's commitment to maintaining harmony and unity.

Instances of racism have been notably prevalent in recent times, garnering public attention (SG101, 2023a). One such incident involved Preetipls, a Singaporean comedian of Indian descent, who received a two-year conditional warning from the government for posting a video critiquing the Chinese community (Vice Asia, 2021a). Preetipls raised concerns about this regulation, contending that it had inadvertently stifled discussions on racism, particularly in public domains. She advocated for open conversations to foster a better understanding of diverse experiences and perspectives. Interviews conducted by Vice further revealed that the younger generation of Singaporeans is less fixated on the racial hierarchy. This highlights a disconnect between the government's emphasis on racial harmony and the everyday experiences of residents. It raises criticism about whether the term "multiracial" serves as a mere buzzword, creating an illusion of ethnic cohesion. Placing continued emphasis on racial categories might inadvertently contribute to further division.

COMMUNITY CENTRES & VOLUNTEERING

Singapore actively promoted building relationships through volunteering and building ownership by giving back to the community. One of the initiatives is the Community Development Councils (CDCs). CDCs organize events and programs that encourage residents to participate in community activities regardless of their ethnic or cultural backgrounds (Community Development Council, 2023). These events foster interaction, understanding, and friendship among people from different communities. Within each housing block, HDB built community centres which held cultural events. Cultural events focus on providing activities that people can enjoy together and interact with one another (Goh, 2017). Traditional dances, sports, and festival celebrations were received well, and clubs and societies were created based on requests and needs. Many of the events were organized by the residents themselves. Thought volunteering, the residents began to take ownership of their residence and made interacting with people of different backgrounds more natural. These ethnic self-organized groups were part of the en bloc redevelopment to stimulate energy and motivation for residents to gather. This was part of the Estate Renewal Strategy in the 1990s. Sim et al. (2003) noted that the longer a resident stayed in their town, the more neighbours they knew and the deeper their relationships formed. HDB used this knowledge to redevelop and enhance certain living quarters.

SETTLEMENT SERVICES

Grassroots Organizations (GROs) were developed to encourage resident participation in community relations. GROs' main key role was to act as the middleman between community organizations and the government. There were several committees within each constituency which oversaw at least one community centre or a club. There were groups and committees that catered to the ethnic, religious group, or vulnerable groups such as women, elders and children, depending on the need within the area (L. L. Sim et al., 2003). Located within the HDB, GROS was the microcosm of the Singaporean ethnic, religious, language, cultural and income groups.

LANGUAGE

As mentioned above, in the education section, Singapore's education system promotes bilingualism, with English as the primary language of instruction and mother tongue languages, Mandarin, Malay, and Tamil, taught as second languages. This approach aims to maintain cultural ties with ancestral languages while providing a common language for communication and integration (Ang & Stratton, 1995). The language of business and administration was assigned English as a common language to bridge the gap between ethnicities. This has put some elderly Singaporeans and immigrants into some grievances as they were not as fluence in English.

3.3.3.   PHYSICAL SPACE: COMFORTABLE PLACES TO GATHER

HDB BLOCK DESIGNS – VOID DECKS

When first implementing HDB blocks, the aim was to bring people together. Thus, the physical layout of these blocks incorporates communal spaces, such as void decks, common areas, and everyday retail shops that encourage social interaction.

The shared spaces and common facilities such as playgrounds, gardens, and seating areas naturally facilitate casual encounters and engage in recreational activities. A stronger community fabric is believed to be built on neighbourly interactions to build relationships.

FIGURE 10: A GROUP OF ELDERS PLAYING CHESS AND A MALAY WEDDING AT THE VOID DECK (NATIONAL HERITAGE BOARD, 2013)

One key design of HDB is the void deck, deliberately designed as an open space on the ground floor for various social and recreational activities. Serving as a natural meeting point, the void deck offers a venue for children's play under the watchful eyes of neighbours, organized gatherings, natural encounters, and moments of fresh air. It accommodates community-wide meetings, religious assemblies, and personal interactions, becoming a hub of interaction creating and enhancing local dynamics (CNA, 2014; Housing & Development Board, 2019; Ministry of National Development, 2019). In addition to void decks, HDB blocks encompass common corridors and playgrounds, acting as catalysts for community interaction and racial integration. These shared spaces offer myriad opportunities for people of varying backgrounds, ages, and ethnicities to come together, fostering a sense of unity and understanding.

Some void decks also serve practical functions such as housing bike racks, mailrooms, or recreational amenities like chess and ping pong tables. This space also evolved into an information hub, hosting bulletin boards that display advertisements and local news. Furthermore, active void decks facilitate constant supervision of children's play activities. While each void deck for each block follows a similar blueprint that gives comfort, its uniqueness is shaped by the specific needs of the residents it serves.

Void decks play a pivotal role in nurturing community bonds and fostering racial harmony. Their versatile nature is evident in their use for children's libraries, playgrounds, hosting Chinese funerals, Malay weddings, art exhibitions, and prayer areas (National Heritage Board, 2013). An illustrative instance involves the adaptation of a void deck by the Muslim community that uses them for daily prayers, consolidating their faith practice. This has been especially helpful for elders by improving mobility when mosques are not conveniently located (RICE Media, 2023).

ETHNIC COMMUNITY

Singapore's ethnic communities have historically clustered geographically and culturally. Mainly, three areas, Chinatown, Little India, and Kampong Glam, have evolved as ethnic enclaves reflecting high concentrations of cultural values. These areas have also gained popularity as tourist destinations, featuring restaurants, retail stores, and architectural elements that resonate with their respective ethnicities.

Singapore's developmental trajectory initially followed a 'demolish and build' approach, yet a shift towards valuing cultural heritage led to the preservation of Asian identity (Fincher et al., 2014; Yeoh, 2005). Amid reconstruction, aesthetics gained prominence alongside cultural heritage, presenting a multifaceted exploration of the interplay between art and heritage. In line with this, the Singaporean

government coined the term "Global City for the Arts" to drive the growth of a dynamic arts, cultural, and entertainment sector. This initiative not only enriches local culture but also fosters a sense of national pride, aligning with Singapore's commitment to its heritage and aspirations for a cosmopolitan cultural identity.

Singapore's ethnic communities are closely tied to historical clusters, notably in areas like Chinatown, Little India, and Kampong Glam (Fincher et al., 2014). These zones have evolved into popular tourist destinations, featuring restaurants, retail outlets, and architectural elements reflecting their respective cultures. Initially adopting a 'demolish and build' approach, Singapore later shifted to preserving its Asian heritage amid urban development, exploring the intersection of art and heritage. The government coined "Global City for the Arts" to enhance local culture, foster national pride, and bolster the arts and entertainment scene (Yeoh, 2005). This demonstrates Singapore's commitment to cultural enrichment while embracing its multifaceted identity.

Kampong Glam is a Malay and Arab community with the famous Sultan Mosque and Malay Heritage Centre (Yeoh, 2005). The street names are named after Middle Eastern cities like Muscat and Kandahar or have relations to the Islam culture such as Haji and Subhan (KNYCX, 2020). The area is filled with boutiques and shops that sell Arab décors, carpets and silks, and restaurants with Middle Eastern cuisine. Chinatown, one of the larger enclaves is distinct with the traditional Chinese architecture, including ornate temples, heritage shophouses, and a vibrant street market. Both local residents and tourists visit Chinatown for an abundance of hawker markets, bakers and gourmet shops. Chinatown hosts various cultural events and festivals, such as Lunar New Year celebrations and the Mid-Autumn Festival. Little India showcases the vibrant Indian community and culture with its colourful streets, aromatic spice shops, traditional eateries, and bustling markets. The architecture reflects Indian influences so Hindu temples are commonly found including the iconic landmark, Sri Veeramakaliamman Temple. Traditional festivals like Deepavali (Diwali) celebrations are held in Little India and it has attracted locals and visitors to experience the authentic Indian culture.

3.3.4.   ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT: THE ICONIC HAWKER CULTURE

For Singaporeans, Hawker culture is more than just a culinary experience; it's a symbol of the nation's diverse cultural fabric and a cherished gathering place. These hawker centers (Figure 11) embody Singapore's rich blend of Chinese, Indian, and Malay influences, fostering a sense of unity among its people (Fincher et al., 2014; Kong, 2007; Ng, 2021). Recognizing their significance, Singapore campaigned successfully to have hawker culture recognized on UNESCO's Representative List of the Intangible Cultural Heritage of Humanity in 2020 (Ng, 2021).

FIGURE 11: LAU PA SAT (LEFT) AND MAXWELL FOOD CENTRE HAWKER CENTER IN SINGAPORE (PHOTO CREDIT: AUTHOR, 2023)

The origin of the hawker stalls began in the early 20th century when the industrial workers needed quick, affordable meals. Their comfort food, noodles, skewers, and curries were sold on baskets and carts on the streets. However, street congestion and hygiene issues due to discarded food scraps and no access to running water prompted the government to establish temporary markets from 1922 to 1935 (Kong, 2007; Ng, 2021).

Initially, the government did not agree with the hawker markets as it interfered with the development plans. The vision and the direction that the city had envisioned was modernism which hawker stalls were not aligned with due to hygiene concerns, lack of order, and distraction to the pedestrian and city flow. With the public's support for hawkers, the government made the decision to incorporate and manage the hawker system to fit with the overall city's plan rather than restricting it. The licensing system and constructing of large hawker centres and market centres. The city also addressed the hygiene concerns by providing proper water, sewage, drainage system and power supply. Through the licensing program, health and safety food training are mandatory and rent subsidies are available (Traulevicz, 2013).

Hawker centers became not only culinary havens but also cultural melting pots. These spaces showcase Singapore's diverse ethnic cuisines, co-locating foods from various backgrounds, providing equitable access to food, and promoting shared meals across different dietary preferences (Khoo, 2017). However, despite their cultural significance, Singapore modernized over the years from its industrial period to its financial economy. The use and the need for hawker centres were diminishing and the perception of hawking as a low-level trade persists. The younger generation work towards becoming banker and lawyers working in an office setting rather than working six days a week in un-airconditioned and unkempt conditions (Ng, 2021; Tam, 2017). To combat this, Hawker Culture was inscribed onto the UNESCO Representative List of the Intangible Cultural Heritage of Humanity in December 2020 (SG101, 2023b). This was the government's attempt to raise the status of hawkers and bring in new cooks (Ng, 2021). Another incentive for new hawker stall owners is the reduced rent in the initial year. The government's efforts are aligned with their principle in keeping their Asian heritage and culture.

As Singapore transformed into a major economic center, its population became more educated and less interested in the demanding work of running food stalls. Yet, hawker centers remain a cornerstone of Singapore's identity, reflective of its history, multiculturalism, and sense of community. The

government's active intervention to preserve hawker culture and integrate it into the nation's narrative showcases a recognition of heritage as a crucial aspect of national identity.

3.3.5. CONCLUSION FOR SINGAPORE: TOP-DOWN APPROACH TO DEVELOP SINGAPOREAN IDENTITY WHILE PRESERVING ASIAN HERITAGES

Singapore, a relatively young nation that has achieved significant growth in the past 50+ years, has strategically tackled multiracial and multicultural integration through national policies and legislation. One of its most substantial policies is the Housing Development Board (HDB) ethnicity integration policy. What's important to realize is that chance encounters in Singapore are not by coincidence but factored in by design. Singapore recognized the need for cohesion, given the geographical racial segregation during the colonial period. Policies were enacted to bridge ethnic gaps as communities sought security and familiarity. Singapore's approach aimed at unity without sacrificing its Asian heritage. With English as the administrative language, the bilingual policy allowed Singaporeans to retain their mother tongues, preserving their cultural identity.

The HDB's Ethnic Integration Policy prevented the formation of ethnic enclaves by enforcing quotas on HDB blocks to reflect Singapore's overall racial ratio. This fostered balanced ethnic diversity in housing estates and encouraged interaction. Common spaces like void decks and community centers further nurtured understanding among residents through social and religious functions. These spaces hold social and religious functions such as weddings, funerals, and prayers, creating opportunities for residents of all backgrounds to enhance their understanding of one another's practices and beliefs. While Singapore's top-down approach involving strict and well-enforced policies and regulations has proven successful, criticisms emerged. The EIP faced backlash as critics argued that the policy inadvertently reinforced separation. Discrimination is particularly evident in housing policies, where race determines residency even if one can afford it. Furthermore, the younger generation identifies more strongly as Singaporeans rather than with specific races, challenging the validity of the race system. Suggesting the race system is outdated as it is from the colonial era where classism favours the Chinese over Indians and Malays. Additionally, the use of English marginalizes those who cannot speak it, such as elders and new migrants.

Singapore's overall approach to diversity and multiculturalism seeks equality, safeguards minority rights, encourages interethnic interaction, and maintains religious harmony through constitutional provisions, policies, and community initiatives. The nation's dual strategy of preserving distinct Asian cultures while fostering a unified Singaporean identity has been seen as a double-edged sword for some residents.

3.4.   DISCUSSION & ASSESSMENT OF CASE STUDIES

The chosen case study cities — Toronto, London, and Singapore — are renowned for their ethnic diversity and serve as financial hubs on their respective continents. These globally connected metropolises boast high population densities and are distinguished by their advanced economic, educational, service, and entertainment sectors. However, distinctions arise in factors such as demographic racial compositions, political and planning structures, and urban layouts.

GOVERNANCE & LEGAL FRAMEWORK

The political and legal structures of these three cities share similarities in being part of the British Commonwealth. During the 1970s, many countries recognized the growing immigration and demographic changes that were leading to a more ethnically diverse society rather than a homogenous one. Consequently, Toronto, London, and Singapore developed their strategies for ethnic diversity during this decade, aiming to foster acceptance and unity within their cities (Fincher et al., 2014).

Throughout these cities, it's evident that a well-established framework and government support significantly shape the overall message conveyed to their residents. The importance of a national-level framework is underscored by its direct impact on local-level implementation. All three cities empower their local governments to lead community efforts for cohesion and access to urban services. This contrasts with the situations in the USA and the Netherlands, where local governments often had to step in with language classes and support programs due to limited funding and national support (Fincher et al., 2014).

Nonetheless, the variations primarily stem from the pace and strategies employed in implementing these policies. Canada has persistently focused on enhancing migrant integration since the inception of its multicultural policies, especially given the increasing number of immigrants. Toronto, evolving into a global mosaic, has emerged as Canada's largest gateway city. Singapore has also implemented comprehensive policies to reduce racial discrimination while preserving ethnic heritage. Yet, some note that the strictness of these policies has inadvertently heightened racial divisions, particularly in housing and workplaces. Recent studies indicate that Singapore's younger generation identifies more as Singaporeans than by their ethnic heritage, questioning the relevance of the existing race-based system.

Conversely, the United Kingdom clung to the concept of Britishness and initially pursued the assimilation of migrants. However, they discovered that this approach led to greater segregation. Recently the idea of interculturalism gained traction, prompted by a growing recognition of rising racism and discrimination in London.

DEMOGRAPHICS

Ethnic demographics play a pivotal role in shaping the identity of these cities. Toronto has evolved into a minority-majority city, with over 50% of its population originating outside Canada, representing more than 20 countries. Among these immigrants, 56% were from Asia, particularly the Philippines, China, and India. However, when considering ethnic origin or cultural ancestry, the prominent responses include Chinese, English, Irish, Scottish, Indian, and Italian.

In London, the majority consists of people of white background, albeit narrowly at 53.8%. Black African and Black Caribbean individuals constitute just over 11%, while those of Indian and Pakistani descent make up slightly over 10%. These two groups emerged as the largest ethnicities in London.

In Singapore, where diversity is viewed as multiracial rather than multicultural, the population is predominantly composed of three major races: Chinese, Indian, and Malay. The Chinese ethnic group constitutes about 75% of the total population.

All three countries hold the same approach to their ethnic diversity. They pride themselves in diversity and endorse the preservation of heritage, ultimately contributing to the distinctive identities of these nations. The ratio and percentage of minority groups a contributing factor to people's perception of minorities. When the minority group is one large group, they tend to cluster within themselves, building a wall against the rest of the city. This can create a lack of understanding and misunderstanding with each other as they don't interact as much. Of the three countries, Singapore is the closest case with the majority of the citizens being Chinese. In cases like Toronto, while there are a large number of migrants, there are also a lot of countries of origin, diversifying the minorities. In comparison, London's minority makeup is mostly of two visible minorities.

SERVICES AND PROGRAMS

In these metropolitan cities, which have a history of embracing immigrants, settlement services and assistance are readily available either directly from the city or through connections to external services. While crucial services like housing and safety are primarily aimed at refugees and asylum seekers, private services usually cater to skilled migrants. What's also been common is that language barriers pose a significant challenge for migrants, prompting the provision of subsidies and volunteer programs. These services appear to be the basic offerings common to all cities.

Housing, a fundamental human need, presents a challenge in all three densely populated cities grappling with a housing crisis. While the city offers housing assistance to those in need, shortages are already prevalent due to the demands of current residents and citizens. For instance, Canada's affordable housing waitlist stretches up to 8 years.

Conversely, in Singapore, housing is an intricately woven system designed to foster integration. This uniqueness is intrinsic to Singapore's top-down approach, which has been in place since the country's inception. Combined with innovative public space design elements such as void decks, Singapore has successfully addressed geographical segregation. This achievement is largely attributed to the city's limited number of major ethnic groups. However, as modern society experiences an influx of global migrants and a rise in private housing, new ethnic enclaves are emerging. Nonetheless, Singapore serves as an exemplary instance of a government wielding substantial control and pursuing an agenda that promotes integration.

Incorporating soft programs for integration through arts, creative outlets, and sports emerges as a highly recommended approach. Notably, festivals have emerged as a common thread. These events serve not only as celebrations for ethnic groups but also as avenues for fostering unity among all races, including the host communities. Cultural celebrations involving food, festivals, and entertainment like music and sports are widespread across the three cities. However, some critics voice concerns that these annual events might serve to mask underlying daily discrimination.

PHYSICAL SPACE & ETHNIC COMMUNITIES

Ethnic communities often form naturally as people gravitate toward those who share similar backgrounds, seeking comfort, information, and security. In Singapore, historical circumstances and colonial influences led to initial segregation, with different racial groups confined to distinct parts of the

city. Through the Ethnic Integration Policy (EIP) in housing, as well as integration efforts in schools, and public spaces like void decks within housing blocks, Singapore deliberately worked to merge these groups. The government believed that daily interactions in routine settings could foster greater openness. In Toronto, ethnic enclaves developed more organically as groups of immigrants settled in specific areas. These neighbourhoods embraced the unique culture of their inhabitants, influencing design, retail, and the local culinary scene. Toronto harnessed this diversity as a city asset, showcasing the authentic cultural heritage of its immigrant populations. Nevertheless, the existence of concentrated ethnic clusters has sparked concerns about insufficient integration among diverse residents. In the era of globalization, the younger generation is more attuned to various cultures and expresses curiosity about exploring cuisines and traditions beyond their own. This evolving mindset presents an opportunity for cities to capitalize on, offering a robust platform for cultures to effectively showcase their offerings.

Ultimately, the impulse for people to seek comfort and security drives the formation of these communities. (Wood et al., 2006) Cities must thoughtfully manage community expansion, ensuring that current areas remain integrated rather than becoming more segregated. These localized hubs also serve as effective platforms for outreach to specific demographic groups.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT
The economic landscape is examined from two perspectives. Firstly, it involves assessing the performance of specific ethnic groups within the broader workforce and identifying any signs of discrimination or disadvantages they may face. Secondly, it explores whether certain ethnic groups are limited to particular occupations, potentially due to constraints or societal pressures. Challenges often arise in securing well-paying and stable jobs due to language barriers and a lack of professional expertise. Consequently, this has given rise to the emergence of ethnic enclaves and clusters based around specific job sectors. This phenomenon has been observed in all three cities. Ethnic enclaves like hawker stalls and Chinese malls have inadvertently led to the separation of particular ethnic groups and, at times, tensions with neighbouring residents. A pay gap between different racial groups has been identified in London and Singapore within the same industries, stemming from systemic structures and internal racial biases. However, a positive trend has been observed in London that is closing the gap between people of different races.

PUBLIC PARTICIPATION
During the literature review, public participation was identified as a pivotal principle in multicultural planning. However, within the context of researching multiculturalism in these cities, participation did not emerge as one of the prominently acclaimed elements. Instead, it is intricately woven into the fabric of the approaches and instances presented. It is assumed that rather than adopting specific methods, traditional approaches to outreach and consultation were employed.

A central facet of the planning process involves active engagement with stakeholders and residents through consultation. An avenue for ethnic consultation lies in the presence of ethnic communities. To enhance response rates, a strategic approach is paramount: rather than urging individuals to provide their opinions at the surveyor's location (typically the city), a more effective strategy involves meeting the audience in their own surroundings. This highlights the advantage of having ethnic communities, which streamlines the outreach process. It's noteworthy that all three cities examined in this context boasted ethnic clusters, creating an opportune environment for targeted outreach. Unfortunately, the precise methods employed for consultation and outreach remain undisclosed.

CHAPTER 4. DESIGN GUIDELINES FOR MULTICULTURAL PLANNING

The design guideline for a multicultural city follows a framework similar to that of a master planning approach. It places a strong emphasis on the human element, considering the people and viewing the city from a human perspective. This process encompasses key phases such as problem definition, vision establishment, design, and implementation. Throughout this comprehensive journey, engaging stakeholders through consultation is pivotal. The outcomes and ultimate results heavily hinge on the opinions and priorities of these stakeholders, even when conflicting at times. It lies within the planners' responsibility to comprehend and persuasively guide stakeholders and decision-makers toward a unified path and direction for the plan. Central to this process is the understanding that cities are intricately shaped by the myriad interactions and encounters among people. Within these cities, a tapestry of communities exists, forming a community of communities (Aure & Førde, 2021).

4.1. PRINCIPLES

The strategic framework for multicultural planning includes the following components that ensure a comprehensive approach to crafting inclusive urban environments. These components serve as building blocks that contribute to a well-rounded and effective strategy:

- **Vision and Rationale**: A clear vision and its underlying rationale describe the desired future and delve into the motivations that underscore this vision. This helps align stakeholders and provides a tangible direction for the planning process.
- **Catalyst Analysis**: The examination of potential drivers for change can propel multicultural planning forward and add depth to the strategy.
- **Key Stakeholder Identification**: Determining which stakeholders and their roles and responsibilities are pivotal. These stakeholders collectively shape the direction and impact of the plan, and their active involvement is fundamental.
- **Physical Aspects**: This involves a comprehensive evaluation of project conditions, constraints, opportunities, and foundational data. These factors lay the groundwork for informed decision-making, ensuring that the ensuing planning process is rooted in a robust understanding of the urban landscape.
- **Design Integration**: The framework seamlessly integrates design considerations within the planning process.
- **Strategic Delivery Issues and Options**: This step involves anticipating the potential challenges and opportunities that can arise during implementation. By examining these dynamics, planners can proactively address obstacles and make informed choices.

The overarching aim of multicultural planning is twofold: to establish a comprehensive blueprint that outlines the various aspects to be cognizant of during the planning process and to serve as the intermediary between community groups, members, and organizations capable of fulfilling their needs. By functioning as this liaison, the framework bridges the gap between vision and implementation, ensuring that the multicultural ethos is intricately woven into the fabric of urban development.

4.1.1. PLANNING PROCESSES

In crafting the design guideline, a structured framework encompasses the stages of Prepare, Design, and Implement. This approach serves as a roadmap, facilitating the development of effective multicultural

public spaces. Acknowledging the distinctive needs of each neighbourhood or ethnic group, the framework offers flexibility in tailoring approaches to align with specific contexts.

4.2. PREPARE- EMBARKING ON MULTICULTURAL PLANNING: FOUNDATIONAL STEPS

The Prepare stage serves as the foundation like setting the stage and laying down sand. In this phase, the aim and objectives are established, information is gathered, and stakeholders are enlisted on the roster. Ultimately, the consultation strategy is meticulously developed to delineate the responsibilities and expectations of all involved parties.

4.2.1. UNDERSTAND THE POLITICAL FRAMEWORK

Informed decision-making hinges on a comprehensive understanding of the city's landscape. This necessitates a careful examination of council committee meetings and a sharp assessment of the city's overall direction. By discerning the political dynamics within council chambers and gauging public sentiment, a clear perspective emerges, guiding the formulation of precise plan objectives. Beyond this, it's essential to gauge the scale of projects and foresee the potential implications of proposed changes. This holistic approach ensures that the plan not only aligns with the city's evolving vision but also anticipates the future impacts of its implementation.

4.2.2. COLLECT BASELINE INFORMATION

Central to effective planning is the acquisition of baseline data and information, forming the foundation for understanding the city and shaping overarching objectives. This information serves as the foundation for the plan to be built, encapsulating the present physical, social, and economic status. Aata collection contains details about the city's current services available, programs already established, geographical layouts and inherent limitations. This baseline setting is important to not only observe the initial setting of the city but also to discover future opportunities.

In the preparatory phase, planners lay out the framework of available data, encompassing historical records, census information, city plans, program documentation, past project outcomes, and a roster of potential stakeholders. As the project progresses, a gradual accumulation of detailed and nuanced information occurs, often gleaned from engaged stakeholders. This iterative process ensures that the plan remains attuned to evolving dynamics. An illustrative overview of the data to be collected and reviewed is provided below:

- Population: by age, geographic area, gender, ethnic groups
- Infrastructure: transportation, civil utilities, active transportation facilities
- Public transport usage
- Cultural provision and identity
- Land use patterns: buildings and open space
- Financial/income status by ethnic groups
- Heritage: buildings, archaeology, culture, landscape
- Property market: demand and supply
- Geographical: Cluster of ethnic groups, places of religion, community centers and amenities

4.2.3. ESTABLISH THE VISION STATEMENT

A vision statement is the ultimate plan objective, encapsulating core identity, goals, and values. It guides the process and decision-making, providing clear direction and stakeholder alignment. It is important to establish a draft vision statement prior to consulting with stakeholders as a well-crafted vision

statement provides a clear direction, aligns stakeholders, and manages expectations. The vision typically also includes elements like community atmosphere, sustainability goals, and impact. Start with a preliminary vision to guide multicultural guideline creation, emphasizing physical, economic, and social prerequisites for transformation.

4.2.4. DETERMINE THE STAKEHOLDERS

Stakeholders are what bring the plan to life. It is vital to consider and include diverse individuals and groups, including residents, businesses, and government bodies that have a direct interest in and impact on multiculturalism. Involving them ensures diverse perspectives, leading to inclusive decision-making and a relevant plan. Cultural groups and NGOs act as a bridge between individual residents and to government.

Engaging stakeholders also amplifies transparency, fosters accountability, and augments the success of plan implementation. Their early engagement taps local wisdom, aligning the plan with the community's essence. This engagement fosters long-term commitment and sustainability, making stakeholder involvement a dynamic force that shapes a comprehensive, community-oriented future. Furthermore, the aspirations of stakeholders are to be interwoven, infusing a sense of ownership and direction into the project's foundations. Local stakeholders emerge as pivotal contributors, bringing their experiences, and stories, and determining needs. Planners are encouraged to facilitate ongoing dialogue, education, and awareness among these various sectors to help communities understand how short- and long-range policy, land use, infrastructure, and other decisions affect the public health of the entire community, and to drive ongoing positive health outcomes.

Stakeholders are primarily categorized into two groups: internal city departments and external associations. Internal city departments hold specific information about the city, including existing and future plans and policies. Their involvement ensures a cohesive direction for plans. Below is an exemplar illustrating how departments can be structured:

Internal – City Departments

- Corporate
- Finance Department
- Properties and Affordable Housing Department
- Environment Department
- Cultural and Community Department
- Transportation Department
- Heritage and Planning Department

External – Associations, Community members, Residents and Private groups

Both public and private entities with vested interests are invited to participate in the project. Groups that significantly influence the city's composition and character should be invited, emphasizing inclusivity. These encompass both public and private sectors, as well as engaged community members. Advocacy groups and networks maintain intimate connections with residents and representatives, facilitating the sharing of concerns and perspectives, particularly those of migrants and newcomers. This extends to cultural entities like sports clubs, ethnic dance groups, and creative communities. Additionally, conversations are initiated with groups pivotal to migrants' needs, ensuring a comprehensive dialogue.

Public	**Private**	**Community**
• Education institutes, universities, school boards, student clubs • Health providers • Settlement services • Public libraries • Police authorities	• Architects and urban planners • Business and Economic Development groups • Interpreters and translators	• Ethnic groups and associations • Advocacy and industry groups • Not-for-profit organization • Children and youth groups • Ethnic sporting, dance, and culture clubs

Among the roster of stakeholders, certain individuals may perceive themselves as contributors while others may view themselves as beneficiaries. While these roles can evolve, ensuring coherent alignment in conversations and internal group discussions is vital. Depending on the project's subject matter and its developmental stages, the active engagement of all stakeholders holds significance.

4.2.5. BUILD A CONSULTATION STRATEGY

Once the stakeholders are determined, the consultation strategy is to develop. Consultation plays a pivotal role in defining values, resolving conflicting objectives, and addressing delicate matters. This process gains utmost significance when there is a drive to fully integrate the recommendation into implementation.

The planning process should be designed so that people of all ages, abilities, races, social statuses, and incomes can participate. Planning processes should focus on creating opportunities for capacity building for community members, public health professionals, elected officials, and city and county staff to gain skills and training in understanding the needs and desires of the whole community. Planners should focus on implementing engagement and empowerment strategies that enhance community vitality and include the perspectives of individuals who will be directly affected by planning decisions. Recognizing that people of colour and low to moderate-income communities are often more negatively affected by planning decisions, special outreach efforts should be made to ensure their effective participation in the process.

A consultation strategy should be developed in the early stages. It's crucial to distinguish consultation from communication, publicity, or marketing, to avoid creating false expectations. Hence, the planning of these processes should be meticulous. Consultation involves an exchange of ideas, while communication entails one-way information dissemination. The consultation strategy should include key points such as the responsibility of all parties, objectives of the project, potential benefits and risks, consultation and communication targets, and consultation outcomes. Afterwards, the engagement results should be reported to participants and the public for review.

4.3.   DESIGN: CULTIVATING MULTICULTURAL ENVIRONMENTS

Before delving into the design phase, it is imperative for all stakeholders to collectively solidify the vision and objectives. This involves identifying any data gaps and ensuring their collection. Furthermore, aligning the group's priorities with the established vision is crucial. The design of physical spaces is guided by human-scale design principles outlined in section 2.1. Additionally, an assessment of existing and necessary public and private services and programs is conducted. This comprehensive groundwork lays the foundation for a cohesive and effective design strategy.

4.3.1.   PHYSICAL SPACE

This section takes inspiration from Sim's (2019) emphasis on crafting distinctive and memorable places that nurture identity and attachment among residents. The focus is on creating adaptable and flexible public spaces that thrive within the rich diversity of cities. The aim is to foster meaningful interactions across various backgrounds while maintaining a professional tone.

Versatile and Adaptable Design: The key aspect of a design for public spaces is flexibility. The intention is to create spaces that can effortlessly adapt to the diverse needs of a highly varied urban population. In doing so, mixed-use spaces emerge as vital platforms that promote interactions and engagements among people from different cultural backgrounds. This adaptability underlines the fundamental principle of inclusivity.

Identifying Gathering Spots: Within the urban landscape, there lies the potential to identify gathering spaces that foster inclusivity and cultural exchange. These spaces, often overlooked or underutilized, hold the key to encouraging connections. The strategic approach is to seek out such areas, perhaps those that are under that radar, situated at the edges of neighbourhoods. The practice of maintaining a curated list of these spaces allows city authorities to consistently evaluate and maximize their potential for inclusive interactions.

Leveraging Existing Spaces: Leveraging the hidden potential of public spaces that are already well-utilized is advocated. By infusing these spaces with design principles that prioritize inclusivity and cultural exchange, they can be transformed into hubs of vibrancy. Incorporating features like flexible seating to facilitate impromptu gatherings and integrating greenery and public art to foster an inviting ambiance can further enhance the cultural fabric of these spaces.

Enhancing Accessibility: Central to the success of multicultural public spaces is ensuring accessibility. Pedestrian walkways and cycling paths should be well-connected, minimizing the dependence on private vehicles. Public transit accessibility should be prioritized, ensuring equal movement opportunities for residents from all walks of life. This accessibility fosters a sense of equal participation and engagement.

Collaborative Pilots and Partnerships: A practical approach to implementation involves initiating pilot projects in collaboration with associations and organizations that represent the diverse tapestry of the city. Building partnerships with local libraries, schools, and ethnic groups can prove mutually beneficial. By leveraging the resources and networks of these institutions, the potential for shared growth and enrichment is elevated. Institutions like libraries are stationed so that future gatherings can happen.

Mitigating Physical Barriers: To realize the full potential of public spaces, it's essential to address physical barriers that might inadvertently lead to neighbourhood segregation. This involves meticulous planning to mitigate the impact of rail tracks, bridges, wide lanes, and other infrastructure elements that could fragment communities. By fostering physical connectivity, these barriers are surmounted.

Financial Considerations: Financial viability is a pivotal aspect, especially for people of varying backgrounds. It encourages the evaluation of reduced pricing options and the exploration of collaborative funding solutions driven by community engagement and support. Balancing financial feasibility with the aspiration for inclusivity is a nuanced endeavour.

Residential Integration: The guideline extends its reach to residential areas, advocating for a community-driven approach. This model, inspired by Singapore's practices, empowers residents to shape their surroundings and engenders a sense of ownership. Providing spaces where children can engage in play under natural supervision, like Singapore's void decks, encourages a sense of community and belonging.

Ultimately, the impact of thoughtfully designed multicultural public spaces extends far beyond their physical boundaries. They reshape mundane tasks, like grocery shopping, into vibrant cultural interactions. People from diverse backgrounds naturally converge, sharing stories, traditions, and experiences. These spaces act as microcosms of the city's diverse tapestry, dissolving barriers and nurturing unity. Through their design, they amplify a sense of belonging and pride, magnifying the city's multicultural vitality and its potential to catalyze change.

4.3.2. PROGRAM DEVELOPMENTS

At the time of discussing programs, consultation participants can emphasize their existing initiatives, envisioned programs, and needs. Building upon the initial vision and established objectives, a comprehensive information assessment is conducted. This entails aligning the needs with existing programs and pinpointing resource gaps. An exemplary array of potential programs is outlined below:

- Access to Information
- Language Enhancement
- Settlement Initiatives
- Anti-Discrimination and Anti-Racism Programs
- Youth Engagement Programs
- Fostering Inclusion via Creative Avenues
- Indigenous Cultural Enrichment
- Opportunities for Project Funding

This process enables a synergy between aspirations and resources, ensuring a dynamic and inclusive plan.

4.4.   IMPLEMENT: BRIDGING BLUEPRINT TO REALITY

In this section, the focus shifts to the intricacies of an implementation strategy that transcends theoretical frameworks and translates into tangible actions. The final goal is to implement the recommendations and continue communications. Guided by thorough analysis and sustained stakeholder dialogues, the implementation strategy's evolution hinges on a pragmatic organizational structure for successful execution.

4.4.1.   IMPLEMENTATION STRATEGY

To ensure that these efforts transcend the realm of mere study documents, it is imperative to maintain a constant awareness of both the project's initiation and its ultimate developmental aspirations for the area. Clear communication is essential and it should strike a balance between simplicity and

sophistication. The progression of the implementation or delivery strategy should be guided by comprehensive analysis and sustained dialogues with stakeholders. A pragmatic organizational structure is pivotal in steering the strategy toward successful execution.

The implementation strategy plan encompasses a detailed timeline, diversified funding sources, collaborations with both the community and industry partners, as well as various delivery methods. The measure of success hinges on design considerations, coupled with attention to marketing, management, maintenance strategies, and a thorough risk analysis. This holistic approach contributes to a resilient and impactful execution plan.

DETERMINE THE TIMELINE

The phased development timeline should be established based on resource availability. A development capacity and financial model often accompany the phasing strategy to test various assumptions or scenarios. Identifying projects that can be implemented early, even if small, can boost investor and community confidence, alter area perceptions, and set design quality standards. However, if infrastructure like roads and open spaces is prioritized, the master plan should be thoroughly tested to maintain flexibility. Caution is advised when aiming to complete significant public realm or infrastructure projects early due to potential complexities tied to slow investment programs.

SECURE FUNDING

The availability of funding clearly has a significant impact on the delivery of any project. The funding strategy should include existing funding available and future funding sources, their securing process, and the timeline. Partnership should also be considered. Other local or strategic enhancements to the physical environment or regeneration schemes could provide chances for integration. For instance, maintenance programs for streets or parks, school construction, or investments in CCTV. The funding strategy for the master plan should explore these options to ensure they contribute to the overall objective.

ESTABLISH ONGOING COMMUNICATION METHODS

Effective communication with the consultation working groups and committees is essential to keep them informed of any changes or updates achieved during the project. Utilizing communication methods that resonate with the community is crucial for seamless information dissemination. Regular updates are shared on project websites or the city website, and collaborations with local media outlets can be leveraged to highlight accomplishments, garner attention, and showcase available opportunities. This proactive approach fosters transparency and engagement throughout the project's progression.

4.4.2. INFORM GOVERNMENT BODIES AND POLICIES

The recommendations arising from the study should be formally presented to officials and decision-makers. Through extensive public consultation, any information beyond the current scope can be effectively communicated using interdepartmental communication methods. This approach enables a broad spectrum of information to be shared and relayed back to the original requester. Establishing a cultural diversity committee would further enhance ongoing communication, ensuring the continuity of responsibility for the plan's implementation and success.

CHAPTER 5.   CONCLUSION

The primary goal of this thesis is to delve into the impacts of multiculturalism and cultural diversity on urban planning. As cities grow in size and population, the concept of multiculturalism gains even greater significance. The coexistence of diverse communities brings mutual learning and synergy; however, it also gives rise to a range of complex issues such as integration, segregation, discrimination, and social cohesion. With that, a new term, Super-diversity, was coined by Vertovec (2016) referring to the intersections between nationality, ethnicity, language, religion, age, gender, legal status, class and human capital.

By addressing the question of how cultural diversity influences urban planning, it was recognized that effective urban planning requires a comprehensive understanding of various disciplines, including sociology, economics, and politics studies. It goes beyond a theoretical exploration by delving into practical aspects, such as policy implementation, community development initiatives, and the role of local governments. Through interdisciplinary research and case studies, the aim is to develop guidelines for creating inclusive and cohesive multicultural urban environments that address the complexities of contemporary society.

The integration of multiculturalism into traditional planning methods introduces a new dimension that requires careful consideration. Beyond the conventional aspects of urban planning, it becomes crucial to create spaces that not only cater to physical needs but also evoke a sense of belonging and home for the diverse residents. This becomes especially significant as highlighted by Colombo and Visser (2010; 2020), where young individuals often find themselves navigating the delicate balance between preserving their ancestral culture, assimilating into the host country's culture, and forging their own unique identities. In response to this complexity, the urban environment must adapt to accommodate these changing dynamics within a multicultural society.

"What are the planning principles and design aspects that can enhance culturally expanding and diverse cities to be inclusive?"

In answering the research question, Chapter 2, outlines the developed key principles from literature reviews. The four texts that thy principles are drawn from provide various multicultural planning approaches and frameworks for fostering intercultural integration, community building, and economic development. The five key themes that are used as guiding principles are: inclusive governance, services and programs for integration, active public participation, intercultural spaces, and ethnic economy and workplace diversity.

- **Inclusive Governance and Representation**: Prioritizing the involvement of diverse groups in decision-making processes, considering language and cultural representation, and engaging minority communities in planning.
- **Integration through Services and Programs**: Tailored services for immigrants, cultural events, and anti-discrimination efforts promote cohesion. Ensuring equitable access to public services is essential for fostering a sense of belonging.
- **Active Public Participation and Outreach**: Overcoming language barriers and cultural differences through active outreach to immigrants, enabling planners to understand their unique needs and concerns.

- **Intercultural and Public Spaces**: Designing public spaces that encourage natural interaction and engagement without financial constraints, promoting inclusivity while accommodating cultural diversity.
- **Ethnic Economy and Workplace Diversity**: Encouraging ethnic entrepreneurship clusters and promoting diversity in workplaces to provide equal opportunities and representation, particularly for recent immigrants facing labour market challenges.

In Chapter 3, the case study cities, Toronto, London, and Singapore, are analyzed as these metropolises exhibit distinct demographic compositions, political structures, and urban layouts. The national political frameworks were found to provide support for increasing ethnic diversity within their societies, focusing on acceptance and unity. This foundational support empowered local governments to foster further cohesion and access to urban services based on their needs. The demographic makeup influenced these needs and the relationship between major ethnic groups the minority groups.

In all three cities, there are notable services and programs that have proven effective. These include language assistance programs, and integration initiatives through arts, sports, festivals, and music. This effectiveness could be attributed to these cities' long history of immigrants, which has fostered an environment conducive to such programs. However, housing presents a more challenging reality due to urban housing shortages. Singapore, with its distinctive top-down approach, stands out in its approach to housing integration. The Ethnic Integration Policy, which introduces quotas within housing blocks, exemplifies this approach. Although ethnic clusters still persist, this policy naturally allows people from different ethnic backgrounds to share common spaces, and essential amenities, and interact naturally in schools and playgrounds.

The concept of ethnic enclaves evokes mixed responses, raising questions about their impact on overall integration within a city. While ethnic clusters provide a sense of security and comfort for migrants, they can inadvertently foster segregation. A potential solution lies in concerted government efforts to attract diverse ethnic groups to these areas, counteracting the tendency for people to naturally cluster with those of similar backgrounds. This approach seeks to strike a balance between the benefits of community cohesion and the broader goals of integration within the city.

The economic landscapes reveal both challenges and opportunities Certain ethnic groups encounter disadvantages and discrimination within the workforce, leading to identified pay gaps across all three cities. Several factors contribute to this scenario. One prominent factor is the prevalence of low-paying and unstable jobs being occupied by individuals from developing countries. Additionally, ethnic-specific jobs run by ethnic groups can influence this situation. While these roles can serve as a means to preserve cultural heritage, they can also contribute to a sense of being stuck in a particular type of work. However, a positive trend is evident in London, where the average age of migrants is younger, and the effect of the second or third generation migrants into professional and higher-paying roles. This suggests a potential shift in breaking the glass ceiling and achieving upward mobility for these communities.

Cities are faced with the intricate task of preserving the authenticity of migrant cultures while also ensuring their integration into the broader societal framework. Striking this balance requires a continuous cycle of listening to residents' concerns, implementing changes, and closely monitoring the impacts of these strategies. This iterative approach is crucial for creating an inclusive environment where equity is not only aimed for but actively pursued.

Chapter 4 presents a comprehensive design guideline derived from the insights obtained in this study. This guideline follows a master planning structure, spanning from the initial stages to the end of a planning cycle. The ultimate objective of this chapter is to provide a robust and practical tool that can effectively inform planners, policymakers, and city officials in their endeavours to conceptualize, design, and develop cities that not only accommodate but also celebrate the richness of cultural diversity.

There were several limitations that warrant consideration. Firstly, the intricate interplay between sociology and urban planning necessitates a deep understanding of each city's unique historical, political, and discriminatory contexts. However, this demands a significant investment of time and resources for full understanding. To keep within the scope of research, specifically the impact on urban planning, there may be some elements missing for case studies. Data accuracy poses another challenge (Fincher et al., 2014; Kurtz, 2014; Zhuang, 2013). The reliance on self-identification as a minority or foreign-born individual might result in skewed or inaccurate information concerning this demographic. Additionally, the study's reliance on recent data is hampered by the infrequent nature of data collection, for example, the censuses data are typically collected every 5 to 10 years. This is especially problematic when attempting to analyze multifaceted issues such as the pay gap combined with racial data. When compared with the gender pay gap, the data can be binary whereas respondents may not disclose their race when providing wages, and vice versa (Commission on Race and Ethnic Disparities, 2021). Community-based or informal projects initiated by residents are integral to multicultural planning, but capturing information about these endeavours can be intricate. Lastly, the focus on successful projects might limit insights gained from unsuccessful multicultural planning initiatives globally, potentially constraining a comprehensive understanding of effective strategies.

While this paper focuses on various influential factors in urban planning, the significant impact of political power warrants recognition. Instances where political support and leadership exist in decision-making positions often result in expedited project or policy implementation. This underscores the importance of equity and diversity within workplaces, particularly government departments. Following the George Floyd movement, governments have taken measures to establish committees investigating law enforcement and policing institutions. These committees' members are thoughtfully selected to reflect the demographics of affected individuals. It's equally vital that the findings and recommendations from these committees have a lasting and impactful influence on the broader government system. This emphasizes the need for inclusivity, responsiveness, and enduring change.

CHAPTER 6.   BIBLIOGRAPHY

All literature that has been cited or used in the research process has to be listed in the bibliography.

5 News. (2016, December 5). *Britain "becoming more divided as it becomes more diverse."* YouTube. https://youtu.be/at6BYd5TFkw

Amin, A. (2002). Ethnicity and the Multicultural City: Living with Diversity. *Environment and Planning A: Economy and Space*, *34*(6), 959–980. https://doi.org/10.1068/a3537

Ang, L., & Stratton, J. (1995). The Singapore Way of Multiculturalism: Western Concepts/Asian Cultures. *Sojourn: Journal of Social Issues in Southeast Asia*, *10*(1), 65–89. http://www.jstor.org/stable/41056903

Anisef, P., & Lanphier, C. M. (2003). *The world in a city* (P. Anisef & C. M. Lanphier, Eds.). University of Toronto Press. https://utorontopress.com/9780802084361/the-world-in-a-city/

Architizer. (n.d.). *Asia Culture Center*. Architizer. Retrieved July 18, 2023, from https://architizer.com/projects/asia-culture-center/

Auckland Council. (2018). *Auckland Plan 2050*. https://www.aucklandcouncil.govt.nz/plans-projects-policies-reports-bylaws/our-plans-strategies/auckland-plan/Pages/default.aspx

Aure, M., & Førde, A. (2021). Living With Difference – Interventions for Just Cities. *Nordic Journal of Migration Research*, *11*(4), 376–382. https://doi.org/10.33134/njmr.520

Banting, K., & Kymlicka, W. (n.d.). *Multiculturalism Policy Index*. Queen's University . Retrieved July 9, 2023, from http://www.queensu.ca/mcp/

Bathily, A. (2021). *The intercultural city step by step: A practical guide for applying the urban model of intercultural inclusion*. https://rm.coe.int/the-intercultural-city-step-by-step-practical-guide-for-applying-the-u/168048da42s

BBC. (2020, July 16). Charity boss Tony Sewell to head government race commission. *BBC*. https://www.bbc.com/news/uk-politics-53428248

BBC London. (2010, March 10). *"I'm British but have no white friends" - BBC London*. YouTube. https://youtu.be/pguJEIXclt4

Bella. (2017, June 3). The Myth of Multiculturalism in Singapore. *Medium*. https://medium.com/@patcheezie/the-myth-of-multiculturalism-in-singapore-d0712706db4

Benner, T. (2016). Singapore's Road to Multiculturalism. *Fair Observer*. https://www.fairobserver.com/region/asia_pacific/how-to-overcome-racial-tensions-55645/

Benton-Short, L., Price, M. D., & Friedman, S. (2005). Globalization from Below: The Ranking of Global Immigrant Cities. *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research*, *29*(4), 945–959. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1468-2427.2005.00630.x

Benton-Short, L., Price, M., & Friedman, S. (2004). *A Global Perspective on the Connections between Immigration and World Cities*.

https://gum.columbian.gwu.edu/sites/g/files/zaxdzs5166/files/downloads/Immigration%20and%20World%20Cities.pdf

Benton-Short, L., Price, M., Friedman, S., Brown, J., Shah, S., & Keithley, D. (2004). *A Global Perspective on the Connections between Immigration and World Cities*.

Bradford, N. (2009). Canadian Social Policy in the 2000s: Bringing Place In. *Plan Canada*, 14–18.

Burayidi, M. A. (2000). *Urban planning in a multicultural society*. Praeger Publishers.

CABE. (2004). *Creating Successful Master Plans: A Guide for Clients*. https://www.scribd.com/document/55182339/Creating-Successful-Master-Plans-Cabe

Canada Mortgage and Housing Corporation (CMHC). (2018, May 2). *National Housing Strategy*. Canada Mortgage and Housing Corporation (CMHC). https://www.cmhc-schl.gc.ca/nhs/guidepage-strategy

Canadian Radio-television and Telecommunications Commission (CRTC). (2019, May 23). Improved access for Canadians to multilingual, multi-ethnic television news and information from a Canadian perspective. *Government of Canada*. https://www.canada.ca/en/radio-television-telecommunications/news/2019/05/improved-access-for-canadians-to-multilingual-multi-ethnic-television-news-and-information-from-a-canadian-perspective.html

Casanova+Hernandez architects. (n.d.). *L007_Asian Culture Centre Public Space*. Casanova+Hernandez Architects. https://www.casanova-hernandez.com/l007_asian-culture-centre-public-space/

Channel News Asia (CNA). (2021a, September 13). *Pride Over Prejudice - S1E1: Pride In An Unnatural Nation*. Channel News Asia (CNA). https://www.channelnewsasia.com/watch/pride-over-prejudice/pride-over-prejudice-pride-unnatural-nation-2171721

Channel News Asia (CNA). (2021b, September 19). *Pride Over Prejudice - S1E2: Prejudice In A Global City*. Channel News Asia (CNA). https://www.channelnewsasia.com/watch/pride-over-prejudice/pride-over-prejudice-prejudice-global-city-2183766

Chatterjee, A., Tang, C., Torres, C., Douglas, D., Ramos, D., Micah, R., & Shakir, U. (2004). *Alternative Social Planning: A Paradigm Shift Developing an Inclusive, Healthy Toronto*. http://members.ocasi.org/downloads/Alternative_Social_Planning.pdf

Cheong, H. P., Edwards, R., Goulbourne, H., & Solomos, J. (2007). Immigration, social cohesion and social capital: A critical review. In *Critical Social Policy* (Vol. 27, Issue 1, pp. 24–49). https://doi.org/10.1177/0261018307072206

Cheong, P. H., Edwards, R., Goulbourne, H., & Solomos, J. (2007). Immigration, social cohesion and social capital: A critical review. *Critical Social Policy*, *27*(1), 24–49. https://doi.org/10.1177/0261018307072206

Cho, I. S., Nasution, I., Lee, J., & Mascarenhas, N. (2017). MECHANISMS FOR FACILITATING COMMUNITY PARTICIPATION IN SINGAPORE'S NEIGHBORHOOD-PLANNING FRAMEWORK. *Journal of Architectural and Planning Research*, *34*(4), 320–335. http://www.jstor.org/stable/44987240

Choi, K. H., & Ramaj, S. (2023). Ethno-racial and nativity differences in the likelihood of living in affordable housing in Canada. *Housing Studies*, 1–24. https://doi.org/10.1080/02673037.2023.2170988

Choi, K., & Ramaj, S. (2022, June 28). Expert Insight: Ethno-racial minorities in Canada have less access to affordable housing. *Western News*. https://news.westernu.ca/2022/06/expert-insight-ethno-racial-minorities-in-canada-have-less-access-to-affordable-housing/

Chua, V., Swee, E. L., & Wellman, B. (2019). How Neighborhoods, Gender, and Ethnicity Affect Enrollment into Elite Schools. *Sociology of Education*, *92*(2), 176–198. https://www.jstor.org/stable/48588729

Employment Equity Policy, City of Toronto (2000). https://www.toronto.ca/city-government/accountability-operations-customer-service/city-administration/corporate-policies/people-equity-policies/employment-equity-policy/#:~:text=The%20City%20of%20Toronto's%20Employment,policies%20and%20divisional%20practices)%3B

City of Toronto. (2021). *Toronto Newcomer Strategy 2022-2026*. https://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2021/ec/bgrd/backgroundfile-166818.pdf

City of Toronto. (2023a). *Community Initiatives*. City of Toronto. https://www.toronto.ca/community-people/get-involved/community/

City of Toronto. (2023b). *Events Happening at Nathan Phillips Square*. City of Toronto. https://www.toronto.ca/services-payments/venues-facilities-bookings/booking-city-facilities/city-squares/nathan-phillips-square/events-happening-on-nathan-phillips-square/

City of Toronto. (2023c). *Rent-Geared-to-Income Housing*. City of Toronto. https://www.toronto.ca/community-people/employment-social-support/housing-support/rent-geared-to-income-subsidy/

CNA. (2014, March 7). *SINGAPORE: More public housing void decks to transform into art galleries*. YouTube. https://youtu.be/8lXGvKal4ys

Colombo, E. (2010). Crossing Differences: How Young Children of Immigrants Keep Everyday Multiculturalism Alive. *Journal of Intercultural Studies*, *31*(5), 455–470. https://doi.org/10.1080/07256868.2010.513081

Commission on Race and Ethnic Disparities. (2021). *Commission on Race and Ethnic Disparities: The Report*. https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/the-report-of-the-commission-on-race-and-ethnic-disparities

Community Development Council. (2023). *About CDC*. Community Development Council. https://www.cdc.gov.sg/who-we-are/mission/

Council of Europe. (n.d.). *Intercultural cities: good practice examples*. Council of Europe. Retrieved August 5, 2023, from https://www.coe.int/en/web/interculturalcities/good-pratice

Council of Europe. (2017, May 4). *The Copenhagen Host Programme*. Council of Europe. https://www.coe.int/en/web/interculturalcities/-/the-copenhagen-host-programme

Council of Europe. (2019). *A policy to increase the diversity in neighbourhood*. Council of Europe. https://www.coe.int/eu/web/interculturalcities/-/a-policy-to-increase-the-diversity-in-neighbourhood

Council of Europe. (2020a). *Intercultural Hub: Methodology and Tools for the Creation Intercultural Space to enhance intersectoral and inclusive participation in diverse communities*. Council of Europe.

Council of Europe. (2020b). *Public spaces as tools for positive interaction*. Council of Europe. https://www.coe.int/el/web/interculturalcities/-/public-spaces-as-tools-for-positive-interaction

Daly, J. (2021). Nathan Phillips Square: mediating intercultural encounter through urban design. *URBAN DESIGN International*, *26*(3), 234–255. https://doi.org/10.1057/s41289-021-00154-w

Department of Statistics, S. (2021). *Census of population 2020: Statistical release 1, Demographic characteristics, education, language and religion*. Dept. of Statistics, Ministry of Trade and Industry. https://www.singstat.gov.sg/-/media/files/publications/cop2020/sr1/cop2020sr1.pdf

Dion, K. L. (2001). Immigrants' Perceptions of Housing Discrimination in Toronto: The Housing New Canadians Project. *Journal of Social Issues*, *57*(3), 523–539. https://doi.org/10.1111/0022-4537.00227

Explained with Dom. (2022, October 9). *The Dark Side of Singapore's Economic Miracle*. YouTube. https://youtu.be/XDYy8z7krAI

Fainstein, S. S. (2005). Cities and Diversity. *Urban Affairs Review*, *41*(1), 3–19. https://doi.org/10.1177/1078087405278968

Federal Family. (2009). This Much We Know Key Components from a Paper on Place-based Approaches and Federal Roles and Interests in Communities. *Plan Canada*, 19–22.

Feinberg, A., Ghorbani, A., & Herder, P. (2021). Diversity and challenges of the urban commons: A comprehensive review. *International Journal of the Commons*, *15*(1), 1–20. https://doi.org/10.5334/IJC.1033

Fincher, R., Iveson, K., Leitner, H., & Preston, V. (2014). Planning in the multicultural city: Celebrating diversity or reinforcing difference? *Progress in Planning*, *92*, 1–55. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.progress.2013.04.001

Follows, S. (2013). *How many film festivals are there in the world?* Stephen Follows: Film Data and Education. https://stephenfollows.com/many-film-festivals-are-in-the-world/

Fong, E., & Berry, B. (2017). *Immigration and the City*. Polity Press. https://www.scribd.com/read/342322206/Immigration-and-the-City

Garcea, J. (2009). Planning for Diversity in Saskatoon: Progressive Policies and Practices. *Plan Canada*, 38–42.

García, C. A., & Duncan, P. (2022, November 2). One in six people living in England and Wales born outside UK, census reveals. *The Guardian*. https://www.theguardian.com/uk-

news/2022/nov/02/one-in-six-people-living-england-wales-were-born-different-country-census-reveals

Gehl, J. (2013). *Cities for People* (L. R. Rogers, Ed.). Island Press.

George, A. (2023, April 23). Planning For Multiculturalism: The Case For Equity And Justice In Communities. *Canada Architecture News*. https://worldarchitecture.org/architecture-news/fzzfh/planning-for-multiculturalism-the-case-for-equity-and-justice-in-communities.html

Global-Is-Asian. (2019, August 22). Multiracial Singapore: Cultivating a Harmonious Society. *Global Is Asian*. https://lkyspp.nus.edu.sg/gia/article/multiracial-singapore-ensuring-inclusivity-and-integration

Goh, D. P. S. (2017). *Diversity and Nation-Building in Singapore*. https://www.pluralism.ca/wp-content/uploads/2017/10/Singapore_DGoh_Complete_Case_EN.pdf

GOOD, K. R. (2009). *The Politics of Immigration in Toronto and Vancouver*. University of Toronto Press. https://doi.org/10.3138/9781442690417

Goodhart, D. (2004, February 24). Discomfort of strangers. *The Guardian*. https://www.theguardian.com/politics/2004/feb/24/race.eu

Gordon, I., Travers, T., & Whitehead, C. (2007). *The Impact of Recent Immigration on the London Economy*. http://www.cityoflondon.gov.uk/economicresearch

Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms, Pub. L. No. 27, Government of Canada (1982). https://laws-lois.justice.gc.ca/eng/Const/page-12.html

Canadian Multiculturalism Act, Pub. L. No. 3, Government of Canada (1985).

Government of Singapore. (2020, April 13). HDB's Ethnic Integration Policy: Why it still matters. *Government of Singapore*. https://www.gov.sg/article/hdbs-ethnic-integration-policy-why-it-still-matters

gov.uk. (n.d.). *Equality and Human Rights Commission*. Gov.Uk. Retrieved August 29, 2023, from https://www.gov.uk/government/organisations/equality-and-human-rights-commission

Greater London Authority. (2022). *London's Population*. London Datastore. https://data.london.gov.uk/dataset/londons-population

Greater London Authority. (2023a). *English (ESOL) classes in London*. Greater London Authority . https://www.london.gov.uk/programmes-strategies/communities-and-social-justice/migrants-and-refugees/english-esol-classes-london

Greater London Authority. (2023b). *The Commission for Diversity in the Public Realm*. Greater London Authority 2023. https://www.london.gov.uk/programmes-strategies/arts-and-culture/commission-diversity-public-realm

Greater London Authority. (2023c, August 9). Mayor announces Black on the Square – a major new festival showcasing Black culture and creativity. *Greater London Authority*.

https://www.london.gov.uk/mayor-announces-black-square-major-new-festival-showcasing-black-culture-and-creativity

Green, A. (2007). "We must act now to cut immigrant numbers." In *The Daily Telegraph* . Migration Watch UK. https://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/uknews/1567066/We-must-act-now-to-cut-immigrant-numbers.html

Harwood, S. A. (2005). Struggling to embrace difference in land-use decision making in multicultural communities. *Planning Practice and Research*, *20*(4), 355–371. https://doi.org/10.1080/02697450600766746

Harwood, S. A. (2022). Welcoming Immigrants. *Journal of the American Planning Association*, *88*(3), 413–428. https://doi.org/10.1080/01944363.2021.1999843

Hickman, M., Crowley, H., & Mai, N. (2008). *Immigration and social cohesion in the UK*. https://www.jrf.org.uk/sites/default/files/jrf/migrated/files/2230-deprivation-cohesion-immigration.pdf

Home Office. (2004). *Strength in Diversity: Towards a Community Cohesion and Race Equality Strategy*. https://assets-global.website-files.com/61488f992b58e687f1108c7c/62010299c2a3087700f3c23e_RunnymedeResponseStrengthInDiversity.pdf

Hou, F., & Garnett, P. (2004). Visible Minority Neighbourhoods in Toronto, Montreal and Vancouver. *Canadian Social Trends8*, *72*, 8–13. https://www.researchgate.net/publication/239569423

Housing & Development Board. (2019, October 26). *The Void Deck*. YouTube. https://youtu.be/3NMsbAJYIQw

Hudson, C. (2017). Singapore Immigration and Changing Public Policies. *Education About Asia*, *22*(3). https://www.asianstudies.org/publications/eaa/archives/singapore-immigration-and-changing-public-policies/

Human Library Organization. (2022). *Human Libary*. Human Library Organization. Human Library Organization

Immigration New Zealand. (2023). *Welcoming Communities*. New Zealand Immigration. https://www.immigration.govt.nz/about-us/what-we-do/welcoming-communities

Isar, Y. R. (2006). Towards Creative Urban Diversity: From the "Multicultural" to the "Intercultural." In *Culture: urban future; global report on culture for sustainable urban development* (pp. 141–147). United Nations Development Fund for Women (UNIFEM). https://unesdoc.unesco.org/ark:/48223/pf0000260635

Isar, Y. R. (2016). Towards Creative Urban Diversity: From the "Multicultural" to the "Intercultural." In *Culture: urban future; global report on culture for sustainable urban development* (pp. 141–147). United Nations Development Fund for Women (UNIFEM).

Isin, E. F., & Siemiatycki, M. (2002). Making space for Mosques: struggles for urban citizenship in diasporic Toronto. In S. Razack (Ed.), *Race, space, and the law : unmapping a white settler society* (pp. 185–209).

Jacobs, J. (1961). *The Death and Life of Great American Cities*. Random House.

Jedwab, J. (2020). Multiculturalism. In *The Canadian Encyclopedia*. Historica Canada.
    https://www.thecanadianencyclopedia.ca/en/article/multiculturalism

Khoo, L.-M. (2017). Living with Diversity the Singapore Way Inclusion through Intervention. *Urban
    Solutions*, *10*, 38–45. https://www.clc.gov.sg/docs/default-source/urban-solutions/urb-sol-iss-10-
    pdfs/essay-inclusion_through_intervention.pdf

KNYCX. (2020). *Discovering Singapore's Ethnic Enclaves*. KNYCX Journeying.
    https://knycxjourneying.com/singapore-ethnic-enclaves/

Koefoed, L., Simonsen, K., & Førde, A. (2021). Everyday Hospitality and Politics. *Nordic Journal of
    Migration Research*, *11*(4), 444–458. https://doi.org/10.33134/njmr.387

Komakech, M. D. C., & Jackson, S. F. (2016). A Study of the Role of Small Ethnic Retail Grocery Stores in
    Urban Renewal in a Social Housing Project, Toronto, Canada. *Journal of Urban Health*, *93*(3), 414–
    424. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11524-016-0041-1

Kong, L. (2007). *Singapore's Hawker Centres: People, Places, Food*. National Environment Agency.
    https://books.google.ca/books/about/Singapore_Hawker_Centres.html?id=eeMVAQAAMAAJ&redi
    r_esc=y

Kurtz, N. M. (2014). *Multicultural Planning in Mid-Sized Cities* [University of Waterloo].
    https://uwspace.uwaterloo.ca/handle/10012/9068

Ledsom, A. (2022). The Human Library—Borrow A Person Instead Of A Book. *Forbes*.
    https://www.forbes.com/sites/alexledsom/2022/05/09/the-human-library-borrow-a-person-
    instead-of-a-book/?sh=6b7ff14a2217

Leonie Sandercock. (2009). From Nation to Neighbourhood: Integrating Immigrants through Community
    Development. *Plan Canada*, 6–9.

Little, N., Nemutlu, G., Magic, J., & Molnár, B. (2011). *Don't judge a book by its cover! The Living Library
    Organiser's Guide 2011*. https://rm.coe.int/16807023dd

Lo, L., & Wang, S. (1997). Settlement patterns of Toronto's Chinese immigrants: convergence or
    divergence? *Canadian Journal of Regional Science*, *20*, 49–72.
    https://link.gale.com/apps/doc/A30101196/AONE?u=anon~daa0b02f&sid=googleScholar&xid=3f7
    817da

Local Government Association. (2004). *Community cohesion - an action guide: guidance for local
    authorities*. LGA Publications.
    https://www.london.gov.uk/sites/default/files/communitycohesionactionguide.pdf

Manley, D. (2021). Segregation in London: A City of Choices or Structures? In M. van Ham, T. Tammaru,
    R. Ubarevičienė, & H. Janssen (Eds.), *Urban Socio-Economic Segregation and Income Inequality: A
    Global Perspective* (pp. 311–328). Springer International Publishing. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-
    3-030-64569-4_16

Middleton, J. (2023, August 14). Data on insecure work in UK shows 'structural racism in action', TUC says. *The Guardian*. https://www.theguardian.com/society/2023/aug/14/tuc-says-uk-insecure-work-structural-racism-in-action-black-minority-ethnic-workers

Ministry of National Development. (2019, August 22). *Improving Our Quality of Life*. Ministry of National Development . https://www.mnd.gov.sg/our-city-our-home/improving-our-quality-of-life

Moore, E., & Skaburskis, A. (2004). Canada's increasing housing affordability burdens. *Housing Studies*, *19*(3), 395–413. https://doi.org/10.1080/0267303042000204296

Moore, R. Q. (2000). Multiracialism and Meritocracy: Singapore's Approach to Race and Inequality. *Review of Social Economy*, *58*(3), 339–360. http://www.jstor.org/stable/29770069

Mørkøre-Yde, K. (n.d.). Copenhagen Host Program. In *Foreningen Nydansker*. Foreningen Nydansker. https://www.foreningen-nydansker.dk/site/sites/default/files/downloads/Copenhagen%20Host%20Program_Get%20a%20community%20volunteer%20host.pdf

Murdie, R. A., & Teixeira, C. (2003). Towards a Comfortable Neighbourhood and Appropriate Housing: Immigrant Experiences in Toronto. In P. Anisef & C. M. Lanphier (Eds.), *The World in a City* (pp. 132–191). University of Toronto Press. https://www.researchgate.net/publication/265285242_Towards_a_Comfortable_Neighbourhood_and_Appropriate_Housing_Immigrant_Experiences_in_Toronto

National Heritage Board. (2013). *Community Heritage Series III: Void Decks*. National Heritage Board. https://www.nhb.gov.sg/~/media/nhb/files/resources/publications/ebooks/nhb_ebook_void_decks.pdf

NCEE. (2021). *Top-Performing Countries: Singapore*. National Center on Education and the Economy. https://ncee.org/country/singapore/#:~:text=As%20they%20enter%20secondary%20school,Technical)%20offers%20more%20applied%20work.

Ng, R. (2021, January 29). Singapore's iconic, but endangered, street food now has UNESCO status. *National Geographic*. https://www.nationalgeographic.com/travel/article/why-unesco-is-honoring-singapore-street-food

Nyseth, T. (2021). Diversity Policies as Tools to Increase Participation and Encounters. *Nordic Journal of Migration Research*, *11*(4), 430–443. https://doi.org/10.33134/njmr.379

Ó Hadhmaill, F., & Dorrity, C. (2012). "Diversity and expansion: charting the needs of a community in change." *Working for Change: The Irish Journal of Community Work*, 108–123. https://www.researchgate.net/publication/258031401_'Diversity_and_expansion_charting_the_needs_of_a_community_in_change'

Office for National Statistics. (2022). Regional ethnic diversity. In *Office for National Statistics*. Office for National Statistics. https://www.ethnicity-facts-figures.service.gov.uk/uk-population-by-ethnicity/national-and-regional-populations/regional-ethnic-diversity/latest#download-the-data

Office for National Statistics (ONS). (2022, November 2). International migration, England and Wales: Census 2021. *ONS Website, Statistical Bulletin*.

https://www.ons.gov.uk/peoplepopulationandcommunity/populationandmigration/international
migration/bulletins/internationalmigrationenglandandwales/census2021

Omidvar, R. (2017). Prospering Together. *Urban Solutions*, *10*, 30–37. https://www.clc.gov.sg/research-
publications/publications/urban-solutions/view/issue-10

Uttering words, etc., with deliberate intent to wound the racial feelings of any person, Pub. L. No. 298,
Singapore Statues Online (1871).

Peng, N. (2019). Macro Trends versus Lived Realities. *Journal of Southeast Asian Economies*, *36*(3), 355–
379. https://www.jstor.org/stable/26842380

Pisco, M. P. R. (2018). *Transnational Urban Planning in the Multicultural City: An Analysis of Diversity
Beyond Ethnoculturalism* [York University]. https://core.ac.uk/download/pdf/189494625.pdf

Poitras, L. (2009). Including Ethnocultural Communities in Neighbourhood Life. *Plan Canada*, 92–95.

Pooch, M. U. (2016). *Toronto, New York, and Los Angeles in a Globalizing Age*. Transcript Verlag.
https://www.scribd.com/read/327319906/DiverCity-Global-Cities-as-a-Literary-Phenomenon-
Toronto-New-York-and-Los-Angeles-in-a-Globalizing-Age

Qadeer, M. A. (2009). What is This Thing Called Multicultural Planning? *Plan Canada*, 10–13.

Qadeer, M. A. (2016). *Multicultural Cities: Toronto, New York, and Los Angeles*. University of Toronto
Press. https://books.google.ca/books?id=ikkpDAAAQBAJ

Qadeer, M. A., & Agrawal, S. K. (2011). The Practice of Multicultural Planning in American and Canadian
Cities. *Canadian Journal of Urban Research*, *20*(1), 132–156.
http://www.jstor.org/stable/26193858

Qadeer, M., Agrawal, S. K., & Lovell, A. (2010). Evolution of Ethnic Enclaves in the Toronto Metropolitan
Area, 2001–2006. *Journal of International Migration and Integration / Revue de l'integration et de
La Migration Internationale*, *11*(3), 315–339. https://doi.org/10.1007/s12134-010-0142-8

RICE Media. (2023, April 12). *The Legacy of Void Deck Tarawih Prayers | Singapore, Unfiltered*. YouTube.
https://youtu.be/2MVwXjNunR8?si=wp01NOQanmLrOSol

Rutten, K. (2020, December 14). *When will Britain plan for racial justice?* LSE.

Sandercock, L. (2000). When Strangers Become Neighbours: Managing Cities of Difference. *Planning
Theory & Practice*, *1*(1), 13–30. https://doi.org/10.1080/14649350050135176

Santa Fe International Film Festival. (2023). *Top 50 Best Film Festivals*. Santa Fe International Film
Festival. https://santafe.film/2022-iff-01

SG101. (2023a). *Strengthening Racial Harmony - NE Package 2023*.
https://www.sg101.gov.sg/files/packages/2023/ne%20engagement%20package%202023%20-%20
strengthening%20racial%20harmony%20in%20sg.pdf

SG101. (2023b). *Hawker Culture in Singapore*. SG101. https://www.sg101.gov.sg/social-national-
identity/case-studies/hawkercultureinsg/

SG101. (2023c). *HDB Ethnic Integration Policy (1989)*. SG101. https://www.sg101.gov.sg//social-
        national-identity/examples/hdb

SG101. (2023d, August 18). *Social National identity*. SG101. https://www.sg101.gov.sg/social-national-
        identity/ourfundamentals/

Sim, D. (2019). *Soft city; building density for everyday life* (Issue 2). Island Press.

Sim, L. L., Yu, S. M., & Han, S. S. (2003). Public housing and ethnic integration in Singapore. *Habitat
        International*, *27*(2), 293–307. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0197-3975(02)00050-4

Singapore Department of Statistics. (2022). *Population Trends 2022*.
        https://www.singstat.gov.sg/publications/population/population-trends

Smyth, J. (2020, February 6). *Multicultural Celebrations of London*. Park Grand London Hyde Park.
        https://www.parkgrandhydepark.co.uk/blog/multicultural-celebrations-london/

Song, L. K. (2015). Race, transformative planning, and the just city. *Planning Theory*, *14*(2), 152–173.
        https://doi.org/10.1177/1473095213517883

Statistics Canada. (2017). Focus on Geography Series, 2016 Census. In *Statistics Canada Catalogue no.
        98-404-X2016001*. Data products, 2016 Census. https://www12.statcan.gc.ca/census-
        recensement/2016/as-sa/fogs-spg/Index-eng.cfm

Sturge, G. (2023). *Migration statistics*.
        https://researchbriefings.files.parliament.uk/documents/SN06077/SN06077.pdf

Tam, A. (2017). Origins, Identity, Authenticity, and Distinction. *Gastronomica*, *17*(1), 44–55.
        https://www.jstor.org/stable/26362418

Tan, K. P. (2008). Meritocracy and Elitism in a Global City: Ideological Shifts in Singapore. *International
        Political Science Review / Revue Internationale de Science Politique*, *29*(1), 7–27.
        http://www.jstor.org/stable/20445123

Tang, L. (2023, June 12). One-third of ethnic integration housing policy appeals succeeded in 2022, up
        from 21% in 2020. *Channel News Asia (CNA)*. https://www.channelnewsasia.com/singapore/hdb-
        ethnic-integration-housing-policy-successful-increase-2022-shanmugam-ips-3555721

The City of Toronto. (2017). *2016 Census: Housing, Immigration and Ethnocultural Diversity, Aboriginal
        peoples*. https://www.toronto.ca/wp-content/uploads/2017/12/8ca4-5.-2016-Census-
        Backgrounder-Immigration-Ethnicity-Housing-Aboriginal.pdf

Traulevicz, N. (2013). *Eating Her Curries and Kway: A Cultural History of Food in Singapore*. University of
        Illinois Press. http://www.jstor.org/stable/10.5406/j.ctt3fh59p

United Nations. (2019). *World Urbanization Prospects 2018: Highlights*.

Vertovec, S. (2016). The growth of super-diverse cities. In Y. R. Isar, S. Vertovec, G. Battaini-Dragoni, A. P.
        Arce, & I. Ang (Eds.), *Culture: urban future; global report on culture for sustainable urban
        development* (p. 141). UNESCO. https://unesdoc.unesco.org/ark:/48223/pf0000260635

Vertovec, S. (2019). Super-diversity and its implications. In *Celebrating 40 Years of Ethnic and Racial Studies* (pp. 375–405). Routledge. https://doi.org/10.4324/9781351171489-27

Vice Asia. (2021a, June 23). *Why Is It So Difficult to Talk About Race in Singapore? | Censored*. YouTube. https://youtu.be/hrrW8wcMMso?si=RV6CgC4DIVLsn-C2

Vice Asia. (2021b, October 9). *Why Rental Discrimination is Still Common in Singapore*. YouTube. https://youtu.be/muLdoCDdxBw?si=J7uHzoE34hFRgArT

Visser, K. (2020). "Because we're all different" – Everyday experiences of belonging among young people from immigrant backgrounds in Tottenham. *Geoforum*, *116*, 322–330. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.geoforum.2017.02.002

Walks, R., & Bourne, L. (2006). Ghettos in Canada's cities? Racial segregation, ethnic enclaves and poverty concentration in Canadian urban areas. *The Canadian Geographer / Le Géographe Canadien*, *50*, 273–297. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1541-0064.2006.00142.x

Welcoming International. (2020). *Stories of Welcome*. https://welcominginternational.org/stories-of-welcome/

White, L., Swanson, K., Olak, P., & Patterson, A. (2009). Building Diversity in the City of Surrey: The Future Lives Here. *Plan Canada*, 28–31.

Wong, L. (2021, June 25). S'pore's multiracial model does not require any community to give up its heritage, traditions. *The Straits Times*. https://www.straitstimes.com/singapore/spores-multi-racial-model-does-not-require-any-community-to-give-up-its-heritage

Wood, P., & Landry, C. (2008). *The Intercultural City: Planning for Diversity Advantage*. Earthscan. https://www.academia.edu/701059/The_intercultural_city_Planning_for_diversity_advantage

Wood, P., Landry, C., & Bloomfield, J. (2006). *Cultural diversity in Britain A toolkit for cross-cultural co-operation*. https://www.jrf.org.uk/sites/default/files/jrf/migrated/files/1922-cultural-diversity-britain.pdf

Yeoh, B. S. A. (2005). The Global Cultural City? Spatial Imagineering and Politics in the (Multi)cultural Marketplaces of South-east Asia. *Urban Studies*, *42*(5–6), 945–958. https://doi.org/10.1080/00420980500107201

Ying, L. P., & Han, J. (2004, December 31). Racial Harmony Day. *Singapore Infopedia*. https://eresources.nlb.gov.sg/infopedia/articles/SIP_965_2004-12-31.html

Zapata-Barrero, R. (2015a). *Interculturalism in Cities: Concept, Policy and Implementation*. https://doi.org/10.4337/9781784715328

Zapata-Barrero, R. (2015b). *Interculturalism: Main hypothesis, theories and strands* (pp. 3–19). https://doi.org/10.4337/9781784715328.00007

Zapata-Barrero, R. (2015). *Interculturalism in Cities*. https://api.semanticscholar.org/CorpusID:156957369

Zhuang, Z. C. (2013). Rethinking multicultural planning: An empirical study of ethnic retailing. *Canadian Journal of Urban Research*, *22*(2). https://www.jstor.org/stable/26193951

Zhuang, Z. C., & Chen, A. X. (2017). The role of ethnic retailing in retrofitting suburbia: case studies from Toronto, Canada. *Journal of Urbanism: International Research on Placemaking and Urban Sustainability*, *10*(3), 275–295. https://doi.org/10.1080/17549175.2016.1254671

Zucchi, J. (2010). Ethnicity and Neighbourhoods: Looking Backward, Facing Forward. *Urban History Review*, *39*(1), 73–79. https://doi.org/10.7202/045109ar

설록현준 (Sherlock Hyun Joon). (2023, July 2). *공공건축은 잘 만들 수 없을까? 한국에서 꼭 봐야하는 건축 TOP 3 (Could public architecture be not made well? TOP3 must-see architecture in Korea)*. YouTube. https://youtu.be/47QKRaNqj3M

DECLARATION OF AUTHORSHIP

Master Thesis

First Name: ……………………………………………. Surname: …………………………………………………….

Matriculation Number.:…………………………

Place of Birth……………….............................. Date of Birth:.............................……………..

I hereby declare that the Master Thesis, which I am handing in today, is my own work, produced independently, using no other sources and means of support than those specified.

Frankfurt am Main, ……………………… ………………………………………………………….
                  (Date)   (Signature)